Student Experience of Vocational Becoming in Upper Secondary Vocational Education and Training

Student Experience of Vocational Becoming in Upper Secondary Vocational Education and Training

Navigating by Feedback

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

UNIVERSITY OF GOTHENBURG

Acknowledgements

My interest in student experience of vocational becoming through assessment and feedback has grown through years of practical experience of teaching, as well as coordinating and securing work placements in a Child and Recreation Programme. During these years I have seen students transform. An issue that I initially set out to investigate was the assessment of vocational knowing that students were subjected to during their work placements. Gradually my interest widened to cover students' perceptions of what vocational knowing was generally assessed and how this assessment was carried out. So, this thesis is about a transformation. My curiosity about this transformation, seen from the students' perspective propelled me to examine how young people, with the help of feedback, become ready to work in occupations they train for in school.

I admit that this thesis has also grown out of my misinterpretation of feedback. As a teacher I was not aware how the feedback that I contributed to both enabled and constrained my students to become the persons they perhaps aspired to be, for instance nursery nurses or swimming instructors. My role, as I saw it then, was solely to deliver feedback, and theirs was to process and act upon it. Now I realise that such responsibility, which I had taken for granted, was at the same time too small and too great.

First, I thank all the students, teachers and instructors who participated in the studies for their trust and generosity, letting me into their everyday work and letting me do mine. I also wish to thank my four supervisors who at various stages of the project in their unique ways fruitfully challenged my ways of thinking and writing. Thank you, Gun-Britt Wärvik, my chief supervisor, Ingrid Henning Loeb, Viveca Lindberg and Per-Olof Thång! Thank you, Stephen Billett and Sarojni Choy at Griffith University for kindly introducing me to the international research community! My thanks also go to Helena Korp, who accepted the invitation to be an opponent at my licentiate seminar, encouraging my further studies. Ann-Sofie Holm and Marianne Teräs, thank you both for valuable comments to improve this thesis. Thanks, my fellow doctoral students, Helena, Katarina, Ellinor, Ann-Louise, Brittmarie and Ingela, my roommate! Finally, my family in Sweden and those far away in Poland and the USA also supported me throughout the whole process. Special thanks go to Leif at home

for patiently growing to understand and accept the kind of business I let myself get inducted into. This thesis is dedicated to my parents, Zofia and Marek, for their unwavering and wholehearted support.

Vänersnäs, September 2018
Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Abstract

This doctoral thesis explores student experience of vocational becoming, particularly the navigational role of feedback in the process for Swedish upper secondary vocational students. Vocational becoming is explored as conflating the development of vocational knowing and formation of a vocational identity. The interest is in the experienced curriculum as emergent and thus unpredictable, fragile and dependent on feedback in interaction. This unpredictability is juxtaposed with tensions involved in standardised outcome-based assessment of vocational knowing and assessment for learning. The thesis focuses primarily on students attending the Swedish Child and Recreation Programme, which is chiefly school-based and intended to prepare young students (16 to 20 years old) for a range of interaction-intensive and people-centred occupations, e.g., nursery nurse, gym instructor and security officer. It is based on empirical material consisting of transcripts of focus group interviews and participant observations of classroom instruction. Four appended articles illuminate students' collective vocational becoming in this context, two of them specifically addressing students' experience of becoming prospective security officers.

The analysis reveals difficulties for students to interpret the progression of their vocational becoming in the framework of standardised outcome-based assessment and indicates that their experience of vocational becoming for

service work centres on attunement to others, referred to as pedagogising encountering (i.e., readiness to learn from encounters and subsequently adjusting to service recipients). Students halfway through their education showed reluctance to participate in feedback, which is presumed to reflect their incomplete progression towards becoming a service provider who pedagogises encountering.

Students' experienced curriculum of becoming security officers is investigated in terms of their meaning-making of central concepts (e.g., surveillance law), called here vocationalising concepts. Vocational becoming, based on students managing discontinuities, is investigated as generalising knowing horizontally between vocational courses in both school- and workplace-based parts of education. It is suggested that young students develop a vocational stance, orienting themselves towards occupation-specific values, e.g., child care and customer care.

Teacher-led and structured feedback that orchestrates self-assessment and peer feedback with regard to students' readiness appears beneficial for vocationalising concepts whereas loosely structured group work mostly offers opportunities for staging pedagogised encounters in peer groups. In addition to contributing to a nuanced understanding of the role of feedback-making in vocational becoming for service work, this thesis contributes to theorisation of vocational becoming in institutionalised settings.

Contents

Acknowledgements

PART TWO

Part One

1 Introduction

This thesis explores how young people make themselves ready for the world of work, particularly 16- to 20-year-old students attending the Child & Recreation Programme in Swedish upper secondary school, where they encounter institutionalised ways to learn an occupation. However, learning an occupation is a multifaceted process, as it involves the development of vocational knowing along with formation of a vocational identity. These two parallel developmental processes are captured in the thesis by the concept of vocational becoming. This central concept is thoroughly discussed later, but for now it suffices to say that an important factor that may stimulate or hinder young people's vocational becoming is feedback in interaction with others (Wiliam & Thompson, 2008). This feedback can serve as a pointer for young people to orient their actions in directions aligned with requirements for being ready for an occupation and a job.

After they are 16 years old, substantial numbers of young students in Sweden and many other countries, set out on prospective vocational careers by attending vocational programmes. In many ways, participation in vocational programmes may appear to students as a continuation of the familiar cultural-historical activity and social practices of "going to school". In peer groups they study general school subjects, as well as vocational subjects with varying degrees of specialisation, and attend work-placements. Thus, they develop vocational knowing in interaction with teachers and peers in classrooms and workshops, as well as with others, e.g., staff in workplaces. However, this infusion of vocational content through (for example) work-placements presents students with learning opportunities that are in most cases novel to them. Thus, upper secondary school vocational education and training (USVET) is a distinct experiential arena for learning an occupation due to this mixture of familiarity and novelty (Berner, 2010; Dewey, 1916/1999).

A major element of the novelty of these learning opportunities lies in students' access to specialised, that is, vocational, knowing. This access is monitored by teachers and workplace instructors who assess students' progress and provide feedback to them (Taras, 2013). However, vocational knowing may generally appear to students as perplexing and impossible to grasp in ways they

have become accustomed to during their general experience of school-going. Research shows that vocational knowing that students get access to in vocational education and training is rich in meanings as it is situated and codified (Guile & Young, 2003, p. 69), and action-oriented (Heusdens, Baartman & de Bruijn, 2018). Further, it is developed in alignment with personal goals and learning trajectories rather than through a given personal fit (Brockmann, 2012; Klotz, Billett & Winther, 2014; Tanggaard, 2007). Moreover, vocational knowing is embedded in the use of occupation-specific tools (Miller, 2011) and social practices with cultural-historical roots that differ from and extend far beyond school practices. Therefore, occupation-specific knowing and being may appear to young students as opaque and challenging to access.

Due to their young age and inexperience, students may reasonably make only exploratory and tentative in-roads into an occupation. Nevertheless, their meeting with the world of work marks an important transition into adulthood (Brockmann, 2010). At this point of their lives they have only just started to map their futures onto viable occupational paths they still know very little about. However, students' limited experience of working life turns the learning of an occupation into an open-ended and precarious project of self-discovery involving realisation that their personal goals must be aligned with perceived occupation-specific expectations and demands. Therefore, when entering upper secondary vocational education, students are in a position to try out an occupation in order to see whether they want or are prepared to accept it (with eagerness or resignation) or reject it. In this respect, initiating vocational becoming can be a risky project of personal investment in the unknown. The process described above resembles what Billett (2015a) calls *readying oneself* for a prospective but in no way guaranteed or known-in-advance vocational future.

Education confronts young people with certain requirements, for example for occupational[1] qualifications. In this way vocational knowing can be defined in different terms by various stakeholders (Bathmaker, 2013), e.g., school defines the development of vocational knowing in terms of learning outcomes. Consequently, students may encounter different and even possibly conflicting messages regarding legitimate, required vocational knowing. Nonetheless, greater integration with working life through collaboration with workplaces is

---

[1] In this thesis, the terms *occupation* and *occupational* refer to factual matters of a job, whereas vocations denote occupations as careers or callings which are personally meaning-laden (Grubb & Lazerson, 2009, p. 1792).

advocated in educational governance documents (European Commission, 2015; Virolainen & Persson Thunqvist, 2017). Strengthening ties between schools and receivers of their students[2] (Lundahl, Arreman, Lundström & Rönnberg, 2010) may shape the students' learning in the direction of immediate usefulness for relevant trades. Such expectations affect assessments of young students' vocational knowing, for instance in workplaces and school (Lindberg, 2003). Students need to make sense of and navigate between different sets of requirements and expectations as these affect the formal acknowledgement of students' occupational qualifications, that is, vocational diplomas bestowed on their graduation from upper secondary school.

The process of learning an occupation proceeds in and through relations with others in school and in workplaces. As explained later, these relations are occupation-specific and embedded in ways of "doings" that are often taken for granted, e.g., in workplaces. However, these ways of doings need to be explicitly brought to students' attention through feedback. Thus, students' process of readying themselves for a possible vocational future implies exposure to cultural impact of others through feedback from workplace trainers and vocational teachers. Feedback directs students' vocational becoming as pointers to what students need to know, do and value in relation to occupational standards. Occupational ways of doings (often sedimented in work routines, norms and traditions) are novel to students but they offer relatively stable sets of cultural expectations associated with occupations[3]. These expectations are made discernible to young students through curriculums, which make explicit and organise occupational ways of knowing and doings.

Young students' learning of an occupation in institutionalised educational settings is here seen as framed by two dimensions of a curriculum, that is, what is intended and what is enacted. Such a curriculum may structure students' experience of readying themselves for work. However, the intended and enacted dimensions only form a backdrop or "launching pad" for students' experienced curriculum (Barone, 1980). With this in mind, an emergent view of the experienced curriculum (Phillips, 1995) is adopted in this thesis. Next, I highlight some weaknesses regarding a more linear view of curriculum that

---

[2] E.g., presumptive employers are receivers for vocational upper secondary programmes.
[3] Ziehe (1986) argues that adolescence can be viewed as culturally *released* identity construction. Identity "seeking" is embedded in the youth's self-discovery "what I would like to be for and what I can be for" (Ziehe, 1999, p. 10) with few ready-made patterns available. When traditional structures fail to support youths' quest for autonomy, vocational education may offer relatively stable scripts to orient themselves towards.

frames student experience of learning an occupation and treats students' learning experience as a result of implementation of intentions that are set out to be subsequently enacted. I argue for a need to study young students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming as basically ridden with uncertainties rather than as a straightforward result of an implementation.

1.1 The Intended and Enacted Curriculum

The intended and enacted curriculum differentiates and specifies the knowing to be assessed in a given context along with general principles and practices for assessment. These principles and practices reflect dominating policy discourses and result in students' achievements or outcomes being measured against performance-based standards (Allais, 2014). The critical aspect here is that assessment principally singles out knowledge that is deemed worth knowing so its assessment has a signal value in society (Lundahl, 2006). Also, standard-based performance assessment is built on pre-defined learning outcomes, i.e., defining and standardising levels of student achievement (Sundberg, 2018). Educational governance through monitoring learning outcomes implies a shift in focus from input and learning processes to performance output (Erikson, 2017; Forsberg, Nihlfors, Pettersson, & Skott, 2017), triggering emergence of a formalised assessment regime characterised by "activities that monitor, value and judge outcomes" (Forsberg et al., 2017, p. 367, see Hattie, 2012; Lundahl, 2011). These assessment practices involve teaching to meet the assessment criteria related to syllabi, possibly encouraging a mechanistic approach to assessment in vocational education. However, such assessment practices may be carried out, paradoxically, in the name of assessment for learning[4] (Torrance, 2007). In sum, student experience of learning an occupation may reflect its direct usefulness for working life but also accommodation to broad school learning outcome-based discourses and, specifically, normative discourses of assessment for learning (Ecclestone, 2007).

By attending a vocational programme, students expose themselves to possibilities of being impacted by education, e.g., through feedback, in ways that cannot be entirely pre-planned or standardised according to learning outcome-based assessment regimes (Biesta, 2005; Hjorth Liedman & Liedman, 2008). Several reasons for this have been identified. Firstly, through workplace-based learning as an integral and constitutive part of their education, students

---

[4] In this thesis, the terms assessment for learning and formative assessment are used interchangeably.

are introduced to highly situative learning sites with varying "invitational qualities" for learning (Billett, 2004, p. 121). Accordingly, how students elect to engage with learning opportunities offered by particular workplaces cannot be easily foreseen and monitored (Fuller & Unwin, 2004). Secondly, assessment in vocational education based on performance-based standards with pre-defined learning outcomes relies on these outcomes being spelt out. However, the drive towards such a transparency for greater assessment standardisation creates a dilemma. Accordingly, implementation of transparent, standardised assessment deprives students of opportunities to establish their own standards for what counts as good work and measure their own achievements accordingly in the typically 'messy' contexts of workplace-based learning (Boud & Hawke, 2017). Thus, it may hinder development of the capacity to self-assess in accordance with occupational standards, which is potentially an important milestone in students' experience of learning an occupation. Thirdly, self-assessment according to viable but emergent self-constructed criteria in this manner would appear as an end-point rather than a starting point in vocational education. Therefore, dilemmas arise when the unpredictability of student experience of learning an occupation is set apart from assessment built on input-output rationalities and normative discourses of "good" assessment, i.e., assessment for learning.

These salient dilemmas are contemporaneous articulations of contention inherent in work as a foundation of educational processes (Labaree 2010; Olofsson & Panican, 2017; Snedden & Dewey, 1977/1915). This contention stems from competing views of the goal of education, which may be seen as narrow, i.e., the acquisition of work skills or, more broadly, as what Vygotskij figuratively refers to as the substance of education (Lunačarskij, 1981; Krupskaja, 1985; Vygotskij, 1997/1926, see also Dewey & Dewey, 1915).

To recap, I have attempted to problematise the difficulty in reconciling the plasticity of students' experienced curriculum with the intended and enacted curriculum. This difficulty lies in reconciliation of the open-endedness and self-discovery elements of the experienced curriculum with the fixed cultural-historical elements of work requirements (the intended and enacted curriculum) in USVET.

1.2 Service Work

The historical dependence of vocational education on work as a goal, a means and a foundation has created unresolved tensions regarding the overall aim and parity of vocational education and training (Bakhurst, 2011), which are handled in country-specific ways. Therefore, the space available for students to exercise agency through their experienced curriculum is shaped by: historically formed institutional arrangements; social, political and physical factors; and both cultural and societal sentiments pertinent to vocational education (Billett, 2017, p. 271).

The type of work of primary interest in this thesis is what Braverman (1974/1999) calls the fast-growing service sector, where employment is rising due to social services being transformed into commodity services[5]. Thus, service needs in new and expanding areas of care, recreation and security "are channeled through the market" (Braverman, 1974/1999, p. 191) as new branches and trades of social labour arise. The rise of such *new service occupations* (Heinz, 2008) is a response to emerging societal needs for personalised service but also caters for traditional needs of care and security (nursery nurse, personal assistant, personal trainer, security officer). These kinds of "modern service occupations" are set apart from more traditional notions of clearly demarcated "templates of skills and work routines" (Heinz, 2008, p. 487).

An important feature of service work is its dependence on utilising one's personal resources of "the self". Thus, the resources, e.g., vocational knowing, that service work requires cannot be located at a distance from the self, and students must align personal resources, e.g., communication and rapport-building habits and skills, with occupational specificities. There may also be a need for wariness to prevent potential susceptibility to exploitation emerging through connotations of serving others at one's expense embedded in the idea of *servio* (Latin for *I serve*), which is a foundation of service-oriented occupations.

These occupations can also be referred to as emotional labour (Grandey, Diefendorff & Rupp, 2013; Hochschild, 1983/2003) or high-touch (as opposed to high-tech) jobs (McDowell, 2009). They all require capacities for self-presentation as well as managing one's emotions and "harnessing" them, or putting them to work, in vocational knowing for the purpose of the occupation. Therefore, vocational knowing for service and interaction-intense occupations requires social or "soft" skills, which are notoriously difficult to pinpoint and

---

[5] Within the capitalist mode of production.

assess (Bolton, 2004; Grugulis & Vincent, 2009; Hurrell, Scholarios & Thompson, 2012; Leidner, 1993; Vincent, 2011).

The Swedish Child & Recreation Programme provides training for occupations in the service sector that can also be described as somewhat fuzzily defined and curricularised around a core of relational and supportively pedagogical functions (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). Accordingly, pedagogy, in its early roots in child care, and in extension fulfilling its social function of providing service, explicitly remains a common denominator for the focal occupations in this thesis, as articulated in educational policy discourse. Therefore, developing vocational knowing rests upon notions of personal growth, social skills and communication (Lemar, 2001).

1.3 Students' Experienced Curriculum of Vocational Becoming

Students' encounters with the world of people-centred service work remain a "practical" matter of experiencing. To capture and examine the idea of vocational becoming as experiential matter within the framework of upper secondary vocational education, I apply the concept of experienced curriculum, as one of the three dimensions of curriculum described by Billett (2006). These three dimensions (intended, enacted and experienced) are interrelated, but may empirically appear as relatively autonomous. Thus, the prescriptive contents of education, e.g., syllabi, do not necessarily cascade into the "rough ground" of pedagogical practices that students participate in, e.g., assessment. Pedagogical practice, i.e., what is enacted, and therefore presents students with social suggestions (Billett, 2011), forms a culturally and historically constructed reality that may differ from educational governance exercised by school, trades and industries through discursively articulated intentions.

Interplay between what ought to be and what is enacted creates a space for student quandaries about what it is experientially like to become a person of service trades. They wonder what kind and form of knowing is vocationally legitimate, how it is assessed, and what is expected of them by workplace trainers, peers and teachers. To find out they must locate learning processes within relations with more knowledgeable significant others. Therefore, for reasons explained later, in this thesis I apply Vygotskian theory to explain this process of vocational becoming in terms of cultural and historical development. Cultural and historical sediments, e.g., occupational routines students get access

to, provide the raw material for students' thinking and reasoning as collective experiencing. Thus, the change from a teenage student to a qualified nursery nurse or security officer is not only about developing vocational knowing but also about moulding novel ways to become as a young person on the verge of adulthood. Thus far I have introduced the central issue of young students' vocational becoming. Next, I further elaborate on and theorise this concept to provide a departure point for the thesis and the empirical studies it is based upon.

1.4 Vocational Becoming

In addition to acquiring occupational qualifications, students' experienced curriculum involves their unique ways of responding to education as an invitation to what might best be described as *vocational becoming*. This is defined here as the recursive and simultaneous evolution of two constituent processes: becoming someone and developing vocational knowing (Beach, 2003). These processes are interwoven, constitutive of each other (as well as vocational becoming), and expressed in students' development of work-related ways to carry themselves in the world and with others.

Vocational knowing here encompasses learning processes of students "coming to know in different situations" (Edwards, 2005, p. 59). Broadly, my understanding of vocational knowing extends beyond a body of occupation-specific knowledge that students might attain or acquire, or ready-made notions of competence (and its occupation-specific profiles) to be developed. Vocational knowing is regarded in this thesis as relational, reflecting the many ways individuals relate to the world through certain forms of knowledge, e.g., procedural or propositional knowledge. These forms of knowledge, e.g., attitudes and understandings, are integrated in broader capacities for discernment of legitimate knowledge (Carlgren, Forsberg & Lindberg, 2009). Thus, vocational knowing in this thesis refers to how students construct their experienced curriculum by realising or discerning what knowing (of procedures, methods, facts, understanding, judgements and sensitivities etc.) has currency in relation to the world of work for them as upper secondary students. Therefore, vocational knowing emerges from cultural-historical practices of the

mind[6] (Vygotskij, 1987) "at grips with the world and evidenced in accomplishment of action on the world" (Edwards, 2005, p. 59).

My use of the term vocational becoming incorporates what researchers have also referred to as vocational identity formation (Klotz et al., 2014). Empirically, both terms entail a conflation of knowing and being. However, I argue that these two terms have different theoretical underpinnings. Vocational becoming captures the dialectic of being and non-being (nothing) as a gradual process of transformation. Thus, becoming is a solution to the containment of opposites of being and non-being (Vygotskij, 1934)[7], and vocational becoming comprises activities of experiencing rather than a state or condition to be arrived at (Vasil′juk, 1991). For this reason the vocational becoming concept focuses attention on mechanisms of such transformation. In the thesis, several such mechanisms (for instance vocationalising concepts) will be shown to be driven within *the zone of proximal development* (ZPD; Vygotskij, 1934). To further contrast the two terms, vocational becoming and vocational identity formation, the latter in my view implies a socio-constructionist and sociocultural process towards a given end-point, that is, achieving a certain identity. Adoption of such a perspective focuses attention on young students' construction of vocational identity approximations during its formation (see Collin, Paloniemi, Virtanen & Eteläpelto, 2008; Virtanen, Tynjälä & Stenström, 2008). Moreover, vocational identity formation implies an interest in subjective and individual experience (see Brockmann, 2012), while vocational becoming in this thesis is explicitly conceptually grounded in collective experience.

Having considered the concept of vocational becoming, I now turn to the function of feedback-making in mediating vocational becoming. Mediation refers here to processes of transformation between being and non-being, beyond a rather instrumental usage of feedback as an enabling/constraining tool *per se*.

---

[6] Or consciousness as a dynamic process that relies on interdependency between thinking and speech (Dafermos, 2018).

[7] In Hegel's logic, contradiction is a driving principle of change in the world. In his being-nothing-becoming triad, the thesis (being) appears and generates opposition (antithesis). This opposition of being and nothing is solved through synthesis (becoming), which is a unity of being and nothing.

1.5 Mediatory Feedback-Making

Students in upper secondary school are widely accustomed to various school assessment practices but not to workplace assessment practices, including feedback. They are routinely subjected to formative comments, evaluations and grades, spotlighting their achievements or shortcomings in school. Briefly, they engage in mediatory feedback-making. In this thesis I present some claims made about feedback as a strategy in the discourse of assessment for learning, and scrutinise them in relation to my empirical findings in school and workplace settings. The position on feedback in relation to assessment in the thesis is based on two insights stressed by Taras (2013). One is that there is a clear temporal relation between assessment and feedback, as feedback originates from earlier assessment, the other is that students' meaning-making while unpacking (making) feedback is highly important. Hence, feedback generally functions as a mediatory and a symbolic *relay* for the assessment as feedback communicates to students what forms of vocational knowing are worth cultivating. Therefore, my interest is in feedback-making as primarily verbal exchange and interaction that students need to make sense of. The study's contribution to existing research is in exploration of the adoption of a students' collective perspective on experiences of participation in mediatory feedback-making.

Feedback on vocational becoming is regarded in this thesis as an experiential matter of being subjected to (acted upon) as well as students' ways to make sense of feedback (to act), letting feedback direct their actions. Therefore, in order to explain feedback as an act of experiencing I utilise the Deweyan concept of experience as comprising both passive and active elements, projecting continuously into the future (Dewey 1916/1999, 1938/1946). I also expand Deweyan understanding of experience as mainly individualistic enterprise by insights from Vygotskij. I return to Vygotskij's explanation of the social and cultural-historical dimensions of experience later. In this thesis, feedback is problematised as construed and constructed (Billett, 2011) by students collectively refracting the social situation of development as opposed to simply reflecting or negotiating suggestions of the social world (Veresov, 2016). In viewing student experience as a unit of personhood and the environment, it is this prism of a specific and subjective experience[8] that draws

---

[8] *Periezhivanie* as a concept for analysis of experience, originally introduced by Vygotskij, is addressed in Chapter 4, Subsection 4.1.

out developmental qualities of a social situation of learning, e.g., feedback-making.

Feedback-making in upper secondary vocational school is regarded by previous authors (Krogstad Svanes & Skagen, 2017), and here, as a central didactic matter. Feedback-making mediates for students the level of their achievement in relation to the subject matter as well as all the parties involved in feedback-making, i.e., peers, teachers and instructors. Thus, mediatory feedback-making may both enable and constrain the development of vocational knowing, depending on students' interpretation of feedback. Hence, students' ways to handle assessment communicated by feedback vary as it is dependent on their previous as well as unfolding experiences.

A key part of the theoretical framework here (laid out in more detail in Chapter 4) is that vocational becoming is an open-ended process of exploration and self-discovery that relies on cultural-historical guidance, i.e., feedback on progression by significant others. Feedback-making needs to be navigated as students constantly (though perhaps implicitly) wonder about their progression and staying on the right track. These questions and probably even their doubts about how well they are progressing transcend the present moment, bridging the past and a fragile vocational future. Students need the raw material of information to be fed back to make meaning of their progress. In this way feedback-making enables young students to experience a change, rehearsing what is viable and how they can reconcile their personal expressions of individuality with their interpretations of what others expect of them.

In some studies, feedback is advocated as a strategy for formative assessment (assessment for learning), especially in relation to assessment based on learning outcomes (Lundahl, 2011). However, these approaches may result in mechanical ways and technologies to deal with assessment and feedback in vocational instruction (see Ecclestone, 2007; Jönsson, Lundahl & Holmgren, 2015; Torrance, 2007). From an experienced curriculum perspective, as adopted in this thesis, it remains an empirical question whether feedback in assessment regimes "in the name" of assessment for learning may or may not support students' vocational becoming. Moreover, little is generally known of students' experience of assessment (Forsberg & Lindberg, 2010), particularly in initial, and hence novel and fragile, stages of VET and in relation to people-centred and somewhat fuzzily demarcated service occupations in chiefly school-based educational arrangements.

The main interest in this thesis (and the studies it is based upon) lies in young students' vocational becoming as a cultural change or a transformation of ways of being and knowing, from their perspective. To be able to tap into student experience of vocational becoming through feedback-making, focus group interview and observation methodologies were applied.

1.6 Aim and Scope

As already pointed out, young students' vocational becoming in institutionalised vocational education in upper secondary school is a relational project of their construction of an experienced curriculum. The focal interest in the thesis is the feedback-making through which young students exert their agency, recognising that their involvement in feedback-making cannot be determined by any predicted and mechanistic procedures (Krogstad Svanes & Skagen, 2017).

Framed in this way, the aim is to provide insight into vocational becoming as students' response to the invitation provided by upper secondary vocational education and training (hereafter USVET), which is chiefly school-based although it has both classroom-based and workplace-based elements. Therefore, students' vocational becoming is regarded here as comprising their emergent and collective actions of trying out desirable, imaginary futures in people-, or person-centred and interaction-intense service occupations (hereafter service occupations).

1.7 Research Questions

The thesis addresses two overarching research questions:

1   What articulations of student experience of vocational becoming can be identified in VET aimed at people-centred service occupations?

2   In what ways does feedback-making shape young students' vocational becoming?

The thesis consists of a summary and four appended articles (summarised in Chapter 6) addressing the following more specific questions.

Article 1: How do students experience assessment and feedback from their vocational teachers and classmates?

Article 2: How do students express their sense of progress through their participation in feedback during workplace-based learning?

Article 3: What concepts do students vocationalise, and what are the contributions of feedback to vocationalising aspects of specialised vocational knowing?

Article 4: What surveillance law is experientially emergent for upper secondary students through vocational instruction to become security officers? How does feedback mediate these students' understanding of surveillance law? How is learner readiness with respect to surveillance law expressed in the students' feedback-making during instruction to become security officers?

2 Background

2.1 Vocational Education and Training in Upper Secondary School in Sweden

A large proportion of young students in the age bracket of 16 to 20 years attend VET[9]. Approximately a third of the age cohort proceeds to USVET programmes. This chapter sets student experience of vocational becoming in the context of an upper secondary level vocational programme, the Child & Recreation Programme[10], in Sweden. The programme is first introduced with the help of policy documents by the Swedish National Agency for Education (Skolverket), then with previous research. As this programme leads to occupations in the service sector, some selective research on service work is presented followed by a brief outline of studies on the programme.

Swedish upper secondary school (post-16) education comprises 18 national programmes: 12 vocational and six intended to prepare students for higher education[11]. The 12 vocational programmes are intended to lay foundations for working life and further vocational education (Skolverket, 2011a), leading formally to a vocational diploma. In order to obtain such a diploma, students must obtain passing grades in sufficient stipulated[12] courses. A vocational diploma together with passing grades in courses called Swedish (or Swedish as a second language 2 and 3) and English 6 provide vocational students with basic eligibility for higher education. Pass (E-D-C-B-A) or fail (F) grades are awarded according to knowledge requirements for these courses. In sum, vocational education in Sweden is formally embedded in a state-regulated school-based and comprehensive education system (Lundahl et al., 2010; Persson Thunqvist & Hallqvist, 2015).

---

[9] Numbers fluctuate but during the school year 2017/2018 approximately 33 % of young people in Sweden attended a vocational programme (94 700 individuals) (Skolverket, 2018a), and 36 % in 2016/2017.

[10] In 2016/2017, of a total of 343 911 students, 8 199 were enrolled in the Child & Recreation Programme (Skolverket, 2017b). In autumn 2017 the number increased to 8 588 (Skolverket, 2018b).

[11] There are also five introductory programmes.

[12] These include Swedish or Swedish as a second language 1, English 5, Mathematics 1a, foundation courses of 400 credits and a pass in the diploma project.

Each programme lasts for three years, and includes nine upper secondary school foundation subjects[13], programme-specific subjects, programme specialisation modules, a diploma project and workplace-based learning (so-called apl), lasting at least 15 weeks[14]. During apl students are supervised by an appointed workplace trainer employed in the workplace and appointed on suitability grounds rather than formal requirements. Teachers have sole responsibility for grading students' efforts, but workplace trainers provide information on students' achievements during apl to the teachers, who use it in grading (Skolverket, 2011b). Apl should be explicitly assessed according to subject syllabi (Skolverket, 2012a, 2016). Vocational specialisation is therefore a gradual process, and one of the central goals of vocational education is "development of a vocational identity", strengthened by learning in workplaces (Skolverket, 2012b, p. 22).

2.2 The Child & Recreation Programme: Origins and Development

A Child & Recreation Programme was first introduced through an upper secondary school reform of 1992 (Skolverket, 1994). Its origins lay in vocational education aimed primarily at pedagogy of child care and, to some extent, social work and training for swimming instructors provided by municipalities (Skolverket, 1998). The introduction of the Child & Recreation Programme was intended to provide a workforce to meet the needs of an expanding child care and leisure service sector. Due to its apparent breadth, this programme was also described as preparing broadly for work sectors rather than specific occupations (Österlind, 2008). The construction of the programme attempted to unite quite disparate parts of child and youth care, culture and leisure going under what was (in hindsight) a quite confusing name (Skolverket, 1998). However, despite the confusion the name has been retained since then. Another intention guiding construction of the 1992 programme was to bridge the traditionally female content of care with traditionally male, technical content, e.g., maintenance of sports facilities. A similar idea guided the latest inclusion of security officer as

---

[13] These are English, history, physical education and health, mathematics, science studies, religion, social studies and Swedish or Swedish as a second language.

[14] School-based apprenticeship education, which is beyond the scope of this thesis, is another vocational option, in which half the time is workplace-based.

an occupational outcome of a Child & Recreation Programme (Skolverket, 2012b)[15].

The current Child & Recreation Programme (Skolverket, 2011a) prepares and trains for employments within "pedagogical and social vocational areas, or in the recreational or healthcare sectors, such as child minders[16], bathing or sports facilities personnel, care taking, or as personal assistants." (Skolverket, 2012b, p. 16) (see Table 1).

Table 1 Programme Structure

Foundation subjects: 600 credits	Programme-specific subjects: 700 credits	Orientations: 300 credits	Diploma project: 100 credits	Individual options: 200 credits	Total Credits: 2500[17]
- English - History - Physical education & health - Mathematics - Science studies - Religion - Social studies - Swedish or Swedish as a second language	- Health - Science studies - Pedagogy - Social studies - Swedish or Swedish as a second language	- Pedagogical work - Recreation & health - Social work			

Adapted from Skolverket (2012b)

The programme includes three orientations (see Table 2): Pedagogical Work, Recreation & Health, and Social Work, which further vocational specialisation. Each programme leads to so-called occupational outcomes, e.g., nursery nurse (Pedagogical Work), personal trainer (Recreation & Health) and security officer or personal assistant (Social Work). The Child & Recreation Programme

---

[15] Referred to as the vocational outcome security guard. Here I use the term *security officer*.
[16] In this thesis the term *nursery nurse* is used rather than child minder.
[17] That is teaching hours.

remains female-dominated[18], but the orientations reflect fine-grain gender differences. Pedagogical Work attracts the highest numbers of students and is dominated by female students (although numbers of male students choosing this option have slightly increased recently), while Recreation & Health attracts higher proportions of male students (Skolverket, 2018b).

Table 2 Orientations, Subjects, Courses and Vocational Outcomes

Orientations	Pedagogical Work	Recreation & Health	Social Work
Subjects	Pedagogical work	Leisure and recreational activities	Social work
Courses	Pedagogical work	Swimming and recreational facilities	Social work
Vocational outcomes	Nursery nurse, pupils assistant	Swimming/sports hall staff	Caretaker in support and service in the functional impairment area, security officer

Adapted from Skolverket (2012b)

The Child & Recreation Programme is provided in 188 schools nationwide, it has a moderately large intake of students and is growing in popularity in comparison with other vocational programmes (Skolverket, 2018b). It largely attracts students whose parents' highest educational background is upper secondary level (Skolverket, 2018b)[19]. The programme's students obtain lower grades, on average, than students of all of the other national programmes, both academic and vocational (Skolverket, 2018b). Nevertheless, a sizeable proportion of the graduates, more than 19 %, proceed to higher education, predominantly to become school or pre-school teachers (Skolverket, 2017a).

---

[18] Since 2011/2012 the percentage of women has decreased from 65.2 % to 59.9 % (Skolverket, 2018b).
[19] In year 2017/2018 the percentage of approximately 63 referred to upper secondary level of education.

Graduates of the programme generally secure employment in education, care and social services (Skolverket, 2017a).

Service work is generally not well remunerated, for example nursery nurse is one of the occupations with the lowest average monthly salaries according to Statistics Sweden (Statistiska Centralbyrån, 2017). Furthermore, the Child & Recreation Programme is one of the vocational programmes with a low degree of establishment in working life after graduation (Skolverket, 2017a)[20]. The lack of clarity and fuzziness of task descriptions of employments that the programme leads to are claimed to compound the difficulties with securing employments for the programme's graduates, especially as a nursery nurse or personal trainer (Skolverket, 2017b). However, chances to secure a job are generally good according to the Swedish Public Employment Service (Arbetsförmedlingen, 2018; see also Skolverket, 2018b), especially for temporary positions (Virolainen & Persson Thunqvist, 2017) in the social work and service sector.

In summary, three distinctive features emerge from this presentation of the Child & Recreation Programme. Firstly, the programme continues to cover broad and somewhat disparate contents as it provides training for several occupations in the service sector. Secondly, it mirrors an expansion of the service sector where new occupations are being added. Thirdly, it may lead to occupations with fragile opportunities for establishment in working life. These characteristic features of the programme may have a bearing on students' vocational becoming. For instance, the apparent incongruity of contents along with a fuzziness of borders between them may call for a need to find a common denominator to keep the Child & Recreation Programme together. Addressing vocational matters under the encompassing umbrella of pedagogy may serve this purpose.

2.2.1 Vocationalised Pedagogy in New Service Occupations

Today's Child & Recreation Programme is, in my view, vaguely described as intended for students who wish to "work with children, youth or adults in peda-gogical and social vocational areas, or in the recreational or healthcare sectors" (Skolverket, 2012b, p. 63). Generally, this work is framed in terms of

---

[20] Only 35 % of those who obtained a vocational diploma in 2014 were established in the labour market in the following year (Skolverket, 2018b).

pedagogical encounters[21] between service providers and service recipients. Thus, the subject Pedagogy as a vocational subject[22] is curricularised as the "core" of the Child & Recreation Programme, explicitly crafted for development of "the ability to meet and pedagogically lead people in different situations, and create good conditions for people to learn and grow" (Skolverket, 2012b, p. 63). The four courses[23] that form the mandatory conceptual foundations for vocational knowing for prospective nursery nurses, personal assistants, personal trainers and security officers are thus geared towards this overall goal of assisting, i.e., serving others to help them "develop". Thus, the programme has responded to a need for pedagogical leadership to engender occupation-specific standards of conduct and demeanour[24]. Moreover, pedagogy seems tailored to the programme's existing emphases on social skills and psycho-social growth (Lemar, 2001), its traditional orientation towards child care and the needs of people-centred service work[25].

However, the main imperative undergirding the upper secondary school reform of 2011 was strengthening employability by curricularising clearly defined vocational outcomes, that is, occupational qualifications. Pedagogy as "problem-solving" and "preparation for action" were demanded by employers (Skolverket, n.d.). Before the reform, Pedagogy appeared to cater for these demands. Thus, Pedagogy as a vocational subject in USVET proved to be sufficiently malleable to adapt to occupation-specific needs as discursively articulated by various stakeholders, e.g., representatives of the security industry (Wyszynska Johansson, 2016) and sports and leisure sector (Dyne, 2017) (personal communication with Annica Nyman-Alm, May 2017).

---

21 Before the upper secondary school reform (Gy2011) the Swedish National Agency for Education confirmed that several vocational courses typically on offer in the Child & Recreation Programme, e.g., communication, were also popular with students across upper secondary school (Skolverket, 1998) as optional courses. There was a growing demand, and need to cater, for educational content involving broad issues of pedagogy and leadership within upper secondary school.

22 It consists of seven courses: Activity leadership, Communication, Learning and development, Human environments, Children's learning and growth, Pedagogical theory and practice, Pedagogical leadership.

23 These are: Learning and development, Human environment, Communication and Pedagogical leadership.

24 Therefore, in accordance with these intentions, pedagogy was discursively transformed into a programme-specific subject and a common denominator for all the occupations that the Child & Recreation Programme leads to (personal communication with Annica Nyman-Alm, May 2017).

25 Another intention guiding the reform of 2011 was to strengthen the scientific base of vocational programmes. Pedagogy as a vocational subject anchored in cross-disciplinary science of pedagogy offered an advantage in this regard.

Through its adaptivity and malleability, Pedagogy as an USVET subject may reflect the needs of service work as well as its intangible results. It is sometimes claimed that service work produces immaterial results. However, the intangible results of service work are products of material work, including work on refining properties of relations and recipients. So, in service work and its intangible results (care, protection, assistance etc.) work is refined because utility is placed in this work corresponding to a human need a certain service is to fulfil (Kotarbinski, 1982). In the next section, service work as dependent on the interrelation between the service giver and the service recipient is outlined, based on selected literature. This interrelation can be potentially framed as pedagogised, as it can be assisting and supportive.

2.3 What is New Service Work?

Jobs in care (e.g., personal assistant), child care (e.g., nursery nurse), social care (e.g., security officer) and leisure (e.g., sports instructor or personal trainer) can all be described as high-touch (McDowell, 2009), interactive service work (Leidner, 1993) and thoroughfare/transit jobs (Ulfsdotter Eriksson & Flisbäck, 2011). They all typically involve people (children, customers, offenders and disabled or elderly service recipients) as "raw material" of both the work process and the work product (Leidner, 1993), making the dynamic of labour unpredictable as it relies on "the three-way relationship" (Leidner, 1993, p. 133) between employers, service givers and recipients.

Service workers have to skilfully manage alignment between interests and intentions that may both converge and diverge, often in momentarily close (even intimate) personal service exchange with others. Service tasks have also been described as involving minimal decision-making, leading to routinisation of work with people, particularly in highly regimented retail settings (Leidner, 1993). In these retail trade contexts, e.g., fast food retail chains, efforts to standardise procedures offer protection from occupational hazards (e.g., insult or other degrading treatment) but also contribute to the instrumentalisation of relations between workers and others (Leidner, 1993). The security officer uniform may act as a boundary maker between the private self and the occupational role (Ulfsdotter Eriksson & Flisbäck, 2011). Service workers typically "need to work on themselves to do their jobs well" (Leidner, 1993, p. 178), transforming attitudes, body movement, intonation and emotions (Hochschild, 1983/2003). Customer interaction, which uses and thrives on

emotion work (Hochschild, 1983/2003), can nevertheless be experienced as rewarding, particularly when it is apparently integrated with a broad profile of competence, expertise and knowledgeability (Brockmann, 2013). For example, being customer-friendly may instil a sense of pride, purpose and autonomy, especially when a salesperson experiences work as a complete sale activity (Musaeus, 2002; Reegård, 2015).

Social skills required in interactive service work remain salient yet difficult to pinpoint (Leidner, 1993). Service work providers need to pay attention to ("read" and anticipate) service recipients' interactive clues and respond to them appropriately, modulating their own mood, demeanour and personal articulations. However, sensitivity to others may not be recognised as an occupational skill and reduced to a personality trait or general "likability".

In service occupations, workers apply various strategies for coping with unpredictability and negative stereotyping by the general public connected with people-centred tasks. Apart from already mentioned routinisation (Leidner, 1993), workers may identify themselves with a brand and a company's manifested values or claim moral superiority and social responsibility (Ulfsdotter Eriksson & Flisbäck, 2011). By refraining from intervening and reframing degrading behaviour that stems from the need for subordination, security officers may reclaim occupational self-worth. They also develop occupational cultures that preserve a sense of self-dignity, normalising taint they routinely deal with along with idealised societal expectations (Hansen Löfstrand, Loftus & Loader, 2016). It may well be that by transforming pedagogy into a vocational subject, efforts can be made to counterbalance the alienating instrumentalisation of social relations and work on the self that are inherent elements of service work. Reframing occupational hazards and social taint involved in service work in terms of pedagogical encounter may also neutralise possible negative connotations. Thus, Pedagogy as a vocational subject in the Child & Recreation Programme offers a ready-made form and content for the imperative of catering to the needs of person-centred new service occupations. From a comparative perspective on vocational education and training, soft skills of attending to customer care may be taught as incorporated with a comprehensive model of competence or reduced to a set of discrete procedural skills taught on the job (Brockmann, 2013).

As already mentioned, Pedagogy as a vocational subject in the Child & Recreation Programme has been curricularised, forming an axis around which vocational knowing, geared towards interaction-intensive service jobs, is

discursively organised. However, vocational knowing for some occupations in the programme has stronger roots in (child) pedagogy, e.g., nursery nurse or swimming instructor, than the newer ones, e.g., security officer or personal trainer. Therefore, Pedagogy as a vocational subject must be moulded to fit needs of recently added occupational outcomes of the Child & Recreation Programme. The expansion of the service sector to encompass new types of service (e.g., personal trainer and security officer) are responses to societal changes. Identity construction, emerging as a central theme in the western industrialised world, requires constant purchase of services and a careful combination of them as identity construction building blocks (Allvin, 2006). However, all service work carries potential connotations of servility and submissiveness of sale of oneself (Gorz, 2001, p. 56-63). This pervading threat can be dealt with by various measures, e.g., efforts to distance oneself from the actual service work being carried out (see above) and by efforts to professionalise service occupations through education.

In sum, vocational becoming for people-centred service work is often examined in terms of socialisation into patterns of being that are valued in communities of practice. Furthermore, when applying critical theories, this type of work is described in terms of deskilling, alienation and exploitation of personhood (Braverman, 1974/1999). This thesis highlights instead the role of conceptualised knowing for vocational becoming. As shown later, exposure to a certain vocational content, such as surveillance law, assists young students in their transformation to become prospective security officers. This brief outline places service work as contested and drawing on soft personal resources. Therefore, it can also be claimed that vocational knowing is steeped in relational, common sense layman culture (Steinnes, 2014), which indirectly raises questions about the foundations of its specialisation. Clearly, students who have just begun to form a vocational identity need to become sensitised to conflicting interests and expectations from the public, employers and service recipients. These dilemmas will inevitably influence students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming, possibly infusing education and training with conflicting messages. These messages may, for instance, highlight efforts by stakeholders to counterbalance social taint by a sense of moral superiority, expertise and personal accountability.

2.4 Research on the Child & Recreation Programme

In this section, some research on the Child & Recreation Programme is briefly and selectively outlined. Generally, the research singles out this programme as targeting/attracting and appealing to pupils from lower socio-economic strata (Ambjörnsson, 2004). Moreover, several studies have shown how schooling, in this and other programmes, contributes to reproducing social inequalities, e.g., by assessment and teaching practices (Hjelmér, 2012; Korp, 2006; Norlund, 2009) as well as gendered identity construction (Ambjörnsson, 2004). The views of vocational teachers as well as workplace supervisors and trainers on their instruction and guidance have also been scrutinised (Dyne, 2017; Lemar, 2001; Mårtensson & Andersson, 2018).

Lemar[26] (2001) contends that students attending this programme are subjected to instruction that is weakly classified, i.e., the boundaries between subjects, private/public and teacher/student are blurred. Personal relations on different levels (group and individual) are conflated with the goals, contents, methods and assessment in accordance with the programme's goal to ensure that students know themselves and understand others to prepare them generally for work with people. Teachers act as role models, developing a generalist pedagogical competence to cater for shifting needs of the highly heterogeneous student population. Negotiating group processes in the spirit of shared responsibility and mutual respect, conflict management, maintaining rapport and camaraderie based on care for the individual student all mark teacher practices in the Child & Recreation Programme. Teachers apply explicit rules and specifications for handling group processes to structure what may be described as predominantly invisible pedagogy (Lemar, 2001). Hjelmér (2012) has studied the enacted curriculum of education for and in democracy in relation to how students in a Child & Recreation Programme exercise their agency. Applying Bernsteinian theory, she finds a care-centred pedagogic code that students maintain together with their teachers, enabling students to negotiate requirements and downsize demands in a programme whose focus Hjelmér describes as blurred, that is, neither devoted to employability nor further studies. She also observes that instruction in a Child & Recreation Programme is regulated by course goals and grading criteria, but students seem

---

[26] She studied Child and Recreation teachers' identity as vocational teachers in a transition from rule-steering to goal-steering education governance, using a largely Bernsteinian theoretical framework.

preoccupied with writing down the 'right' answers[27]. Drawing on critical theory research of vocational education, Hjelmér contends that students in a Child & Recreation Programme are deprived of learning opportunities, thus reinforcing a low societal position. A licentiate thesis by Dyne (2017) is of interest here as it describes how the newly introduced occupational outcome of Personal Trainer (cf. Security Officer), takes form in collaboration between working life and school. Examining this collaboration in one school, she argues that students are provided limited access to the whole array of personal trainer occupation-specific tasks, and in extension meeting the formal requirements of certification as personal trainers. This is despite vocational teachers' attempts to tailor the instruction to the interests of service and sale espoused by the recreation and wellness industry. In sum, students' identity formation as prospective personal trainers may be threatened or curtailed by salient difficulties with obtaining formal qualifications.

To recap, the Child & Recreation Programme comes across in research as firmly grounded in theoretical knowing pertaining to human relations (pedagogy, psychology and sociology) rather than occupational practice, which appears diverse and disparate. This may make the programme appear fuzzy or perhaps even quasi-vocational.

---

[27] Her focus is however not on vocational subjects.

3 Literature Review

This chapter presents previous research on three areas of interest in the thesis: vocational becoming, experienced curriculum and feedback. The procedures and search strategies applied in the review, and its boundaries, are also outlined. Details of the literature search are provided in Appendix A.

The three areas of interest (vocational becoming, experienced curriculum and feedback) are far from unambiguous as these phenomena can be "brought to surface" through various expressions and they have diverse aspects with vague boundaries (cf. Levinsson & Prøitz, 2017, p. 213). For example, feedback can be studied both as information and as interaction. Therefore, this literature review is not intended to provide an exhaustive account but rather to arrange a meaningful configuration of previous results in relation to my open-ended qualitative research questions. The aim is to provide an account of how results of previous research operationalised theoretical concepts relevant to the two research questions (Levinsson & Prøitz, 2017). This approach, inspired by configurative tradition, explains why some studies in this literature review receive more attention than others.

3.1 Procedures and Search Strategies

Relevant literature was sought[28] using data search engines, predominantly Supersök[29], Eric Ebsco (including Education Research Complete) and Google Scholar. For Swedish research (books and dissertations) the databases included Libris and Swepub. For Nordic (but not Finnish) research, Nora Open Access Database and the Danish National Research Database. Finnish research is highly relevant because there are some similarities between Finnish and Swedish school-based upper secondary education, with a common cultural (Nordic)

---

[28] The last round of literature search was carried out at the turn of April and May 2018.
[29] Supersök is a search engine covering most of the collection and databases available at Gothenburg University library (post-1976). My search was systematically expanded by including material outside of the library collection, narrowing to the pedagogy discipline and with preference for newer material. My occasional expansion of selected discipline to other disciplines, e.g., anthropology and language studies (combined in Supersök with literature studies), did not yield additional sources.

context. Finnish research was therefore accessed through English language media whenever possible.

In addition, through my participation in the Research School in the Pedagogy of Vocational Subjects (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015) I have acquired broad familiarity with research on VET and assessment. This familiarity facilitated alternative ways for manual source retrieval sustained over a prolonged period of time. Apart from the advantage of building a solid understanding of research areas, this enables iterative searches and their continual revision. The reference literature accessed through database searches or other means, e.g., participation in academic conferences, often led to additional sources that were retrieved manually and scrutinised in a snowball manner.

Handbooks were also consulted, as they generally provide a state-of-the-art research overview of a specific field, e.g., VET, or specific educational phenomenon, e.g., assessment, in a given period of time. Older handbooks (see Appendix A) helped me to map the three areas of interest here onto early research in VET in its early days (1982; 1996). For instance, references to so-called *periodic feedback* (1982) helped me to position feedback in relation to formative feedback (2010a) (see Appendix A), and link research on these phenomena with general issues of assessment in VET (Ecclestone, 2010b, pp. 337-341). In order to place studies on experienced curriculum in a broader curriculum research, a total of five chapters in two handbooks (2008b; 2015) were consulted (see Appendix A).

My literature search was supplemented by consultation of databases of two specific journals (*Vocations & Learning* and *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*) of particular relevance according to their declared scope and breadth of scientific interests[30]. Following these additional searches, I am confident that I have not missed any key articles, but of course I cannot be certain of this.

Due to my prior general acquaintance with VET research, I could restrict all database searches to scholarly and peer-reviewed material without a severe risk

---

[30] *Vocations and Learning: Studies in Vocational and Professional Education* is described as an international forum for papers covering the broad field of vocational learning. Established in 2008 and published by Springer Netherlands its coverage includes issues of curriculum and pedagogy, the role and nature of knowledge in vocational learning as well as analyses of instruction. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training,* published by Taylor & Francis, covers (in addition to this broad field) issues of critical discussion of policy and practice, specifically including assessment. This journal was established in 1948 as *The Vocational Aspect of Education* (up to 1995).

of missing relevant material. The searches also covered dissertations (mainly doctoral theses, but relevant Swedish licentiate dissertations were also consulted). Two research schools (the Research School on Vocational Pedagogy and the Research School in the Pedagogy of Vocational Subjects) have produced a number of highly relevant sources of information in the context of the Swedish system of vocational education[31].

As my research questions concern meaning-making of experience, the relevance of previous research results depends on how their subjects interpreted their experiences rather than their unequivocal relation to these experiences. Therefore, the sources deemed to be of interest were restricted to studies that applied (wholly or largely) qualitative methodology. This section concludes by presenting the search strategies together with the exclusion criteria (Table 3). Searches were carried out using word strings in English, Swedish and selectively Polish.

---

[31] These schools were established in collaboration between six universities with the specific aim to amend the lack of research on Swedish VET. Students' conceptions of aspects of vocational programmes were one of the focal research interests (Lindberg, 2016). The two schools have resulted in a total of seven doctoral theses and 13 licentiate theses, including Wyszynska Johansson (2015).

Table 3 Search Strategies

General Search Term	Specific Search Word String	Exclusion Criteria
Vocational identity formation Yrkesidentitet Tożsamość zawodowa	Vocational identity formation/development Occupational identity formation/development	Adult occupational identity In-service education Higher education
Feedback Återkoppling Informacja zwrotna	Feedback, formative assessment, assessment for learning, vocational education and training, apprentice*, student* experience*[32]	Domain specific studies: career guidance, language, computer technology Compulsory school Higher education
Experienced curriculum	Experienced curriculum Curriculum-as-experienced Curriculum of experience Curriculum-as-lived	Young children Domain specific: computer technology, academic subjects

3.2 Boundaries of the Literature Overview

Although research on the three areas of interest is vast, cutting across education systems and working life, studies on relevant phenomena in upper secondary VET contexts are rare. Generally, despite applying various filters, e.g., no literature on adults, online learning or higher education, my strategic search results still returned sources that were deemed to be clearly irrelevant, e.g., studies on teacher training. Some conceptual difficulties also arose. For instance, adolescents' vocational becoming can be researched using the concept of identity formation derived from the construct of identity as a content, process or structure (Porfeli, Lee & Vondracek, 2013). Studies on identity as a (psychosocial) composite construct or generally a structure, or a result of psychological and psychodynamic processes (e.g., Erikson, Marcia) are excluded here. Studies on (adult) occupational identity, that is, identity derived from participating in occupations through remunerative employment, are also not considered (Kirpal, 2004), along with studies on adult learners in working life or in-service education. Regarding research on experienced curriculum, studies focused on young children were excluded. In literature, feedback and assessment often overlap or subsume each other (cf. Forsberg & Lindberg, 2010). Domain-specific studies on feedback, e.g., career guidance, language

---

[32] By using truncated words (student* experience*) I intended to find literature on feedback from various perspectives, both collective and individual students' perspectives.

teaching or natural sciences as well as studies with higher education settings (e.g., medicine or computer technology) are not included in this review.

Regarding research on the three areas of interest here, country-specific contexts of vocational education must be carefully considered (Esping-Andersen, 1990). In several countries, occupations are largely learnt in school (Finland, France, and Sweden) or workplaces (USA, UK). In others it is bound with apprenticeship and may involve a combination of vocational learning in school and professional training in a company (the "dual system", as implemented in Germany, Austria, Denmark, and Switzerland). There is also a mixed model (the Netherlands) (Sappa & Aprea, 2014). Clearly, each model of initial vocational education offers profoundly different opportunities for young people to shape vocational identities through feedback (see Brockmann & Laurie, 2016). Moreover, different models of vocational didactics (Gessler & Moreno Herrera, 2015) inevitably mould young people's experiences of vocational becoming. Studies of chiefly school-based initial vocational education and training are of primary interest here, although studies of apprenticeship are included when deemed relevant, e.g., by contributing to research on student experience of learning in workplaces. The three literature reviews that follow are similarly structured as to account for specific literature search methods, general features of research field concerned, a review of selected sources, and final short recaps.

3.3 Research on Vocational Becoming

To search for relevant literature on vocational becoming I used the Boolean string "vocational identity OR occupational identity formation". This string captures both aspects of vocational becoming, i.e., learning an occupation in conjunction with a transformation of being. Searches with this phrase in the keyword position together with "vocational education and training" and in combination with "young people* experience*" yielded 668 hits[33]. All the hits were screened by title and published source, e.g., type of journal for relevance, resulting in approximately 20 sources. These sources were further screened by abstract.

I conclude that vocational identity formation is generally treated as an interplay of two main elements, structure and agency, allocating varying relative

---

[33] Using Supersök, additional Ebsco and Google Scholar searches confirmed the results.

importance to them. Therefore, different approaches to learning an occupation provide differing perspectives for empirical studies of vocational identity formation. Several strands can be discerned. A review by Schaap, Baartman and de Bruijn (2012) identified vocational identity formation as one of six themes[34] for structuring student experience during school- and workplace-based VET. In a handbook of technical and vocational education and training, Rauner and Maclean (2008) argue that learning an occupation has a socialisation effect leading to a similar habitus with people sharing patterns of thinking and acting in the world. In a review of literature guiding workplace learning in VET, Mikkonen, Pylväs, Rintala, Nokelainen and Postareff (2017) contend that instructional situations in workplaces may facilitate identity transformation. However, in a review of literature on workplace learning, Tynjälä (2013) argues that vocational identity formation is related to agency, that is, how individuals exercise their agency modifies their identity.

Successful vocational identity formation is about students converging their personal interests with "imagined future identities" that vocational education offers, according to Helms Jørgensen (2013, p. 166). In a similar vein, Phillips underscores that vocational identity formation appears for young people as essentially "a quest to achieve an adequate vocational identity to sustain them in a working world as a young adult" (1995, p. 6). Studying vocational becoming as a quest for subjective meanings requires methodologies that allow interpretation by actors involved, e.g., interviews and field studies.

3.3.1 General Features

Vocational identity formation begins in VET (Virtanen et al., 2008) as both its key aspect and an outcome, as robust vocational identity seems a prerequisite for workforces "to plan, execute, and monitor their work activities autonomously", according to Klotz et al. (2014, p. 1). Apart from exposure to work experience in workplaces, vocational identity formation is also dependent on a fit between personal interests and "consent to engage fully in the process of occupational preparation" (Klotz et al., 2014, p. 17). This claim brings student agency to the fore.

Several strands can be differentiated from the brief introduction to research on vocational identity formation presented above, based on different

---

[34] The other themes describing students' learning processes are related to expertise and knowledge development, learning styles, knowledge integration and motivation for learning.

metaphors for vocational becoming, e.g., boundary crossing. Presenting research on vocational identity formation as separate clusters of literature is, of course, an essential simplification and empirical research often applies several metaphors for learning (Sfard, 1998). In the following overview of previous research, I consider results of empirical studies from several previously identified perspectives (Mikkonen et al., 2017; Rauner & Maclean, 2008; Schaap et al., 2012; Tynjälä, 2013). These are treatment of vocational becoming in terms of boundary crossing, participation, transfer, and habitus. I also supplement the four strands of research with a proposed fifth metaphor, generalisation of knowing, to place the studies this thesis is based upon in relation to previous research.

3.3.2 Vocational Becoming through Boundary Crossing

Boundary-crossing is triggered by the need to reconcile conflicting demands (e.g., arising from school and work-based practices) to develop a vocational identity (Akkerman & Bakker, 2011; Bronkhorst & Akkerman, 2016). However, boundary crossing may also be extended to other and wider kinds of discontinuities that individuals may encounter, such as "non-sameness" and thus potentially dissonance, and ways they handle associated difficulties (Akkerman & Bakker, 2011; Bronkhorst & Akkerman, 2016). Ways that individuals exert their agency reconciling these discontinuities and barriers for learning are highlighted in research rooted in a boundary-crossing perspective (Akkerman & Bakker, 2012; Brockmann, 2010; Tanggaard, 2007).

In a Dutch study of "identity-related challenge of students' boundary crossing", Akkerman and Bakker (2012, p. 153) identified epistemic requirements that hindered students' movement between school (on release days) and work (in laboratories) to fully capitalise on learning for vocational becoming. They had to align knowing that was technology-heavy, protocolled in scripts and socially distributed, acquired from laboratory workplaces, to starkly individual presentational school performances. These presentational school performances were assisted by teachers asking controlling questions. Teachers' questions were reportedly of "why" character, tailored to "follow the standardized lines of disciplinary reasoning" (Akkerman & Bakker, 2012, p. 160), rendering vocational knowing in workplaces invisible in the format of presentational school performances.

Tanggaard (2007) investigated how electro-mechanical engineering apprentices experienced vocational education in the Danish dual model. She found that vocational becoming emerged from the students' participation across the school and work contexts, and thus was a case of boundary-crossing between bounded cultural practices. This continuous crisscrossing required their investment in membership of various communities of practice, balancing conflicting demands of legitimacy and strangeness in peer and adult groups.

A study of a motor vehicle maintenance class in an English further education college, by Brockmann (2010), illustrates how formation of a vocational identity (in this case as a car mechanic) is intertwined with (social) learner identity formation. The two processes are frequently treated as bounded and distinct in institutionalised discourses in vocational education (Brockmann, 2012; Brockmann & Laurie, 2016; Korp, 2011, 2012; Tanggaard, 2007). Monitored students seemed to comply with these pedagogical discourses, reinforcing a learner/worker dichotomy (Brockmann, 2012; see also Korp, 2011). However, their learner biographies provide evidence of sophisticated choices of advanced learning opportunities that they actively sought (Brockmann, 2010; see also Korp, 2011, 2012). Therefore, the kind of activities they elected to engage with "posits them as experts in their own right" whereas "'being talked at'" seemed to extinguish their interest (Brockmann, 2010, p. 67).

Students' experiences of becoming a carpenter in a Danish vocational school context are examined by Vestergaard Louw (2013), who highlights their relative lack of general familiarity with carpentry as an area of work. This unfamiliarity reportedly contributed to social processes of inclusion, exclusion or even estrangement of young students during vocational courses in the school workshop (Vestergaard Louw, 2012). The carpenters-to-be heavily relied on support from their teachers for inclusion. Sometimes, however, typically in assessment situations in the workshop, teachers withdrew their visible support, leaving students to their own devices to manifest their knowing for teachers to assess. These sudden switches or discontinuities between a direct and indirect teacher approach resulted in uncertainty for students, leading to disengagement, which may naturally impede progress in vocational becoming.

Students' experience of discontinuity between school- and workplace-based assessments influences their vocational becoming, according to a focus group-based study by Sandal, Smith & Wangensteen (2014). Their investigation is particularly relevant here as it shares the Nordic cultural context of people-centred work (care) and concerns initial stages of vocational becoming through

assessment. A key finding is that students tried to bridge school discourses of learning goals with workplace discourses centred on the immediacy of tasks and shared meanings that these tasks produced for students who were exploring possible future careers. Students reported varying degrees of autonomy in workplaces, and associated passivity or engagement, which often depended on the subjectively matching between expectations of the student and workplace personnel regarding suitable tasks. The above survey of empirical studies shows the usefulness of the boundary-crossing metaphor when exploring issues of student agency in vocational becoming.

3.3.3 Vocational Becoming through Participation in Communities of Practice

The starting point of this research strand is in situative practices of socialising patterns of legitimate but peripheral participation (Lave & Wenger, 1991) in communities of practice, notably in workplaces (Chan, 2013a, 2013b; Pang, 2015). However, master-apprentice patterns of learning through participation can also be activated in school-based contexts of vocational education (Korp, 2011, 2012; Vestergaard Louw, 2013).

Vocational becoming in the light of participation in workplaces takes place along the trajectory from proximal participation through an initial stage of belonging to a workplace (Chan, 2013a, 2013b; Pang, 2015). In a Danish study of retail apprentices, Museaus (2002) found that a first step for prospective salespersons was to pick up certain clues to align themselves towards, e.g., striving to act in a happy and out-going fashion, while maintaining an overview of the store. Through this active process of alignment they gradually developed appreciation for certain values, e.g., high fashion, which they interpreted as representative of a store and those who worked there, putting personal tastes aside. Thus, their vocational becoming was about representing, communicating with customers and trading with them immaterial values and lifestyles commodified in sales (clothing) items. However, re-moulding into a self-confident, self-reliant and persuasive salesperson in work and outside of work was not the only crucial identified element of vocational becoming. To become a salesperson the young people also reportedly had to develop a capacity to juggle and integrate discrete operations into a meaningful whole of a task to be automatised as a complete flow of integrated actions (e.g., selling an expensive garment) (Musaeus, 2002; cf. Brockmann, 2013). Thus, vocational becoming

occurs through elaborate patterns of participation guided by feedback on the effects of apprentices originating and eventually claiming certain tasks as theirs (Musaeus, 2002; Pang, 2015).

The vocational identity of apprentices seems to be conferred upon them by more experienced others, e.g., through "socially-sanctioned exchange of recognition at the workplace" (Nielsen, 2008, p. 254). Therefore, vocational becoming for apprentices is about recognition of their worth mapped onto a possible "future within the trade" (Nielsen, 2008, p. 254). This recognition is based on the apprentices' growing range of responsibilities (Chan, 2017; Reegård, 2015) and growing expertise in areas recognised as valued (Musaeus, 2002; cf. Aarkrog, 2005). Accounts of students attending the Norwegian Sales VET Programme have confirmed that being attributed and assuming responsibility can contribute to vocational identity formation as sales assistants (Reegård, 2015). Initiating and taking responsibility is also reportedly one of the learning strategies adopted by students taking a Swedish vocational programme and may support their participation in communities of practice during work placements: "In order to become members of the work community [industrial workers] the students took individual responsibility, asked questions, searched for role models, positioned themselves as resources and used jargon" (Ferm, Persson Thunqvist, Svensson & Gustavsson, 2018, p. 79) (cf. Pang, 2015; Reegård, 2015).

In the school context, instruction in vocational programmes also offers students access to communities of practice where the teacher acts as both a master and role model. Students develop a vocational identity through participation in instruction integrated with a community of practice as well as informal socialisation that this instruction of vocational courses is infused with (Klope, 2015; Korp, 2012; Vestergaard Louw, 2013). Korp contends that this instruction offers students a palpable sense of progression (2011, 2012). They see vocational courses as "including, comprehensive and rewarding" as this vocational content represents a community of practice that recognises and valorises students' background and earlier experiences (Korp, 2012, p. 89). In sum, shaping a vocational identity is contingent on the more experienced significant others who, by investing time for scaffold instruction, convey to apprentices (or students) a sense of inclusion in the collective, narrative we-position (Nielsen, 2008, p. 254; Vestergaard Louw, 2013).

3.3.4 Vocational Becoming as Transfer

Transfer in its original cognitive interpretation deals with one-sided transition of moving knowledge from one context to another. Issues of vocational becoming are thus reduced to unambiguous application of what one learns in school to what workplaces require (Aarkrog, 2005; Asplund & Kilbrink, 2016; Berner, 2009; Kilbrink, Bjurulf, Olin-Scheller & Tengberg, 2014). In a study of sales assistants in the Danish dual-system, Aarkrog advocates transfer of "systematic knowledge of the goods" (2005, p. 145) from school to workplace, as such knowledge is held in high regard at workplaces and difficult to learn there. Thus, transfer of knowledge regarded as prestigious and coveted, from school to work seems to provide a mechanism for vocational becoming, strengthening the trainee's position as a member of a community of practice (cf. Musaeus, 2002). It should be noted that these issues of vocational becoming are not generally major concerns in studies focused on transfer aspects of learning an occupation (Aarkrog, 2005; Asplund & Kilbrink, 2016; Kilbrink et al. 2014)[35].

3.3.5 Vocational Becoming as Habitus Moulding

Young people's vocational becoming has also been studied in terms of the development of *habitus*, that is, the development of a certain "feel for the rules of the game" in relation to a particular field, e.g., occupation (Colley, James, Diment & Tedder, 2003; Vincent and Braun, 2010, 2011). Vocational habitus (Colley et al., 2003) is investigated through a lens of certain dispositions, both idealised and realised, that students gradually develop and eventually acquire a currency in relation to the field in terms of social and cultural capital. Studies of vocational habitus formation contribute to an understanding of social stratification processes of group affiliation and social mobility. In the context of a Swedish school-based vocational programme, Klope (2015) investigated how student hairdressers-to-be position themselves as good hairdresser-students, "professional" hairdressers or someone in-between. Their interactions with teachers, peers and customers in a school hair salon seemed to strengthen these positions as well as reinforcing the demarcation lines

---

[35] However, the notion of transfer has been expanded to include transfer of collective patterns of social practice in the movement between contexts (Konkola, Tuomi-Gröhn, Lambert & Ludvigsen, 2007).

between them. Young people's agency is not typically a major focus in studies of vocational habitus as the locus of actions comes from the structural constraints, e.g., gender and class, which influence young people's social mobility (Ferm et al., 2018; Korp, 2012). However, studies of vocational habitus also show how young people exercise agency by putting up resistance, e.g., questioning messages coming from the structuring forces of a field (Vincent & Braun, 2011).

3.3.6 Vocational Becoming as a Generalisation of Knowing

Under the label of generalisation of knowing I have collected studies that emphasise students' development of vocational knowing captured through their work with "languaged expressions". These languaged expressions of knowing encapsulate for learners practical, occupation-specific actions and their implications. Vocational becoming is therefore explored as a constant interplay between two sets of meanings for a person (context-tied and context-freed) and subsequently described in terms of greater or lesser degrees of meaning, depending on their immediate context. Essentially, generalisation of knowing is about idiosyncratic meanings becoming culturally and historically shared in contexts that they emerge in, collectively transformed and shared by learners. This understanding of knowing generalisation as based on the interplay between the concrete and abstract is in line with Vygotskian concepts: "The term 'concrete' was defined by Vygotsky as an immediate sensory grasp of an object, and 'abstract' as its maximally generalized conceptualization" (Dafermos, 2018, p. 164).

This process of what I refer to here as generalisation of knowing resembles what others have referred to as: *recontextualisation*[36], that is, dis- and re-embedding contexts in contexts (van Oers, 1998); *learner recontextualisation* (Evans, Guile, Harris & Allan, 2010; Guile, 2010; Hordern, 2014); and *knowledge propagation* (Beach, 1999, 2003). Beach broadens the phenomenon of transfer from transporting knowledge from one context to another to its generalisation, or in his terminology, knowledge propagation. Generalisation (propagation)

---

[36] Bernstein (1996/2000, pp. 31-33) introduced the notion of recontextualisation to explore how discourses, knowledge, practice and identity are constituted across educational contexts. He defined recontextualisation as a "principle that selectively appropriates, relocates, refocuses and relates other discourses to constitute its own order" (p. 33).

refs to the continuity and transformation of knowledge at the interface of persons and activities, supported by systems of artefacts, e.g., texts, tools etc. Knowledge propagation offers a useful analytical tool for studies of progress horizontally, that is, across social contexts. More specifically, knowledge generalisation (propagation) comprises the construction of *associations*, by which Beach understands continuities and constancies as well as distinctions and contradictions. In relation to the studies this thesis is based upon, student vocational becoming may be seen as dependent on their construction work of such associations.

The associations that are formed in knowledge propagation involve various social and material forms of cultural organisation. Thus, they may support students' vocational identity formation as a major overhaul of their earlier social positions (as teenage students) as well as their sensed experience of transformation. Such a transformation is referred to as *consequential transition*, which "also makes us consider that identity craftwork drives knowledge propagation as much as it is shaped and perturbed by it" (Beach, 2003, p. 56). Thus, the notion of consequential transition captures developing vocational knowing and vocational identity formation as essentially recursive processes.

To illustrate generalisation of knowing, in their previously cited study, Akkerman and Bakker (2012) found that students needed to reconcile a disciplinary (chemistry) style of reasoning with less easily verbalised but palpable knowing from laboratory workplace settings. In Swedish industrial vocational programmes students reportedly make meaning of their encounters with innovations in technology, which is an important aspect of vocational becoming as an industrial worker (Berner, 2009). Thus, students (with scaffolding by the teacher) entered "into a mental and physical dialogue with" a machine they learnt to operate in a school setting (Berner, 2009, p. 191). By localising the machine's technology-heavy script into a school setting they recontextualised both the task and the machine in an emotionally charged interactive situation. Similarly, in retail settings students reportedly need to generalise their knowing beyond discrete procedures to integrate such protocols with a meaningful and complete cycle of sale activity (Brockmann, 2013) (cf. Musaeus, 2002; Reegård, 2015).

Sandal et al. (2014) argue that students in vocational education for people-centred occupations find knowing that is embedded in tasks in workplaces difficult to perceive as vocational, and thus specialised. Young students may locate vocational knowing in everyday and commonsensical knowing and not

be able to generalise this knowing to other contexts. This process of discernment of knowing as specialised is part and parcel of their vocational becoming as they rely on help to generalise knowledge horizontally between school knowledge, everyday knowledge and vocation-specific knowledge. They also need help to acquire personal meanings and coherence from this generalisation across contexts.

Bijlsma, Schaap and de Bruijn (2016) found that Dutch vocational education students alternated between *socializing* and *personalizing* vocational knowledge. Socialising knowledge means that they related to vocational knowing as given or canonical in the context of a community of practice as they, for instance, clarified and explained the meaning of such knowledge (meaning-making). By personalising knowledge, they made sense of how this knowledge fits with their earlier experiences in the process of particularising knowledge. In a similar vein, Heusdens, Bakker, Baartman and de Bruijn (2016) describe how culinary students made use of conceptualisation and concretisation as parallel learning processes, which supported their vocational identity formation (2016). Students conceptualised when they framed (with assistance from their teacher) a particular culinary action, e.g., jam-making, within a framework of other culinary relevant concepts, such as "dehydration". Concretisation, on the other hand, means that they related to a particular immediate activity of jam-making they participated in, that is, of preserving fruit in culinary practice.

Vocational becoming as a generalisation of knowing appears to be marked and enhanced by pivotal turning points. In the context of school-based vocational education, gaining formal accreditation, for instance as a lorry driver, is perceived by young students as a "deeply transformative experience" of becoming a person to be trusted and respected on the basis of their specialised knowing (Korp, 2012, p. 89), and hence a turning point. These turning points are captured by Vaughan through her term *vocational thresholds* (2017). By stepping over such occupation-specific vocational thresholds, metaphorically speaking, not only novel but also profoundly transformed understandings of oneself in relation to an occupation can be gained (Vaughan, 2017)[37]. As a metaphor, vocational thresholds imply that a return to previous understandings is not possible. Along the same lines, Wegener (2014) describes how trainees in elderly care in the social and health care programmes in Denmark access entry points into the occupation by reflection on particularly vivid and critical events,

---

[37] This study deals with practitioners (doctors) in training.

e.g., death of an elderly resident. Wegener reports observing the trainees' "stories of surprises and concerns about their interaction with the care recipients" (2014, p. 463) that triggered reflection on how to interpret and handle typical situations in interaction-heavy care work. She highlights the importance of the ways students handled "emotional situations, curiosity, criticism and excitement while building a professional identity" (2014, p. 471). However, Wegener concludes that trainees were generally left to their own devices to generalise knowing during work-placed training trying to make sense of their experiences, including the salient events that may be conducive to stepping over vocational thresholds. This was despite official rhetoric of encouraging students to adopt an attitude of wonder, curiosity and open inquiry to deal with the unpredictability inherent in care work.

Concluding this section, I argue that apart from the four established strands of research on vocational becoming (focused on boundary crossing, participation, transfer, and habitus), studies on generalisation of knowing offer new insights into vocational becoming. This is because the fifth metaphor for vocational becoming (generalisation of knowing) illuminates how students reason (through interaction and with the help of verbal expressions) about occupation specific actions as principled (Guile & Young, 2003), and how this reasoning is assisted by their crossing vocational thresholds.

3.4 Research on Students' Experienced Curriculum

Searches for studies on this topic were carried out using "vocational education and training" and "the experienced curriculum", returning 693 hits (Google Scholar) that were screened for relevance by scrutinising their titles and sources, e.g., type of journal. Additional searches of the Supersök and Ebsco databases, and searches withe extended terms ("curriculum-as-experienced", "curriculum of experience", "curriculum-as-lived") generated another 13 sources in total. These studies utilise qualitative methodologies (field study & interview) to explore how people construct experienced curriculum through meaning-making of experience.

3.4.1 General Features

Research on experienced curriculums examines how students "execute" or "receive" what is taught and learned in classrooms (see Hume & Coll, 2010).

These studies address a perceived gap between different "levels" of curriculum (Marsh, 2009), although they may explicitly acknowledge the inherent unpredictability of an individual student's experienced curriculum. Thus, most empirical studies in this stream adopt such a "cascaded" view of experienced curriculums, often in relation to specific school subjects or programmes. Quantitative methodology, based on measuring the achievement of prescribed learning outcomes, is often used in experienced curriculum studies. Some have also investigated differentiating, but *hidden* effects of curriculums for students (Jackson, (1990/1968). Another strand of research studies curriculum as lived, that is, from a phenomenological perspective (see Aoki, 1993).

3.4.2 Empirical Studies of Students' Experienced Curriculum

There have been very few empirical studies on experienced curriculums in vocational education. However, the notion of experienced curriculum has been used in investigations of apprentices' narratives about learning by observation and what they learnt (situated judgement) (Chan, 2015b). Chan (2015a) concludes that apprentices needed assistance to discern what knowing was valuable to learn mimetically (cf. Sandal et al., 2014). Other studies have also considered how young apprentices negotiate access to job tasks (Chan, 2015) in order to insert themselves into a smooth flow of work in workplaces (Pang, 2015). Thus, apprentices' experienced curriculum in these cases revolved around their efforts to establish a legitimate presence for themselves in workplaces. They constructed an experienced curriculum by taking up clues from the surroundings of a workplace by both observing direct instructions and indirect observation, assisted by their senses.

Following an investigation of the emergence of student-interns' "curriculum of experience" in 60 varying worksites, Moore (2004, p. 326) concluded that naturally occurring workplace curriculums allow student-interns access to varying knowledge-in-use, which shapes their experienced curriculum. Billett (2015a, p.188) contends that higher education students' experienced curriculum in workplace settings differs depending on their readiness to participate, interest in participation and both confidence and competence to participate. He reports how international students' experienced curriculum may be impaired by a lack of the background knowledge others took for granted (Billett, 2015a, p. 189). Thus, this competence to participate relies on previous or background

knowledge. Socio-cultural heritage may also influence students' readiness to learn, as shown in a study of students with refugee backgrounds attending vocational schemes in Australia (Onsando & Billett, 2009). Thus, in order to support students in construction of their experienced curriculum as life-transforming, students may need considerable help "to commit to readiness to learn" (Onsando & Billett, 2009, p. 92). In sum, interpretative research on the experienced curriculum concerns various and even disparate aspects of how students exert agency faced with socio-cultural suggestions, e.g., learning processes and learner readiness.

3.5 Research on Feedback-Making

There are huge numbers of studies on feedback[38]. To narrow my search for contextually relevant literature on feedback-making I limited the review to literature published between the start of 2009 and 26, April 2018, because two reviews (Forsberg & Lindberg, 2010) cover previous assessment literature, reflecting a growing interest in feedback as a formative tool (Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015). My intention for the literature search was to discern themes and trends in understanding of feedback-making as a relational matter of interaction, in accordance with my research questions. Hence, I selected studies that applied methodologies capable of capturing aspects of such interaction, predominantly interviews, field studies and occasionally surveys.

A combination of "feedback" and "formative assessment" or "assessment for learning" enabled me to search literature on feedback in its formative function to contribute to learning and in relation to my research questions. As a strategy for narrowing the number of hits, I assumed that sources with the word feedback in the title as well as "formative assessment" or "assessment for learning" along with "vocational education and training" specified as keywords would be relevant. I also assumed that a further specification "student* experience*" (as a keyword) would return sources that address subjective meaning-making of feedback. Screening of the returns (293 from the Supersök database) by title and type of publication yielded three relevant sources, focused solely on school-based contexts. To capture studies of feedback in workplace-based contexts I expanded my search using the following word string: "feedback" AND "assess*" (keyword) AND "vocational education and

---

[38] A Supersök search using a combination of "feedback" AND "formative assess*" OR "assess* for learning" AND "vocational education and training" (2009-2018) yielded more than 90 000 hits.

training" AND "apprentice*" AND "student* experience*". This search (of the Supersök database) generated 159 hits, three of which were retained following scrutinisation.

3.5.1 General Features

There have also been few investigations of feedback through a lens of student experience and in VET (Forsberg & Lindberg, 2010)[39]. Moreover, the few available studies (both empirical and theoretical) have largely focused on feedback in tertiary education settings. As feedback in vocational education and training is context-bound cultural practice in environments that appear unfamiliar or even foreign to young students (Vestergaard Louw, 2012), findings from tertiary education may have limited and uncertain applicability. However, research on formative assessment (broadly classified) in compulsory education serves as a useful point for comparison (Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015)[40].

This literature review focuses on empirical studies of feedback as an aspect of (formative) assessment (Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015), which address feedback as a relational matter of interaction between various parties, e.g., students, peers, teachers and workplace trainers. Thus, empirical studies of what I call feedback-making deal with a continuous flow of interaction in classroom settings and workplaces, at differing levels of formality, from spontaneous comments to grades or written appraisals (cf. Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015).

Research on feedback in education reflects feedback's definitional ambiguity as it is difficult to separate feedback from instruction (Bennett, 2011) and assessment (see Hattie & Timperley, 2007; but also Taras, 2013). Widely accepted definitions of feedback tend to conceptualise feedback substantially as, "information communicated to the learner that is intended to modify his or her thinking or behavior for the purpose of improving learning" (Shute, 2008, p. 154)[41].

---

[39] This survey of research on assessment focuses on Swedish research between 1999-2009 (theses, peer-reviewed articles, research projects and grants), with Nordic and some international perspectives also presented. Only one study on assessment in vocational education and training has been identified (Tsagalidis, 2008).

[40] This systematic review of research on formative assessment concerns Swedish and international research.

[41] Shute's definition of formative feedback (2008) appears problematic as it rests on feedback's function of assistance for students to modify their behaviour. This raises troubling questions of whether (formative) feedback ceases to exist if it does not help students to learn. A similar concern has been voiced by Sadler (1989).

Framing feedback as "information provided by an agent (e.g., teacher, peer, book, parent, self, experience) regarding aspects of one's performance or understanding" makes it appear as a "consequence" of student achievement (Hattie & Timperley, 2007, p. 81), an expression of previous but tacit evaluation (Taras, 2013), or a means to close a gap in students' knowledge (Sadler, 1989). Forsberg and Lindberg (2010) stress how research on feedback is often implicitly rooted in systemic theories of input-output (see; Roos & Hamilton, 2005). Equating feedback with information may narrow the focus on feedback in empirical research to a transfer of ready-made meanings, which are simply stored in feedback for students to unpack and utilise. Fewer studies set out to investigate how students make meaning of feedback by creating an interpretative framework, based on their experience, which is my concern in the present overview.

The ideas behind formative assessment have influenced assessment research in general (Forsberg & Lindberg, 2010). For instance, the formative function of feedback for students' learning is emphasised in the 10 influential principles for assessment for learning listed by the Assessment Reform Group (2002)[42]. In assessment for learning, assessment is integrated with ongoing instruction and feedback can play a key role in this integration (Wiliam & Thompson, 2008). Feedback in assessment for learning is conceptualised as a dialogical and interactive process (Merry, Price, Carless & Taras, 2013), in which students' participation is important. In corollary, many feedback studies deal with feedback as a matter of "strategy" and its efficacy (Hattie & Timperley, 2007; Lundahl, 2011).

Research on assessment for learning has revealed difficulties in its implementation (Jönsson et al., 2015; Shuichi, 2016). Implementation efforts may even apparently have adverse effects for vocational education (see Brockmann, 2012; Ecclestone, 2007; Torrance, 2007). For example, assessment practices carried out in the name of formative assessment may instead induce pseudo-formative practices (Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015) of detailed accounts of procedural knowledge (Brockmann, 2012).

To summarise, empirical studies that treat a student perspective on feedback as an aspect of assessment are underrepresented. For example, a recent review of literature on assessment and curriculum theory identified only nine articles

---

[42] Assessment for learning is defined as a process of seeking and interpreting evidence for use to enhance learning in terms of specifying students' current needs in relation to goals, feeding back on the process and results as well as feeding forward towards achieving the goals.

out of 125 that dealt specifically with a students' perspective as one of the players in assessment (Lundahl, 2017). A general observation is that there is a lack of empirical studies on feedback as an interactional process of feedback-making as opposed to information processing and transfer.

This literature review successively considers three main lines of research on feedback-making, focusing on student perception of feedback, student participation in feedback, and modes of feedback. The studies reported below illuminate selected aspects of feedback that emphasise its interactional and relational qualities, shaping how students make meaning of feedback.

3.5.2 Studies on Student Perception of Feedback

This section starts by highlighting results from two studies on compulsory education (older grades) and then proceeds to studies on VET. In a focus group study with 13- to 14-year-old students in New Zealand, Peterson and Irving (2008) investigated how students perceived the overall purpose and impact of assessment and feedback. The students generally saw feedback as help for monitoring their learning progress, preferably through grades. However, they rejected feedback that they "perceived as unfair, less than totally honest, not important for later life, or if it did not contain a grade" (Peterson & Irving, 2008, p. 243). This indicates wide scope for students' subjective interpretations. The students generally did not perceive feedback originating in self- and peer-assessment as legitimate. Thus, Peterson and Irving (2008) conclude that young students may not value feedback from student-led informal assessment or feedback that refers to a poor or no grade.

In a small-scale focus group study, Swedish 7th grade students were broadly asked what classroom assessment meant to them as support for learning (Gyllander Torkildsen & Ericson, 2016). Some students perceived teacher feedback as apparently incongruent with the grade awarded, e.g., praising only the effort made by students (cf. Peterson & Irving, 2008), worded in and recycling ready-made formulations from the curriculum. They also expected feedback to assist them in securing "good" grades by helping them to eliminate errors.

"Assessment information" (feedback) in Norwegian upper secondary schools has been studied by Havnes et al. (2012) with a particular focus on vocational training. A survey of feedback practices in relation to projects, assignments and tests revealed that students were awarded both grades and

comments, with grades being occasionally withheld until the students attended to feedback provided. A comparison of students' and teachers' perceptions showed (*inter alia*) that feedback was unanimously tied to grading by both the teachers and students.

In a focus group study with Norwegian first-year students attending the country's Programme for Health and Social Care, Sandal et al. (2014) examined the students' experience of feedback as a response to their performance and indicator of their progress. The students were asked how they related feedback to learning in workplaces. Their receptiveness to and appreciation of feedback seemed contingent on intersubjectively shared understanding, arising from immediacy of work tasks (with workplace instructors) and the teacher's actual presence in a workplace. Therefore, written comments by the teachers on student log books merely functioned as part of grading, summative assessment, hardly enhancing learning in the student's view. During workplace-based learning, however, feedback appeared for students in instruction, guidance, comments and dialogues as inherent parts of work processes. The feedback in workplaces regarding "students' behaviours, attitudes and ability to cooperate and communicate with colleagues and customers" (Sandal et al., 2014, p. 254) was seen by students as trustworthy, whereas they were practicing "communication, care, empathy and ethical considerations" (Sandal et al., 2014, p. 256). However, students wished that the feedback in workplaces also related to their learning goals at school.

Bakkevig Dagsland, Mykletun and Einarsen (2015) found a lack of positively worded and substantial feedback in interviews with apprentices in the Norwegian hospitality industry (see also Conway & Foskey, 2015)[43]. Instead, apprentices talked about instances of nagging with use of negative or impolite words and *indirect* feedback such as "looking at the watch indicating that the speed is too low" (Bakkevig Dagsland et al., 2015, p. 471). The prevalence of feedback upon completion of work and solely regarding the pace and quality levels has also been reported by industrial apprentices in earlier research (Brooker & Butler, 1997). In an interview study of apprentices in the Danish model of dual education, Tanggaard and Elmholdt (2008) point to students' view of feedback as harsh, particularly from more experienced workers, contributing to a preservation of social hierarchies between journeymen and managers in a workplace.

---

[43] Conway and Foskey studied eight apprentices in the Australian apprenticeship system.

3.5.3 Studies of Student Participation in Feedback

Relative to students and teachers involved in general school subjects at upper secondary level, Havnes et al. (2012) found that those involved in vocational training reported more student engagement with goal and criteria setting, as well as feedback, particularly peer feedback. They claimed this was "due to the vocational training component" (Havnes et al., 2012, p. 23). Regarding the utility of feedback, however, teachers' and students' views diverged. For instance, students generally paid little attention to written comments as feedback to improve their achievements. Teachers' overly optimistic view of students' use of feedback has been confirmed by Jónsson, Smith and Geirsdóttir (2018). Havnes et al. (2012, p. 23) conclude that feedback still remains "primarily an individual endeavour" (for both students and teachers). However, four classroom activities were identified as especially conducive to the generation and consideration of feedback: handing back assignments, student presentations of their projects, group work, and discussions among the teacher and students. In a workshop setting, student presentations generated feedback on students' actual work (both products and contents), while in other school subjects it mostly concerned presentation skills alone. Instruction in the workshop also encouraged students to draw spontaneously (rather than systematically) on each other as learning resources, offering additional explanations and support (cf. Vestergaard Louw, 2013).

A study focused on a Danish basic carpentry programme, by Vestergaard Louw (2013), found that feedback seamlessly integrated with teacher-directed instruction. Although he did not explicitly investigate feedback, his excerpts illustrate how teachers in a workshop enacted feedback as part of everyday interaction, impacting student (dis)engagement. For instance, teacher-led workshop lectures with students gathered around a material object (roof structure) seemed conducive to student engagement by (for instance) asking questions. With individual students the teacher feedback broke complex tasks into sequences that were manageable for the students and put them back on the right track. This is consistent with Korp's (2011, p. 28) description of teacher feedback in the Swedish Transport Programme as incremental, finely attuned to individual needs, "formative as well as affirmative". Typically, students participating in the Danish study initiated feedback by approaching the teacher for "professional consultation" (Vestergaard Louw, 2013, p. 11). Analysing their verbal interaction with the help of the feedback model formulated by

Hattie and Timperley (2007)[44], I contend that the excerpts presented by Vestergaard Louw (2013, p. 11) reveal intricacies of feedback in a seamlessly integrated flow in the workshop context. For example, two students perceived the finish of the roof to be unsatisfactory and suggested a solution. The teacher confirmed their observation but also proposed another solution, while acknowledging their skills as prospective carpenters, that is, as independent problem-solvers (cf. Korp, 2011). This mundane example of interaction in a school workshop setting displays how students and a teacher together may move feedback between task, process and self-regulation levels, while collectively relating feedback to the desired quality (feed-up), result (feed-back) and improvement (feed-forward).

Active student participation in feedback was also observed in Swedish upper secondary hairdressing classrooms by Öhman (2015). She shows how students initiated feedback *loops* as a collaborative practice of multimodal interaction between teacher and student (Öhman, 2017). Each feedback loop originated from a particular concern that a student expressed and the teacher then took up, progressing in a so-called feedback cycle (Öhman, 2017). Similarly, Korp observed feedback finely tuned to momentarily shifting needs of a prospective lorry driver, practicing advanced operations on the road (2012). Such situated feedback in close verbal interaction between vocational teacher and student initiates the student into highly specialised tricks of the trade precisely when s/he needs it most and is therefore eager to receive it. Their side by side conversation can seamlessly weave guidance with feedback, feedback dialogues serve various purposes (monitoring, correction, suggestion, and explanation) and they are difficult to clearly demarcate from teachers' verbal instruction.

Peer interaction can generate plenty of feedback, as demonstrated by Chan and Leijten (2012), who video-recorded peer learning interactions created by pairs of students in a welding course for beginners. Prior to the investigation the students were introduced to Hattie and Timperley's (2007) feedback model centred on the three focal points for feedback: *feed-up*, *feed-back* and *feed-forward*. The study shows that students' verbal interaction in a welding booth displayed the whole feedback cycle. Additionally, as students observed and practiced welding in turns, this study also shows that peer-feedback reinforced self-assessment, as the two processes converged.

---

[44] This feedback model comprises four levels: task, process, self-regulation and self. Effective feedback addresses three questions: Where am I going (Feed Up)? How am I going (Feed Back)? Where to next (Feed Forward)? (Hattie & Timperley, 2007).

In instruction of general subjects (vocational subjects were not studied) in upper secondary VET, Rosvall, Hjelmér and Lappalainen (2017, p. 9) found that feedback was "encouraging the unfocused". They contend that teachers who abstained from re-directing students' shifting attention back to the subject matter at hand did so in a misguided effort to care for and provide service to the students. Moreover, feedback they described seemed adapted to maintain and facilitate individual students' interest by minimising pressure and oversimplification. Although students seemed to engage keenly in verbal feedback exchanges with teachers, their staying in a feedback loop may have restricted learning opportunities.

Despite students' active participation in feedback, some studies point to general difficulties with engaging students in feedback as part of assessment generally and peer-assessment particularly. Notably, Jönsson et al. (2015, p. 3) show how new methods for "constructive feedback" as a strategy, e.g., scoring rubrics for self- and peer-assessment changed established practices towards perhaps fewer instances of feedback but of greater didactic quality, in terms (for example) of task-specificity. However, these feedback methods also seemed to foster among students a somewhat instrumental attitude towards feedback as a means for improving grades, that is, "fixing mentality" (Jönsson et al., 2015, p. 13). Accordingly, students I interviewed in my licentiate study (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015) seemed highly resistant to teachers' efforts to engage them in student-active assessment practices. They also strongly objected to the substitution of grades by comments (as feedback), complaining that they had to get grades in a roundabout way as straightforward ways were denied to them. As one student said: "All teachers say I don´t want to set any grade. What they want to do is write a comment. Then we have to look it up (grade) by ourselves instead" (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015, p. 83; cf. Gyllander Torkildsen & Ericson, 2016; Havnes et al., 2012; Peterson & Irving, 2008).

3.5.4 Studies of Modes of Feedback

Feedback in VET can come from multiple sources, e.g., monitoring equipment and technology, inspection of products and exchanges with customers (Bakkevig Dagsland et al., 2015; Berner, 2009; Brooker & Butler, 1997; Reegård, 2015; Tanggaard & Elmholdt, 2008). Since feedback in workplaces or school workshops originates from the need to adhere to and uphold certain levels of quality and speed, verbal feedback is often clear-cut and straightforward

"telling". However, telling may also include contradictory teacher messages from a student's perspective, e.g., exhortation to solve a problem independently rather than with a teacher's help (Vestergaard Louw, 2013) or to re-do tasks rather than offering support during work, as observed for example in a Swedish building construction programme (Fjellström, 2014).

In a study of the Swiss dual model of VET in technical trades (focusing on interactions involving first-year apprentices), Fillieattaz (2011) examined how verbal feedback was collectively and linguistically distributed, *configured* between apprentices, supervisors, experts and workers. In one workshop setting, the trainer and a supervisor elicited feedback while an apprentice promptly provided it, at the same time ratifying the previous guidance. In contrast, in another workshop setting, a different apprentice encountered sarcastic comments while getting in the crossfire between two competing messages from his supervisor and another worker (cf. Fjellström, 2014). Application of methodology from "various fields of linguistics" (Fillieattaz, 2011, p. 490) reportedly enabled a fine-grained interactional perspective, describing how feedback (as telling) in distributed guidance can both enhance and hinder learning in workplaces.

Feedback in the form of telling can also contribute to establishment of a sense of "we-ness" and belonging, as illustrated by recordings of apparently differentiated verbal teacher feedback for students of a classroom-based hairdressing programme (Klope, 2015). Students who acted like "professional" hairdressers could count on colleague-like feedback, including rapport, banter and camaraderie, while others who had yet not developed a feel for the game received feedback that either bluntly exhorted them to re-do their work or was overly "gracious", and thus insubstantial, to prevent drop-out.

Multimodal methodology has enabled studies of feedback that have shown how thinking and social relating are conflated with other modes of being, notably bodily movements (Roth, 2011, p. xi-xxxi). Brooker and Butler (1997, p. 489) draw attention to "prioperceptive feedback from hand and arm movement" in welding work. In Swedish floristry school-based education, Gåvfels (2016) found that feedback was constructed in the interaction between students, teachers and botanical materials, studied with the help of conversation analysis. Feedback captured in its multimodal richness of interplay of verbal and non-verbal resources, e.g., in the act of removing botanical material, served to school a professional vision where beauty is an epistemological stance (Gåvfels, 2016). Similarly, Öhman and Tanner (2017) found in a hairdressing classroom

that feedback from hand-eye coordination (cf. Brooker & Butler, 1997) gave access to material, tacit, spatial and temporal occupational standards. Moreover, multimodal resources (e.g., verbal silence by the teacher) allowed a student to take to the floor (Öhman & Tanner, 2017), showing feedback as a form of negotiation for shared understanding (cf. Sandal et al., 2014).

3.6 Conclusion

In sum, research on vocational becoming as "integration of thinking, acting and knowing" (de Bruijn, 2012, p. 651-652) through a lens of student experience is underrepresented. Vocational becoming as a project of young students trying out commitments, cast "against a background of their own existential realities" (Phillips, 1995, p.7) has been particularly scarcely researched. This lack of attention to what might be described as student voice has left a void in research, possibly contributing to one-sidedness of the account of vocational becoming.

Vocational working-class students are also often presented in research one-sidedly as a homogenous group (Brockmann, 2010; but see Hill, 1995) and sometimes as "destined" for what are described as thoroughfare/transit jobs (Ulfsdotter Eriksson & Flisbäck, 2011). Such an approach restricts opportunities for a fuller account of student agency in vocational becoming, perhaps tending to emphasise acculturation and socialisation as driving mechanisms. In contrast, an approach rooted in the concept of generalising knowing, as adopted in this thesis and the underlying studies, may provide deeper insights into students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming. Thus, the thesis may contribute to understanding of the dependence of students' vocational becoming on their handling of the interplay between situative (particular, localised) knowing and knowing that is "abstract" (canonic, codified) or possibly just more detached from their immediate experience (cf. Vygotskij, 1934).

This one-sidedness of existing research on vocational becoming has implications for vocational teachers' practices, e.g., feedback. Previous research has shown that students generally experience feedback as an individualistic matter tied with grading and grade justification, although some studies have found greater student engagement in feedback beyond simply receiving. As evidenced, such a view may encourage students to adopt an instrumental attitude to feedback from a feedback recipient position. Confronted with the unfamiliarity of VET to students, they depend on teacher-led feedback for

assurance that they are on the right track for their vocational becoming. This calls for more research on how students in contexts providing limited contact with working life experience their engagement in feedback with teachers, workplace instructors and peers grounded in their "shared understanding of the meaning" (Sandal et al., 2014, p. 246).

Research on vocational becoming that inadvertently underestimates the importance of student agency may also underestimate the reciprocity of feedback as a mutual concern for students and teachers (Sadler, 1989), unhelpfully reinforcing students' position as receivers. Although vocational identity formation is a widely acknowledged goal of vocational education, de Bruijn (2012, p. 651) argues that vocational teachers are not sure and less specific about how to use it as "a unitive framework for fostering learning" beyond simply role-modelling. Klotz et al. (2014) claim that despite the salience of matters of vocational identity in vocational education, factors that contribute to its formation, and conversely aspects of vocational identity formation that support and strengthen vocational performance, are not clear. Thus, further studies on students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming are required. This thesis contributes to understanding of an important aspect of vocational becoming that appears to have received relatively little attention, i.e., young students' construction of their experienced curriculum. My intention is to present a more resourceful collective account of student agency as exerted in the construction of experienced curriculums of vocational becoming for service work. Providing a student account of vocational becoming in school-based education is a much needed first step towards making vocational becoming a unitive framework for teachers to enhance learning.

My overview shows that very few studies have investigated how students engage in feedback as collective meaning-making, and the contribution of this engagement in the open-ended transformational process of vocational becoming. Thus, there is a gap in the understanding of feedback beyond notions of its role in information delivery, as a strategy, its utility and efficacy. This thesis contributes to research on feedback from an alternative perspective to the dominant position rooted in "means-and-goal philosophy", in accordance with recommendations by Forsberg and Lindberg (2010, p. 6). Identification of the gap raises two questions that warrant further consideration. First, what articulations of students' experience of vocational becoming can be identified in education and training aimed at people-centred service occupations? Second, in what ways does the contribution of feedback-making shape young students'

vocational becoming? Thus, the thesis addresses a major research gap, by explicitly adopting a perspective focused on students' experienced curriculum and its role in feedback-mediated vocational becoming (cf. Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015).

4 Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework laid out here builds on insights from both Dewey (1916/1999, 1938/1946; Dewey & Deen, 2012) and Vygotskij (1997/1926, 1934, 1933/1934/2001), arguing that combining these insights is highly advantageous for understanding how young students experience vocational becoming. This framework includes a three-layer foundation, explicated in the three subsequent Subsections 4.1, 4.2 and 4.3. The foundation is operationalised through a generative and dialectic principle of the zone of proximal development, described in Subsection 4.4. Then, in Subsection 4.5 a toolbox of four analytical concepts is presented that completes the theoretical framework of the thesis and enables me to flesh out my empirical findings in the four appended articles. The toolbox comprises the two core concepts, experienced curriculum (Billett, 2006) and feedback-making, supplemented by vocationalising concepts and learner readiness. Through progression of my use of analytical concepts in the articles, I can advance theorising on student experience of vocational becoming.

4.1 *Periezhivanie* as a Concept for Analysis of Experiencing

The Russian concept *periezhivanie* forms the first layer of my understanding of student experience of vocational becoming as an activity of experiencing (Vasil′juk, 1991)[45]. Periezhivanie offers some additional nuances of meaning that are often lost when translated into English (experience) or Swedish (erfarenhet). Three that are applied here are as follows:

1. Periezhivanie as living and working *through* a situation,
2. Periezhivanie as a *collective* prism of viewing a situation,
3. The reciprocity and dynamics of periezhivanie as creating opportunities to learn (via a social situation of development), while being created by shifting social situations of development.

---

[45] Переживание (in the singular) and переживания (in the plural).

Through emphasis on experience as an activity of experiencing, the function and purpose of feedback-making is also emphasised in contrast to experience as introspective reflection and contemplation.

Partly building on ideas introduced by Vygotskij (1933/1934/2001)[46], Vasil′juk (1991) regards experiencing. i.e., periezhivanie, as work to cope and achieve control in a situation of life-transforming crises. However, I suggest that periezhivanie can also be extended to more fully describe students' experience of vocational becoming as a critical life-changing situation. Students' quest for finding sustainable ways to be, their trying out of commitments and revision of earlier goals that I have already described all imply a struggle capturing careers-in-progress (cf. Phillips, 1995). Experiencing vocational becoming requires students to face and subject themselves to a transition that they must work through, resolve and come to terms with.

The advantage of periezhivanie as an analytical concept is its capacity to capture the multiplicity of aspects of development, e.g., developing specialised knowing (Fleer, Rey & Veresov, 2017). Thus, the concepts of periezhivanie and the social situation of development are intertwined and constitutive of each other. This interdependency does not always come to the fore when social suggestions are allowed to define what counts as a social situation of development. To illustrate this duality:

> The social development situation *itself* [emphasis added] acts as a special social space that ensures a child's development. Vygotsky noted that the social development situation was determined by a system of social conditions that the adult organized when interacting with the child. (Säljö & Veraksa, 2018, p. 17)

In my understanding, this interdependence means that the social situation of development shifts according to collective periezhivanie in the same way as such a collective periezhivanie defines what situation counts as developmental. Thus, breaking apart the social situation of development and periezhivanie is not helpful as they are part of a system that enables development:

> Social environment was examined by Vygotsky as the source of development, rather than as one of its factors. It is important to note that the social environment does not exist in separation from the concrete subjects and that the concrete subjects cannot be sufficiently conceptualized in isolation from

---

[46] Vygotskij introduced this concept early in his writings and returned to it in the final stage of his work. For an informative account of how this concept was received by Soviet and western audiences, see Rey & Mitjáns Martínez (2016).

their social environment. From this perspective, the concept of periezhivanie is an attempt to overcome *the subjectivist-objectivist gap* and *structure-agency dualism* in the field of psychology [italics in orig.]. (Dafermos, 2018, p. 182-183)

To explicate student experience this thesis also utilises the concepts of individual and environmental transactionality, as applied in ontological frameworks of Dewey (Dewey & Deen, 2012) and Vygotskij (1933/1934/2001). Dewey's principle of experiential continuum forms an overarching theoretical framework for understanding student experience (Dewey, 1938/1946). Students' activity of experiencing entails them being impacted by life events as well as their continuous reflection on the consequences and implications of these life events. So, students' activity of experiencing vocational becoming amounts to an ongoing cycle of interplay between a passive (being impacted by) and active (impact-making) elements of the activity of experiencing. Students' agency is foregrounded by Dewey in their individual ways to shape the environment through these active and passive elements of the activity of experiencing with the help of language. Language for Dewey (1916/1999) serves the purpose of communication (as a democratic life form), but is not further elaborated beyond its pragmatic functionality for the individual, e.g., as a means (tool) for reflection. However, for Vygotskij (1934), experience always arises from communication, e.g., feedback-making, between its more and less knowledgeable participants, e.g., teachers, instructors and students. For Vygotskij, language plays a central role of structuring and re-structuring thought, whereas the word finalises the thought (1934). In Vygotskij's later writings he expands this instrumental and intellectual role of language for experiencing, from a mediatory role into a more encompassing function of assisting individuals to orient themselves in affective-bodily and intellectual ways (i.e., periezhivania) towards collective fields of meanings (Roth & Jornet, 2017). In sum, Dewey's theory of experiencing (Dewey, 1938/1946) is a useful starting point for understanding students' experience as periezhivanie, but does not account for cultural-historical contingencies of this experience as a collective transformation.

Here I would like to acknowledge a possible conflict when combining insights from Vygotskij and Dewey. They frame the pedagogical relation differently, building on different assumptions, dialectically and dialogically, respectively. For instance, Dewey sees pedagogical relations as open quests for

intersubjectivity while for Vygotskij such relations are basically asymmetrical[47]. In a dialogical view on meaning-making, which I apply in this thesis, meaning arises in spaces between the already said and what is to come, that is, meanings arise from differences as always present. A dialectical view stresses instead differences to be overcome. For Wegerif (2008), these two assumptions cannot be synthesised as they are fundamentally incompatible.

Next, I turn attention to the second layer of my theoretical foundation in the thesis by elaborating the concept of experienced curriculum.

4.2 Experienced Curriculum

The concept of experienced curriculum (Goodlad, 1979; Schubert, 2008), forming another layer of the theoretical foundation, is useful for capturing vocational becoming from a students' perspective. The basic idea conveyed by curriculum is the course (Latin: *currere*) of experiences to be offered to students in educational institutions. However, it has also been extended to learning in workplaces. A rudimentary workplace curriculum is a sequence of tasks that form a track of experiences on offer, which may vary across workplace settings (Billett, 2006). This term is grounded in Dewey's ideas of the experiential base of all education (Dewey, 1916/1999). It also derives from a shift towards a conceptualisation of curriculum as a practical, thus unpredictable as opposed to formal, prescriptive matter in education:

> Theories of curriculum and of teaching and learning cannot, alone, tell us what and how to teach, because questions of what and how to teach arise in concrete situations loaded with concrete particulars of time, place, person, and circumstance. (Schwab, 1978, p. 322)

Phillips (1995) describes the experienced curriculum of a vocational project as a quest open to self-discovery. He uses the word "project" to emphasise all the "tentative explorations" through which young people "seek meaning in an uncertain and complex world against a background of their own existential realities" (Phillips, 1995, p. 7):

---

[47] For Vygotskij embryonic forms of present understanding, e.g., students', are replaced by more developed (*ideal*) forms provided through the social situation of development (Dafermos, 2018).

> Their notions of self, developed at school and in the home with family and friends, have now to be revised and adapted in the greater cause of vocational discovery and personal survival. (Phillips, 1995, p. 9)

So, the experienced curriculum that guides students' vocational becoming is about working out ways to first discover "personal articulations" (Phillips, 1995, p. 8) and integrate them in sustainable ways with demands set by educators and working life. Young people's work on and with personal articulations concerns an imagined and expected fit between what one is as opposed to what one ought to be.

In a similar transactional vein[48], when evaluating and critiquing the experienced curriculum concept, Barone (1980) proposes that formal curriculum intentions should be completely bypassed:

> A discussion of the experienced curriculum does not consist of an examination of a set of plans or of chosen materials; it is a critique of the manner in which students apparently perceive various *aspects of classroom situations and events, and of how they respond to, and help shape, those situations and events* (emphasis added). (Barone, 1980, p. 30)

Billett also considers the notion of the experienced curriculum, and proposes a model rooted in the *learning curriculum* (2011) emerging from an ontogenetic, personal and individual pathway of experiences (for a similar line of inquiry see also Thornton Moore, 2004).

> The experienced curriculum is what students experience when they engage with what is enacted, regardless of whether this is what was planned and intended. (Billett, 2011, p.194)

So far, I have presented several definitions of experienced curriculum. They all stress emergent and contingent qualities of student experience. They also emphasise its distinctive qualities, that is: vocational and existential self-discovery (Philips, 1995); a critique of individual/environment transaction in classroom setting (Barone, 1980); students' participation in what is enacted (Billett, 2011). Building on these insights I propose to recast understandings of experienced curriculum from subjective acts of negotiations towards agentic processes of collective transformation.

---

48 Experience is perceived as an interactive process of the needs of people and the press of their environment to act upon and shape each other (Barone, 1980).

Next, I present Vygotskij's thoughts on agency as grounded in culturally, historically and collaboratively formed material practices (Vygotskij, van der Veer & Valsiner, 1994). I also explain his concept of the zone of proximal development (ZPD) as a mechanism for vocational becoming as transformation. A caveat on reading works by Vygotskij is needed here due to several difficulties (Valsiner & van der Veer, 2000; Yasnitsky, 2010)[49]. My reading of Vygotskij's work is mostly based on selected interpreters, for instance, Wolff-Michael Roth, Ronald Miller, Jan Derry and Fernando Gonzáles Rey, along with some, admittedly limited and highly selective texts in Russian, i.e., *Myshlenie i rec* from 1934[50] (van der Veer & Yasnitsky, 2011) and his *Лекции по педологии* [Lektsii pa pedologii], 1933/1934/2001.

4.3 Students' Agency

Recognition of agency exercised by students forms the third layer of the theoretical foundation of the thesis. Thus, students' agency, as transformative social practice, is explained and fitted into the theoretical framework of experiencing as activity adopted here.

Vygotskij situated human agency in individuals' agentic powers to act upon the world. To him, human agency (consciousness) is material as it is semiotically mediated through symbolic tools. These tools (e.g., language as systems of signs or clothes, e.g., a security officer's uniform) are cultural (therefore social)[51], and thus changeable formations. His concept of agency transcends the individual and agency can also be ascribed to groups of individuals. Holland and Lachicotte emphasise the generalised (social) others providing cultural resources (artefacts) to negotiate with and apply to oneself:

> The ability to organize oneself in the name of an identity, according to a
> Vygotskian perspective, develops as one transacts cultural artefacts with

---

49 His original legacy seems largely distorted for various reasons, e.g., fragmentary publishing (Yasnitsky, 2012), inaccessibility (but see Zavershneva, 2010) and translation (van der Veer & Yasnitsky, 2011; Veresov, 2017), resulting in "this general confusion" (Yasnitsky, 2012, p. 6). Veresov shows in particular how English rendering of perezhivanie as experience impedes its theoretical and technical understanding and usage.

50 Van der Veer and Yasnitsky (2011) point to many discrepancies between the original book from 1934 (a compilation of earlier articles) and subsequent Russian and English versions of *Thinking and Speech*.

51 Smagorinsky (2011) recommends the substitution of sociocultural by cultural as the latter encompasses sociality in two meanings; societal as in institutional orders/structures and social as related to groups of people.

others and then, at some point, applies the cultural resources to oneself. (Holland & Lachicotte, 2007, p. 113)

Additionally, the tools individuals use are embedded in historical, cultural and institutional settings rather than resting with the individual. As argued here, the material circumstances of becoming security officers (as an example of materialised service work) are shaped by efforts to pedagogise occupational knowing to fit in the framework of upper secondary school. Although agency originates in social practices, it is the individual who both transforms and is transformed by those practices. Human agency is thus situated in the interface between the individual and the collectivity[52].

Building on Vygotsky's work, Stetsenko (2016, p. 214) emphasises that people as "collectividuals" exert agency by positioning themselves towards a desirable future. Thus, students exercise agency as they take a stance on social practices they participate in as opposed to simply reproducing existing orders. Basically, young students exert agency by collaboratively "moving beyond the status quo" (Stetsenko, 2016, p. 33) as they make the future in the present, investing in the future as it ought to be as opposed to what it is[53] in their quest for self-discovery. Readying themselves for a vocational career involves young students struggling to work out what end-points are worth striving for (to become a personal trainer for instance) as well as working out and making necessary commitments to imagined futures under way.

Stetsenko emphasises the transformativity inherent in social practices as opposed to seeing them merely as processes of adaption to the given via participation (cf. Lave & Wenger, 1991; Wenger, 1998). From this point of view, students exercise agency by transforming the cultural-historical practices of vocational becoming through their experienced curriculum.

Having explained the three layers of the thesis' theoretical foundation, I next consider a generative mechanism that binds these three layers together. The ZPD proposed here as such a generative mechanism works through the student experienced curriculum of vocational becoming as a dialectic movement of expansion of meanings.

---

[52] Vygotskij's ideas about human agency as a catalyst for change are aligned with his participation in the building of new societal orders, following the revolution in the early days of the Soviet Union. However, his view on human agency was also influenced by Spinoza's thoughts on human agency as rational and directed by striving to persevere in existence. For an account of education in the light of Spinoza, see Dahlbeck (2016); for an account of traces of Spinoza's thought in Vygotskij's later writing, see Roth and Jornet (2017).

[53] A central Marxist idea.

4.4 The Zone of Proximal Development

The concept of the zone of proximal development (ZPD) is used to explain how students construct and expand sense-making of their experienced curriculum of vocational becoming. ZPD brings in dialectic dynamics that reconcile students' sense-making based on everyday commonsensical knowing with specialised knowing.

The ZPD[54], coined by Vygotskij (1934), refers to a possible and emergent, but not realised, range of human development (Chaiklin, 2003). For Vygotskij, human development is headed by learning (through instruction) and therefore can be expanded by certain cultural resources, e.g., prompts and clues or assistance from more knowledgeable others. Notably, these resources are applied through communication. ZPD offers a largely metaphorical tool to explore learning (here: vocational becoming) as "ripening" and gradual enrichment of ways to know[55].

As noted by Valsiner and van der Veer (1999, p. 14-16), ZPD is not directly accessible and only its (possible) effects, that is, ZPD in its finalised form, can be empirically investigated. However, the finalised form clearly becomes antonymous to the proximal and potential. Thus, students' knowing in the present remains hidden from investigation as ZPD recasts the timeline of, e.g., assessment and feedback. Through ZPD the present only reflects the possible future, but as if seen in hindsight. This is problematic when related to assessment because it places the focus of assessment in that indiscernible and potential future of which we may at best speculate, whereas that which we have access to is only the now of an assessment moment. So, through ZPD the now is transformed into the future, though seen in hindsight for the purpose of assessment. As the timelines of the actual now and the potential in the future (though "frozen" as the past) diverge, the validity of assessment may be compromised. Gazing into the future, empirically so to speak, through the use of ZPD, makes us lose contact with the only thing we can deal with (because

---

[54] Зона ближашево развития

[55] In his seminal work and possibly his legacy, *Myshlenie i rec*, Vygotskij metaphorically scorns a foolish gardener who assesses an upcoming harvest only on the basis of the fruit already ripened. This underscores Vygotskij's use of ZPD mostly as a rhetoric device in discussions with other contemporary scholars (Valsiner & van der Veer, 1999).

we cannot reverse time), that is, the present[56]. Through ZPD, we lose track of the present, hunting the future about which we can only, at best, speculate:

> Here is the paradox that stands in the way of empirical use of Vygotsky's ZPD concept: It refers to the hidden processes of the present that may become explicated in reality only as the present becomes the (nearest) past, while the (nearest) future becomes the present. (Valsiner & van der Veer, 1999, p.15)

The issue of assistance by more knowledgeable others, e.g., peers and adults, poses difficulty as it is not empirically possible to prove how it may improve an individual's learning. Therefore, we cannot tell whether or not aid given by peers will have the same effects as assistance from any other source. Assistance by peers through feedback may or may not expand learning (here: vocational becoming) as much (or less) than teacher assistance through feedback. Thus, the general notion of assistance by more knowledgeable others may not be sufficient to distinguish assistance that is needed, or more strictly (in the context of this thesis) feedback that may help or hinder vocational becoming.

4.5 Analytical Concepts and Their Interrelationships in the Appended Articles

The four analytical concepts (the experienced curriculum, feedback-making, vocationalising concepts and learner readiness) collectively enable me to investigate the practically unfolding, transforming and relational reality of students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming. Next, a theoretical progression in the four articles is set out, bridging the four concepts applied in interpretation of the empirical data presented and considered in the four articles.

Article 1 introduces the concept of feedback-making as students' collective meaning-making, which is further explored in Articles 2-4. Thus, the focus on feedback as an activity of experiencing involved in sense-making through interaction has been maintained throughout the empirical studies underlying this thesis. Additionally, Lemar's (2001) notion of pedagogical all-round competence is used to explain the difficulty of assessing vocational knowing as

---

[56] However, from a dialectic Hegelian perspective, adopted by Vygotskij, development always encompasses the past, the present and the future (see the metaphor of the triple spiral in Dafermos, 2018, p. 169).

it is based on *pedagogised* knowing, whereas relations in a student group serve as both the goal to be assessed and a means to achieve that goal in instruction. Therefore, for example, feedback-making in the Child & Recreation Programme appears steeped in assessment practices that foreground vocational (specialised) knowing as malleable or fuzzy (Article 3).

In Article 2, the notion of workplace curriculum is used to investigate how students make sense, through feedback-making, of their progression in workplace-based learning that shapes their vocational becoming. The concept of experienced curriculum, introduced in Article (2), is a liminal, that is, in-between site for activity at the intersection of intended and enacted dimensions of workplace curriculum. Thus, an experienced curriculum is contingent on the two dimensions, possibly interlocking to some extent, simultaneously enabling students to engage in a range of independent actions that strongly influence vocational becoming. Students re-formulate, negotiate, reject, re-interpret, choose how to respond and eventually respond accordingly, fulfilling a certain rationality motivating their actions. In these ways, students collectively exercise agency. Interviews reported in Article 2 indicate that contingency is a feature of students' experienced curriculum as this curriculum of vocational becoming does not appear haphazardly, in "anything goes" fashion. Students responding in such a manner cause intelligible effects that further influence their vocational becoming. Such striving is mitigated by their efforts to align themselves with (ever-present) cultural and historical patterns maintained and manifested by significant others they relate to during workplace-based learning. This gradual orientation allows for plasticity of responses in alignment with certain *sense-giving fields* (Roth & Jornet, 2017), e.g., customer care and in a collective fashion rather than as an individual's negotiation with social suggestions (cf. Billett, 2011).

Article 3 explains the process of vocationalising concepts using Vygotskij's ZPD. Vocationalised concepts capture students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming in terms of generalising knowing. They also offer a model for restructuring generality through experiencing a dialectic movement between everyday and specialised understanding. For example, participating students training to be security officers generalised knowing of surveillance law as a tool for (highly specialised) action as well as a means for practicing (commonsensical school group work-directed) attunement to others (Articles 3 & 4). As in Article 2, a concept of liminal space is applied, i.e., a *space of reasons* (Brandom, 2000), a communal *site* to be temporarily *inhabited* by those who participate in instruction (teachers, students, instructors).

Initiation into a space of reasons enables students to participate in cultural-historical practices (security officer-specific in the focal setting) of giving and asking for reasons. Students and instructors collectively create and share a space of reasons at the interface of students' prior understandings (Miller, 2011). Therefore, students' sense-making builds on bodily/affective and intellectual rationality, contributing to a transformation of practices (security officer-specific in this case) as cultural-historical. Moreover, this communal space of reasons establishes a normative context for what can rationally be expected so that reciprocity in feedback-making is maintained. For example, students' experienced curriculum of becoming security officers features various forms of accountability and customer care. Accordingly, feedback-making analysed in Articles 3 and 4 appears embedded in a cultural-historical web of relationships, e.g., between the security industry and its customers or representatives of closely associated branch industries (e.g., the police). Thus, students' experienced curriculum of becoming security officers builds on reciprocity in a space of reasons that instructors initiate students to and together with them maintain. Such reciprocity of feedback helps students to catch the commonsensical meaning of a word in a net of inferences, temporarily fixing its meaning in relation to other words that are rationally justified in the context of cultural-historical and security-specific occupational practices. Thus, a space of reasons enables students who are progressing in their vocational becoming to locate things, that is, to catch concepts, e.g., the uniform, in patterns (grids) for action, e.g., "accomplishing" the uniform, that is, properly dressing (in the appropriate uniform). This reciprocity of feedback creates certain points of entry into vocational becoming within a space of reasons.

In Article 4, the concept of learner readiness is used to explain how vocational becoming relies on collectively attributed, developmental capacities of groups. For example, the experienced curriculum of vocational becoming of students training for work in the service sector features and emphasises attunement to service recipients' needs. However, this attunement also depends on students' collective sense of learner readiness to recognise peer assessment as part of the vocational knowing they are developing. The starting position of the construction of the experienced curriculum of vocational becoming for most student participants in the empirical studies was solely as a recipient when dealing with feedback in school- and workplace-based learning (Article 1). Moving away from the recipient-only-position to attunement to others marks a transformation that supports vocational becoming for service work.

Learner readiness is interconnected with my notion of vocationalising concepts. Thus, these two concepts seem interdependent in that they both constitute students' progression in vocational becoming. Here, too, Vygotskij's ZPD can explain this interdependency. The current level of learner readiness expands, facilitated by feedback as the unity of giving and receiving, but does so only to a certain point or within a certain range. For further expansion, certain conceptual thresholds must be overcome, e.g., accomplishing requirements in terms of demeanour and wearing of the uniform, which students may access through feedback-making. Therefore, learner readiness as students' receptiveness for new learning has a dynamic and transformational value that they collectively experience in their efforts to become (for example) security officers.

In observed interactions and interviews reported in Article 4, students who were supported by and actively engaged with feedback-making orchestrated by instructors speedily transcended their current level of learner readiness with respect to surveillance law. Such expansion of learner readiness enables students to develop a security officer's vocational stance. By adopting such a vocational stance, students orient themselves towards a significant sense-giving field (Roth & Jornet, 2017) in several ways: bodily, affectively and intellectually.

Article 4 fleshes out the concept of students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming as a transactional matter, treating the experience of vocational becoming as a filtering of the social situation of development (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001) through a subjective and collective prism. This process of refraction explains how the same collectively shared situation offers different opportunities for individuals' development but may also enhance a collective process of expansion of learner readiness.

5 Method

The method applied in the empirical studies was qualitative, centring on a students' perspective (Holloway & Todres, 2003) of vocational becoming as an open-ended and collectively achieved project. Adopting a quasi-ethnographic approach (Shipway & Jones, 2007, p. 375) has enabled me to explore students' experience of vocational becoming in educational settings (Burgess, 2006). The choice of combining focus group interviews with observations was guided by my intention to contextually ground and provide vitality, materiality and concreteness to my examination of students' experience of vocational becoming. I deemed the combination of observations and focus group methodology consistent (e.g., for epistemological claims) and appropriate (Holloway & Todres, 2003) for my purpose.

The research design evolved gradually (Burgess, 2006), building on a focus group interview study here referred to as Study One (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). Broadly speaking, I set out to explore student experience of vocational becoming through a lens of assessment practices in the context of a chiefly school-based vocational programme. Later, my focus shifted from broad assessment to specific feedback-making practices in the context of VET for prospective security officers (Study Two).

This chapter is structured to explain how Studies One and Two address my general goal to produce an account of student experience of vocational becoming that is based on students' first-hand experiences and hence on meanings that students ascribe to lived-through situations (Beach, 2005). Such an emic approach[57] entails a focus on students' perspective throughout all the research stages (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2011). This chapter continues by presenting the overall design of the studies and the methodology applied in each part. Then two validity criteria are introduced and further elaborated in relation to the applied methods. A discussion on the reflexive role of the researcher and some concluding remarks on method validity are followed by a discussion of data analysis validity. The chapter concludes with a discussion of ethical issues.

---

[57] In contrast to etic (as in "phonetic"), which refers to a more detached view of social reality under study, for instance by identifying given and pre-defined concepts (Beach, 2005) or patterns (Cohen et al., 2011).

5.1 Overall Design

This subsection provides an overview of the research design, incorporating data from Studies One and Two. The first two appended articles (1 and 2) draw on data from Study One, while Articles 3 and 4 draw on data from Study Two. The research comprises both focus group interviews and participant observations in naturalistic settings of a vocational programme in 12 upper secondary schools in Sweden. In total, 104 students (71 girls and 33 boys) participated in the research. Most of the students (89) were second-graders and the others (15) were third-graders. Table 4 provides an overview of the data.

Table 4 Summary Overview of the Data

Type of data	Primary data	Secondary data
Study One, 2012-2013 Focus group interviews	Transcripts of 13 interviews with 70 students in total	Summary of interviews with teachers
Study Two, 2016 Participant observations Focus group interviews	Fieldnotes from ca. 90 hours of observations Transcripts of audio-recordings of instruction Transcripts of focus group interviews with 22 students in total	Teaching & learning materials Syllabi Interviews with teachers and instructors

5.2 Setting the Scene for Study One

My participation in a Research School in the Pedagogy of Vocational Subjects gave me an opportunity to investigate how students, halfway through their education, perceived and experienced the assessment of vocational knowing, as presented in a licentiate thesis (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). Focus group methodology appeared well suited for my investigation, which coincided with the then recent introduction of a new upper secondary school reform (Skolverket, 2011). This reform was at that time still in progress since the first cohort of affected students were halfway through their education.

5.2.1 Study One

Between December 2012 and May 2013, I carried out 13 focus group interviews with 70 second-grade students (54 girls and 16 boys) in total. They were then about 17 years of age and were attending 10 schools in western Sweden. The 70 students who participated in this study were members of the first cohort of students following the introduction of the upper secondary school reform mentioned above (Skolverket, 2011). The students' schools were selected on the basis of convenience of access, coverage of the three orientations of the Child & Recreation Programme (Pedagogical Work, Social Work, and Recreation & Health) and students' previous participation in workplace-based learning[58]. Durations of the 13 focus group interviews, each with five or six participants, varied between about 60 and 90 minutes. Students were contacted through their teachers, who helped to set up the groups for interviews carried out in the vicinity of their classrooms. Information about the aim of the study was provided in advance in writing and verbally supplemented before the interviews. Few students had read the information beforehand. A detailed description of my use of focus group interviews is provided in Wyszynska Johansson (2015): "The interviews were carried out with the help of an interview guide consisting of open questions and presented to the students as a mind map (Thomsson, 2010; Halkier, 2010; Kitzinger, 1995). The interview guide was based on interviews with teachers of BF [the Child and Recreation Programme] prior to the investigation. All the interviews were transcribed according to 2nd level of transcription (Linell, 1994), resulting in approximately 200 pages of Word document" (p. 136).

The mind-mapping in Study One covered four areas: What is it like to learn an occupation in school and in a workplace? What does the teacher/supervisor assess? How do you know what is required of you? How does feedback work for you in vocational subjects? All the interviews were audio-recorded and transcribed verbatim, paying attention to repetitions, false starts and emotional expressions, e.g., laughter or irony (Linell, 1994).

5.3 Setting the Scene for Study Two

In Study One, I interviewed a group of five security officers-to-be who had not yet undertaken a required period of workplace-based learning with a security

---

[58] However, 10 of the 70 students had not yet experienced workplace-based learning at the time of the interview.

company. However, they looked forward to it, clearly taking pride in becoming a trustworthy citizen role model in the service of others. A finding of Study One was that concerns with social skills and social conduct were important to the students I had interviewed. Unfortunately, I did not have opportunities to contact these students again after their work-placement. However, back then I decided to pursue my interest in upper secondary student experience of becoming security officers, and more specifically assessment of vocational knowing oriented towards this kind of service occupation. I assumed that the recent addition of the security officer as an occupational outcome had entailed extension of the programme's traditionally pedagogised knowing into novel work areas.

Subsequently, in October 2015, I approached the Security Industry and Working Environment Committee (Bevakningsbranschens Yrkes- och Arbetsmiljönämnd, henceforth BYA) to obtain access to student security-officers-to-be in the Swedish security industry (Appendix B). I specifically asked for help to contact six or seven third grade Child & Recreation Programme students during their work-placement in a security industry setting in western Sweden. I originally intended to shadow these students for 10 days spread across a period of several months. Despite BYA's initial positive response, its approval was eventually withdrawn[59]. However, I was advised to contact a teacher working in a school (hereafter School A) that BYA recommended as a model school, an example of successful collaboration between upper secondary school and the industry. Thus, the choice of School A was strategic. Having contacted the teacher, I was invited to attend two courses, one second grade and the other third grade, for security officers-to-be. Accordingly, permission to carry out observations was obtained from the headteacher (Appendix C).

Geographical constraints limited the time available for my planned observations, but I was still resolved to include observations of older students in the second half of their education. Therefore, for practical reasons I chose to observe third grade lessons during one whole day per week spread during a 7-week period in spring 2016. Similarly, I restricted my observations of second grade lessons to one day per week during a 7-week period between March and April in 2016[60].

---

59 The reason for withdrawing approval communicated to me was that a refugee crisis was increasing pressure on the industry.
60 Two whole days during the period mentioned were excluded for practical reasons.

Since my planned days in the field had to be restricted to a total of five over a 7-week period in School A, I also contacted another school that also offered security officer training. The selected school (School B) was a convenience sample, as it was geographically easily accessible. After an initial contact with the headteacher of School B, I was referred to a teacher who had overall responsibility for the training. Shortly after this I had a personal meeting with two teachers who were involved in the training of security officers-to-be (Appendix D). It was agreed that I would shadow a mixed group of second and third grade students who were about to start a Diploma project course. Two sessions (lessons) per week during the entire spring term of 2016 were timetabled for the course. Accordingly, it was agreed that my stay in the field would be limited to one 90-minute session per week during the whole spring term of 2016, except holidays. Thus, I was offered an opportunity to do fieldwork spread over a whole school term, centred on one course, the Diploma project.

5.3.1 Study Two

Study Two of security-officers-to-be was a further development of Study One. The data in Study Two were collected from ca. 90 hours of classroom observations with a total of 34 second and third grade students and five focus group interviews with 22 Child & Recreation Programme students (Table 5).

Table 5 Overview of data collected in Study Two

	Type of data			
	Observation		Focus group interview	
	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grade 2	Grade 3
School A	8 school days* March-May	3 school days March-April	1	2
Number of students	5	5	4**	5
School B	Mixed grade-group, year 2 & 3, 21 occasions February-May 12.00–13.30		May 1	April 1
Number of students	14	10	6	7
Total: Students	34***		22	
Total: Time	Ca 92 hours		Ca 4,5 hours	

*Between ca. 8.00 and 15.30

**Including equal numbers of girls and boys (17). One girl in School A, a second-grader, did not give consent to participation in observations, but later chose to participate in a focus group interview.

***Including the girl who declined to participate in observation.

Study Two was conducted between February and May 2016 at two upper secondary schools. The empirical material collected consists mainly of fieldnotes and transcribed interviews as well as transcripts of lesson sequences.

On the first occasion I met students in both schools I explained the focus of my study, that is, their view of what vocational knowing is needed to become a security officer (Appendix E). The ethical rules on confidentiality, anonymity and the right to withdraw were presented. No questions relevant to the research were asked. In School B, one of the teachers then explained that the Diploma project course I was going to observe was intended to test a new course design, mixing students from two grades (second and third) and introducing an authentic, and thus "real" work order coming from a customer in charge of an international fair. Thus, the Diploma project, she explained, was intended to be an experiment with an unknown outcome, which my presence as a researcher underscored.

Participatory observations of lessons were documented by fieldnotes (Hammersley & Atkinson, 2007). In re-writing fieldnotes I was inspired by Delamont (2008), clearly separating direct quotations and utterances meant to capture with the greatest fidelity possible what participants said. Therefore, attempts to record direct citations were made throughout the course of the fieldwork. In accordance with my overall goal to capture the richness of observed interactions I adopted a loosely structured observational scheme. More specifically, my observations focused on the following concerns:

- What is the set task?
- How is the task at hand justified to be related to the occupation?
- How is the task at hand related to workplace-based learning with a security company?
- How do teachers, students and instructors justify the need to address the task at hand?
- What student behaviour is encouraged and by whom?
- Where is knowing situated? In everyday knowing, security officers' community of practice, written materials, vocational subjects?
- How and by whom is occupationally specific knowing spoken of?

The observations were recorded continuously on a computer, but from different positions. In School A I sat on my own in a row behind the students while in School B I sat in a circle following one of the three (mixed-grade) groups at a time, rotating each lesson, though I zoomed out my attention whenever the instruction addressed the whole class. Sometimes I put questions to the students for clarification at suitable times during the lessons or recesses. Usually I was left alone but sometimes I was asked for comments or asked to join in and leave the computer behind. During recesses I also pursued further collection of secondary data, putting questions to the teachers and instructors. In addition, I collected data from secondary sources, including coursebooks, syllabi and other artefacts that the students encountered during their schooldays.

The fieldnotes were re-written directly after they were made to maximise the ability to place direct citations in their observed context. Re-writing field notes as soon as they were made enabled me to elaborate the recalled and recorded data, expanding all the abbreviations and furtive notes into fuller recordings. In the fieldnotes all verbatim citations were clearly demarcated from other recordings (Lofland & Lofland, 1995). Re-written fieldnotes from one school day in School A generated on average 15 A4 pages of computer-written text.

Whenever practically possible, audio-recordings of instruction sequences were made. The choice of what to record was often dictated by a type of task that was clearly set for the students, such as a case to solve or a group report, often with a clear start and end. All the audio-recordings were subsequently transcribed.

Near the end of my observations I conducted focus group interviews with students (after their written exams in School A and after the third graders' course exam in School B). The re-written fieldnotes provided a source for a guide to semi-structure the focus group interviews and served as *elicited recall* (Burgess, 2006). All the interviews were carried out in school. The interviews were set towards the end of the courses to enable the students to reflect on the instruction offered as a whole.

The interview guide, which was placed strategically in front of the students gathered in a circle, was shaped as a large mind-map with a few broad questions and prompts (Thomsson, 2010), including the following examples. What does a good security officer know/think/feel and do? How does s/he communicate? What is the modern security officer like? Is security officer a technical job? How is security officer knowing special? How is a Diploma project useful for you as prospective security officers? What other Child & Recreation Programme courses are useful for you as prospective security officers? The explicit goal of my open questions was to enable a relatively open student discussion, trying to avoid interference, whenever possible. However, I provided further guidance in each interview by feeding additional and more precise questions (e.g., what is "ninja knowledge"?).

The recorded interviews lasted between 35 minutes to approximately one hour. When transcribing them, the content of interactions was the focal concern, and the language means were considered of minor importance. Therefore, sheer interaction markers, such as pauses, repetitions or non-linguistic means were omitted. However, the words were transcribed verbatim according to the second level of transcription (Linell, 1994).

5.4 Samples

The samples of students who participated in Studies One and Two differed in several respects. In Study One, my intention was to interview second-graders representing the occupational breadth of the Child & Recreation Programme. In Study Two, I was particularly keen to meet third grade prospective security

officers, because they were nearing graduation and thus had presumably advanced in their distinct vocational becoming. Moreover, they had already finished the first mandatory course set by the security industry and a work-placement with a security company. In contrast to the student participants in the first study, who were halfway through their education, some of the students in the second study had advanced further, providing opportunities to explore further aspects of student experience.

In accordance with my overall research questions, the sample of lessons observed had to be chosen with utmost care. The Diploma project and training package (monitored in Schools B and A, respectively) both provided advantages in this respect. The Diploma project was highly aligned with stipulations in the syllabus that the courses should offer the students opportunities to develop in-depth vocation-specific knowing. The project provided such opportunity by requiring students to do recurrent work tasks in their targeted occupation (security officer) or field of work (the security industry).

The main task set for the students in their Diploma projects was to prepare a safety and security plan for an upcoming, authentic international fair. The students were divided into three mixed-grade groups, each assigned a specific sub-task. In School A, a training package by the security industry comprising two courses (Security officer foundational Part 1 and 2), was the centre of attention. The second and third grade students were attending Parts 1 and 2, respectively. The instruction in School A was provided by seven of BYA's instructors, who were still practitioners of the occupation. In School B, the observations were made during the Diploma project course, in which two vocational teachers supervised mixed-grade groups, with 14 and 10 second and third grade students, respectively. In School A I could follow the courses from start to finish, as they both concluded with a written exam[61] during the observational period. In contrast, in School B I only attended the first stage of the course for second graders (whose work was to continue the following term), while third graders completed the course during my stay.

Schools A and B differ in many ways. School A is situated in a medium-sized town in the middle of Sweden, whereas School B is in a large town in western Sweden. The circumstances of the fieldwork in School A and B also differed for several reasons. For example, the type of observed instruction differed (a training package provided by the security industry in School A and

---

[61] Following agreement with BYA, the training package provider, students were discouraged from revealing details of these tests so I decided not to observe them.

regular vocational instruction in School B). It should be noted that in School B groups of students also attended the training package provided by the BYA in rounds during the course of the Diploma project. However, the training package was not observed in School B because the training package was standardised by the BYA and (thus) should not have differed between Schools A and B. The student-teacher ratio was also more favourable in School A than in School B.

Moreover, the extent of the fieldwork in Schools A and B differed. In School A, events during a number of whole school days were observed, excluding lunch recess, while in School B only a number of lessons were observed. Compositions of the student groups followed also differed, and the student group was mixed grade in School B but not School A.

The assessment in School B consisted of group reports (audio-recorded) for third graders while for second graders the final assessment to come (not studied here) involved their actual participation in the upcoming international fair. Thus, the conditions and circumstances of instruction offered to the students presumably shaped learning opportunities differently and locally. These circumstances regarding the assessment inevitably influenced how the students articulated their experience of becoming security officers.

To recap, the observations at two sites, Schools A and B, were intended to be complementary rather than to compare two didactic designs. Generally, my ongoing analyses of events at one site had bearing on the other as they sensitised me to different opportunities for students to learn on offer. As "strategically situated ethnography" (Marcus, 1995, p. 110) it was possible to juxtapose these opportunities to create analytical tensions in the data produced. These were: school and work, school knowing and vocational knowing, general and specialist.

The samples are probably biased towards students whose general experience of the programme they had chosen was positively aligned with their goals and expectations, while students whose experiences of school education were less positively aligned, for various reasons, were probably not well represented. In Study One, the composition of the groups was based on self-recruitment, leading to an assumption that more problematic and conflictual experiences, e.g., drop-out, were not observed or at least recorded.

For instance, in Study One some students were willing to talk but not to be audio-recorded, so their contributions were not included in the data. In Study Two such negative or at least problematic attitudes could have been manifested

in several students' recurrent absence from the lessons. During the observations some students decided to discontinue their studies by making plans to change programmes. In School B, absentee students or students who eventually dropped out were not further followed, because ethical concerns prevented further probing of these individual cases. Students in School A were highly motivated, both their motivation and suitability having been subjected to prior scrutiny. School A was chosen because it provided an example of best practice according to the BYA. Apart from its leading role nationally due to its ties with the unions, this organisation is just one provider of security training in collaboration with the Swedish National School Agency[62]. Therefore, there may be nationwide variations, but they are not addressed here.

5.5 Validity of the Studies

Validity refers to several criteria that collectively enable judgement of a study's credibility and trustworthiness (House, 2014). Since truth cannot be ascertained we have to achieve credibility to persuade rationally (Fern, 2001). Whatever inferences or arguments drawn from data seem plausible they still may or may not be credible. Important elements of credibility are the meaningfulness of presented evidence and relevance of contextual settings for targeted audiences, for instance researchers who wish to study and conceptualise how students experience vocational becoming. By constructing and applying a set of four analytical concepts to empirical material a new framework of conceptual tools is proposed here to scrutinise student experience of vocational becoming.

Other important elements of a study's credibility are its overall coherence and organisation, including the framing of the research problem. Apart from truth (credibility) and beauty (coherence and organisation), House (2014) regards justice as an important part of the foundations for valid arguments. Accordingly, my framing of the research problem included an explicit intention to make room for voices of students as important stakeholders in USVET.

Providing an account of students' experience of vocational becoming puts me in a position of speaking on their behalf to varied audiences (researcher communities, teachers, school leaders and the general public). This assumption of advocacy entails a need to account for my efforts to do justice to students' varied and lived-through experiences. Therefore, I need to acknowledge my

---

[62] As of 2017-05-18 BYA is one of five security officer training providers and runs courses in approximately 20 upper secondary schools nationwide.

responsibility for providing such an account to be based on knowing well and knowing responsibly (Doucet & Mauthner, 2012).

The issue of trustworthiness is here addressed by leaving an audit trail for the reader, e.g., by supplying details of the research methods. The studies' trustworthiness is also strengthened by reporting dilemmas and confessing to inconsistences (Saldaῆa, 2014).

5.6 Strategies for Securing and Enhancing Method Validity

The combination of two methodologies, interview and observation, was chosen to tap into the richness of student experience of vocational becoming. This combination also provided access to student experience from both an insider's (self-reports) and an outsider's (onlooker's) perspective. However, my stay in the field was restricted (to 11 schooldays in School A and 21 timetabled lessons in School B). This allowed participant observations that were intermittent in time, and regularly recurrent (Kawulich, 2005), but not long-term immersion in the field. Nevertheless, short-term participant observation has previously proved utility for capturing the richness and complexity of young people's construction of learner identity in work and vocational education settings (Brockmann, 2011). In addition, focus group methodology appears a fruitful means for accessing students' experience in Swedish vocational programmes (Hill, 1995) in a non-usurping, and thus respectful way.

5.6.1 Complementarity of the Observations and Focus Group Interviews

In this section I first discuss my use of participant observations then my focus group interviews. Participant observations enabled me to co-construct an account of students' experience of vocational becoming as a social phenomenon. Observing students' (mostly) verbal actions I could juxtapose my understanding and interpretations of events with theirs in order not to verify but to expand them, and assemble a conceptual toolbox for further examination of students' accounts of their experience. However, I cannot be sure of any shared meanings (intersubjectivity) between me and the students (cf. Brockmann, 2011). For instance, in a Diploma project I established that students in group work frequently fell into inaction, verbally expressing

uncertainty about what to do. Their attention as a group phased in and out of group work. However, when confronted with this observation in focus group interviews, students expressed verbal appreciation of the breadth and complexity of the topic related to security arrangements at public events. A possible contributory factor is that second-graders' attention may have wandered because they knew their group work would continue in the following term, the observed period (February to May) being merely a warm-up.

Clearly, our interpretations of group work differed. In a similar vein, participant observations during the training package and Diploma project provided access to individuals' actions as representations of social actions in a given context, e.g., group work. Therefore, it is possible that the individual students' actions carried personal meanings (not considered here) that arose from idiosyncratic circumstances.

Generally, however, participant observations provided opportunities to validate observations quickly (on the spot) and clarify them through situated conversations (Brockmann, 2011) with students, teachers and instructors (*How important is the law for security officers in their everyday work?*). On one occasion I shared an excerpt of the fieldnotes, asking for comments from one of the two teachers in School B. This limited case of respondent validity (Lincoln & Guba, 1985) was recorded for subsequent listening. The teacher's comments provided a rationale for her choice of group work as a method of free enquiry adopted in a Diploma project. Her explanation supported my intention to stay accountable to teachers as one of the audiences addressed by this thesis.

On the whole, I tried to minimise reactivity during my participant observations. My short immersion in the field did not facilitate rapport-building with the students outside the classroom setting. There were few naturally occurring opportunities to interact with students in places where they chose to spend their recesses and lunch times. Moreover, my intention throughout the observations was to maintain a low degree of participation. In practical terms I stayed detached, avoiding eye-contact with the teachers and instructors, "hidden" behind the computer screen and from there following what was going on around me. However, the instructors and the teachers sometimes raised attention to my presence during the lessons. A typical routine in the training package with new instructors delivering instructional modules included quite elaborate personal presentations, concerning (for instance) interests, goals and hobbies, in which I too was asked to participate. My self-presentations were kept short. On a few occasions I was explicitly asked by one of the teachers to

leave the computer behind to participate in a lesson segment[63]. During practical segments of lessons, such as fire management exercises outdoors or study visits, I relied on taking handwritten notes.

However, my presence as another adult, a stranger, seated behind prospective security officers, facing a security officer performing the role of an instructor, must have influenced the course of events. On one occasion I asked one of the instructors for permission to record a personal anecdote he had told the students in a previous lesson. This anecdote, which I only managed to record in fragmentary notes, illustrated how a young, "brave" and inexperienced security officer relies on situated judgement in possibly life-threatening circumstances. The instructor was unwilling to re-tell the anecdote for audio-recording as it could be, in his words, misunderstood or give a wrong impression. This episode brought home to me the importance for the instructors and possibly even teachers to manage projected expressions. The instructor chose therefore to let me audio-record another anecdote, showing an example of a story of success instead.

Observations of classroom instruction are more orderly and restricted in terms of interaction than (for example) observations in workplaces (Brockmann, 2011). During the training package, students mostly remained stationary and immobile, conforming to the situation of tightly structured and timetabled instructor-led instruction. There was a given order-taking of speech with instructors giving the floor to the students. In sum, free students' interaction was scarce and their actions and behaviour that I could record amounted to their verbal exchanges, mostly orchestrated by the instructors. In contrast, students' interactions, e.g., feedback-making patterns, were less constrained in the Diploma project, although there too they were mostly captured through their verbal actions. Students conformed to the situation less and were more questioning, although in ways that were respectful to the teachers.

A final thought on the validity of my participant observations to capture student perspectives concerns a slight difference in focus during the training package and Diploma project sessions. In the former, I recorded students' interactions stimulated by contact with contents that were novel (and therefore stimulating!) even to me, which made me susceptible to "enchantment" by the instruction in the training package as well as by the instructors' air of vocational

---

[63] While she was introducing some techniques from what she called forum theatre, in which students worked on role-playing emotions.

pride, expertise and professionality. This enchantment, if unchecked, could have narrowed my perception, reducing my attention to students' interactions. In contrast, my focus as a participant observer during the Diploma project was firmly set on students' interaction as the instructional contents seemed familiar. I next discuss the validity of the focus group interviews for producing an account of experience of vocational becoming from a students' perspective.

Kvale (2007) identifies three general quality criteria for a good interview: richness of answers, length of relevant answers and clarification of what is said. Students' comments in my focus group interviews had several flaws in these respects, especially in Study One. The flaws included a lack of concreteness and depth, as they found assessment a challenging and abstract concept to discuss (cf. Gyllander Torkildsen & Erickson, 2016), particularly as their experiences of workplace-based learning were still limited. Even in Study Two, students tended to keep their conversations rather short, prematurely curtailing discussion of issues rather than elaborating on them, which evidently presents a methodological problem (see Hill, 1995). My main concern was to enable student-led and free (unconstrained) conversations to let the students' voice come to the fore[64]. Faced with this apparent lack of depth, I followed interactional social clues (Hill, 1995). I was on the lookout for any signals of differing meanings, trying to help students to draw these differing meanings out into the open for collective discussion. I assumed that differing or even contradictory meanings could assist me to assemble conceptual tools by sensitising me to what students may experience as problematic. Therefore, throughout these two studies I paid close attention to the social interplay as it was unfolding, facilitating the ease of interaction. Admittedly, audio, in contrast to video recording, severely limited my opportunities to record the richness of student interaction.

Concluding this section, I address issues associated with the role of the researcher as the main research instrument in producing observational and interview data. Kvale (2007) draws attention to nine characteristics of a good interviewer[65], some of them quite contradictory, e.g., skilful steering and openness. I contend that my rich experience of various aspects of teaching (e.g., teaching both vocational and academic subjects, mentoring and student care,

---

[64] In hindsight however, another possibility (not adopted here) would have been to devise "vignettes" (Grbich, 2013, p. 323) to use as prompts for the focus group interviews. Vignettes compress data, e.g., from previous participant observations to provide more detail.

[65] Knowledgeable, structuring, clear, gentle, sensitive, open, steering, critical, remembering, interpreting.

and coordinating work-placements) prepared me well for approaching students as informants and experts on their experience of vocational becoming. I believe I brought to the field an ability to juggle these contradictory needs, staying flexible, but of course there are no absolute ways to judge my approach. Next, I discuss my role as a researcher in relation to the validity of the methodology.

5.6.2 The Role of Researcher

My role as a researcher was to interpret what students said and did, and give a coherent (etic) (cf. Burgess, 2006) account of their (emic) experience of vocational becoming. Therefore, pre-eminence is given here to students' verbal actions and behaviours in groups. Throughout the studies, I strove to maintain my intention to speak *with* the students rather than *about* them. Despite this, adult status together with age, gender and ethnicity may have placed me in the frame of a teacher figure "monitoring" by asking questions, albeit in a friendly and interested manner. Appearing as a teacherly figure to students raises issues of power asymmetry. Generally, my high familiarity with the field of the Child & Recreation Programme clearly poses a threat of confirmation bias, compromising the validity of the data production methods and inferences drawn from analysis of the data, arguments developed and derived recommendations (cf. Burgess, 2006; Holloway & Todres, 2003, p. 354).

Even as I entered the field I recognised some patterns of social dynamics of camaraderie and rapport-building between the students and teachers, previously identified in research on a Child & Recreation Programme, and familiar from my teaching experience (Lemar, 2001). In order to remain curious and preserve a questioning attitude towards the Child & Recreation Programme and its "fuzziness", I reflected on my empirical observations and insights about (for example) students' social skills, checking the literature, questioning and theoretically interpreting the findings. In this way, letting theory inform practice and practice interpenetrate the theory, my role as a researcher was to assemble a viable set of conceptual tools for examination of students' experience of vocational becoming.

5.7 Concluding Remarks on Method Validity

The qualitative and quasi-ethnographic approach applied in the studies does not allow generalisation of findings beyond the contexts of the Child & Recreation Programme. To reiterate, the account of students' experience of vocational

becoming is constructed from verbal evidence, such as (dis)agreeing, reasoning, questioning, rejecting and conformation. These verbal actions are all present in typical feedback-making of the Child & Recreation Programme context. Accordingly, the inferences that inform and form the base for my argumentation are drawn from predominantly verbal data covering various aspects of students' interaction, e.g., feedback-making. However, the validity of recurring patterns and themes identified here may strengthen the studies' representativeness (Hammarsley, 2008) and hence applicability to other VET contexts. In particular, the conceptual set of tools proposed here for examination of students' experience of vocational becoming may be applicable to other educational contexts.

5.8 Discussion of Data Analysis Validity

The goal of the data analysis was to thematise meanings that students ascribed to their experience of vocational becoming (cf. Holloway & Todres, 2003, p. 347). These thematised meanings informed the construction of my set of conceptual tools for further examination of this phenomenon. I followed the three stages of data analysis described by Yin (2015): compilation, disassembling and reassembling. The last two stages were often recursive as they involved re-interpretation, assisting the construction of my set of conceptual tools. Procedures for analysis of the data collected in Study One (through focus group interviews) and Study Two (through focus group interviews and participant observation) differed, as explained in the following subsections.

5.8.1 Data Analysis in Study One

In Study One, prolonged verbatim and lengthy transcription of the recorded interviews enabled me to immerse myself in the data, and a personal journal enabled me to collect analytical memos (Saldaῆa, 2014) capturing emergent thoughts and tentatively plausible explanations based on particularly vivid quotations (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). The NVivo 10 Computer Assisted Qualitative Data Analysis software package was used to compile a repository of interview transcripts for easy access and coding (compilation). I then truncated the data into episodes or stanzas from which codes were inductively extracted (Saldaῆa, 2014). The codes (so-called nodes) were further categorised as a patterning strategy. Individual codes were organised into greater wholes of significance, enabling closer inspection of emerging patterns of significance of

assessment for students' experience of vocational becoming. For instance, code "knowledge requirements" and "feedback" were grouped with other codes into a category called "view of knowledge". The software package enabled me to seek and iteratively re-examine interrelationships between codes during reassembling and disassembling stages.

The guiding principle for the analysis of emerging themes was to investigate how students collectively constructed dialogue (Bachtin, 1986; Marková, Linell, Grossen & Salazar Orvig, 2007) on ideas, supported by participation of *virtual significant others* (Wertsch, 1992), e.g., teachers and workplace trainers. Thus, of particular interest were instances of voices of others through quotations injected by students into their interaction, helping them to position themselves discursively in student conversations. The foreignness of these voices in students' talk (through direct quotations) was often accompanied by emphatic emotional expressions, e.g., laughter or irony. For instance, students' talk and interaction about performance-standards echoed and mocked teacher discourses, e.g., about the performance standards for written assignments (writing "in basic terms", "in a well-grounded way" and "in a well-grounded and balanced way").

5.8.2 Data Analysis in Study Two

The method for disassembling data (fieldnotes and transcripts) I chose in Study Two was based on use of derived notes rather than coding (Yin, 2015).

> The derived notes can include direct quotes from the original data, paraphrases of the data, and your interpretations of the data (the notes should have sufficient punctuation rules to distinguish among these and other variations). (Yin, 2015, p. 200)

I compiled my database by merging the transcripts and fieldnotes into derived notes. At this stage of my research, based on my growing competence in handling interview data, I intended to use such procedures to increase the freedom to think, rather than being primarily occupied by the mechanics of coding. However, on the down side, this may lead to inconsistency (Yin, 2015). To secure "a methodic analytic procedure" analytical memos were employed (Yin, 2015, p. 195). The derived notes were then organised thematically (by grouping, for example, notes concerning "occupational risks"), taking care to "crosswalk them backwards into the original database" (Yin, 2015, p. 201). Through a careful reading of my derived notes it was possible to identify central

data-close topics, that is, recurrent occurrences of talk and actions. For example, in the training package a preoccupation with assessment was observed through recurrent micro-segments of lessons devoted to the so-called outcome catalogue (a kind of course material, consisting of a printed leaflet handed out to students together with two other main course books, all readily available and frequently referred to during the lessons). The outcome catalogue listed all the course outcomes for the first part of the training package and the students expressed strong appreciation for it in the focus group interviews, referring to it as "the Bible and the Koran" or "your best friend", as the instructors called it. Accordingly, all the instances of the outcome catalogue being mentioned in lessons were highlighted and commented upon in the derived notes. These instances were then collected under the same heading. Examples of a fieldnote and derived note are shown below.

Fieldnote[66]

> 8.30 The personal introduction round is now over and Kerem (instructor) turns the projector on. Since the sun is shining, dazzling everyone, the blinds go automatically down. Kerem asks: Have you learnt anything? Anders: Yes, but don´t ask what exactly. Kerem takes decisive strides towards the cupboard, clumsily fishing for a bunch of outcome catalogues from a box standing on top of it. Accidently, some coins fall down and the students make jokes about money raining down. Kerem (instructor): Good! Have you learnt the law? Everyone hums in agreement: mm. Josef: To be honest, yes, a little.

Derived note[67]

> The outcome catalogue is a salient artifact listing the security officer-specific knowing. This is the first time the students have met the instructor Kerem, who aims to revise what the students have learnt so far. He stresses the law as important knowing because it is the first thing he brings up for up-coming revision and directs their attention to, while holding up the outcome catalogue. The instruction in the training package is aligned according to the outcomes listed in the outcome catalogue. Alignment seems important to maintain in the training package. The law seems important knowing as it is spotlighted through the instructors' questions. Students in the second grade seem (quite) confident about what they´ve learnt about the law.

---

[66] Fieldnotes are, from the start, inscribed with meanings carried over from the researcher as opposed to "purely factual" (Beach, 2005, p. 3). The researcher for instance chooses a direction of attention.
[67] Fieldnotes of this type inscribe meanings that participants attach to events they participate in (Beach, 2005). Derived notes here also comprise an identification of emergent patterns and initial analysis (Yin, 2015).

As the next step all the occurrences of "outcome catalogue" were clustered together with similar topics, e.g., "study techniques, acronyms, metaphors, working life anecdotes". All these topics concern instructional aids applied by the instructors, and were subsumed under a theme of "alignment", an empirically derived conclusion on the salient feature of design of the training package that the students interacted with. In the training package the instruction that students participated in was aligned according to clearly stated goals that were finally assessed. This empirically ascertained evidence of instructional alignment contributed to the construction of my set of conceptual tools. In the following step, these tools were then re-applied to the data, stimulating new inquiries, e.g., how instructional alignment supports students in vocationalising concepts.

Thus, the derived themes, e.g., "alignment, security officer-specific knowing, and social skills" were used as sensitising lenses through which transcripts of the focus group interviews were re-read and re-interpreted. In an excerpt below, a group of second graders verbally appreciated how the outcome catalogue, a salient feature of alignment of instruction and assessment, helped them to progress:

Interviewer: How about the outcome catalogue?

Pernilla: Excellent

Molly: It was good

Carolina: Good

Pernilla: Otherwise it would have been so damn difficult to pass the written test

Anders: The Koran and the Bible if you ask me (all laugh)

Pernilla: I reckon I wouldn´t have managed

Carolina: No

Pernilla: If I hadn't had it

Anders: This is the best thing that BYA (the Security Industry and Working Environment Committee) has invented, to hand it out to students like this

Pernilla: Well, otherwise you would've got stuck there, confused, what should I do now? What should I revise now? These two books that (shows with fingers) thick

Anders: Exactly, you just open it (the outcome catalogue) and the answers are almost right there glaring at you

Pernilla: Mm

Anders: Right on the spot

Interviewer: Have you studied?

Anders: Absolutely, we've used it up to 90 % of the time.

Molly: We start from there and then you go on checking in the coursebook

Carolina: Mm.

The focus of my interest throughout the data analysis constantly moved between student interaction (as expressed in their utterances) and observations of the classroom instruction. This constant interplay between two different sources of knowledge assisted me in assembling a conceptual set of analytical tools for my study of students' experience of vocational becoming.

5.9 Ethical Concerns

During all stages of the empirical studies (including data production and data analysis) and writing of the thesis there have been ethical issues to consider. This was mainly due to my ambition to "translate" everyday accounts of knowing (expressed by various groups of knowers: primarily students, but also teachers and instructors) into an academic account (Doucet & Mauthner, 2012). In dealings with students, teachers and instructors I applied contextualised, situation-dependent ethics. For example, I listened to students who explicitly wished to speak about their experiences of assessment of vocational knowing even though they had declined to consent to their talk being recorded. Thus, listening to their talk I knew that I would not be able to use (and account for) the material co-produced in this way, but at the same time I would not be able to wipe away these impressions in the following stages of my study. Therefore, all encounters with students I have had inevitably colour my interpretations of students' experience of vocational becoming.

Throughout the research process I have followed ethical procedures outlined by the Swedish Research Council (Vetenskapsrådet, 2011, 2017)[68]. Thus, I have strived to present a credible and trustworthy account of students' experience of vocational becoming, based on verbal interactional data. My preliminary research findings, based on earlier research were on several occasions presented in conferences, and greatly enhanced by my participation in the Research School in the Pedagogy of Vocational Subjects. There were no commercial or other interests.

As all the students participating were at least 15 years old, they were provided information about the study both in writing and orally (Vetenskapsrådet, 2011, 2017). Afterwards their written consent to participate or decline to participate at any point without further notice was obtained. Students' names and personal details were de-identified at all stages of the research, for example, while presenting preliminary results to research communities or in discussions with supervisors. To ensure confidentiality, all personal information regarding students, instructors and teachers was withheld from the public. Unauthorised access to the data was prevented by keeping the materials locked at the Department of Education and Special Education. Regarding the teachers and instructors, only verbal consent was deemed necessary and obtained. In hindsight, it would have been ethically desirable to obtain written consent to participate from the seven instructors whose instruction was observed. However, the contact with them was arranged by School A and with the aid of BYA, rather than directly with the individual instructors. Student participants voluntarily accepted to be interviewed about issues that may seem contentious, as students may consider assessment an instrument for selection and exclusion. However, the topics discussed (assessment and feedback) are not sufficiently intimate (Fern, 2001) to present students with any potential harm.

5.10 Ethical Dilemmas

When approaching the young people, I tried to stay respectful to them as resourceful young adults producing an ingenious account, without in advance assuming their position as constrained or disempowered (Brooker & Macdonald, 1999). At the same time, I tried to challenge what students considered as taken for granted and natural. However, my ambition to know

---

[68] This is an updated version by the Swedish Research Council (2011).

their experience well and responsibly was a source of dilemmas (Doucet & Mauthner, 2012).

Firstly, I need to reflect on and account for my assumptions, which had to be balanced and kept in line with my aim to construct an account from a students' perspective. However, when recognised and reflected upon, a subjective bias may enrich knowledge construction (Kvale, 2007). Through my teacher experience I have accrued a kind of normativity about what counts as "good" and "inferior" instruction, or what I call a teacher bias. Therefore, while attempting to co-construct with students a true account of their experience of vocational becoming it was tempting on occasions to empathise with the teachers and instructors and identify with the former. In this account, mostly based on interactional and verbal data, I needed to strike a balance between students' and a more detached perspective. Handling normativity, polarising what I found into good and inferior instruction, remained a challenge throughout the study. This dilemma vividly arose in my perception of the training package and Diploma project as creating discontinuities for the students. It was easy to become enchanted (cf. above) with the highly structured and controlled didactic design of the training package. The training package was well aligned in terms of goals, contents, methods and assessment, which made exposing it to criticism rather difficult.

Another source of ethical dilemmas was the need to maintain honest relationships with all the subjects with whom I came into contact and continue to do, albeit indirectly through putting forth this thesis. For instance, some students were critical of assessment and feedback practices, using focus group interviews to air their concerns and asking me to relay them to their teachers, which I obviously declined. Another illustration is the need to protect the seven instructors' confidentiality. During instruction, the instructors shared with the students plenty of biographical information. My understanding was that they utilised their personal resources (e.g., stories and anecdotes) as part of the didactic design and to role model for the students. Thus, the students were constantly invited to interact with this personal content (see Subsection 5.6.1). In order to maintain the instructors' individual privacy, I provided confidentiality by making them non-traceable in the thesis and all disseminated material arising from the empirical studies.

6 Summary of the Articles

Building on the earlier theorisation of student experienced curriculum of vocational becoming in Subsection 4.5, this chapter summarises the four articles. Thus, the conceptual progression starts with the concept of feedback-making in relation to student experienced curriculum in Articles 1 and 2. The two articles focus on how students, halfway through their education, make sense of feedback as part of the assessment of vocational knowing in both school- and workplace-based learning. This focus shifts in Articles 3 and 4 to a much broader, but more occupation-specific matter of vocational becoming. More specifically, these articles consider how students in more advanced stages of their education construct their experienced curriculum of vocational becoming as security officers. In this way the empirical progression displays students' agency in their vocational becoming through the mechanism of vocationalising concepts (Article 3) and expansion of learner readiness (Article 4).

> Article 1: Wyszynska Johansson, M., & Henning Loeb, I. (2015). Yrkeselevers erfarenheter om bedömning och återkoppling. Kritiska röster från Barn- och Fritidsprogrammet. [Vocational students' experiences of assessment and feedback. Critical voices from the Child & Recreation Programme]. *Forskning om undervisning och lärande, 14*, 6-23. [published]

This first article explores student experience of how vocational teachers of the Child & Recreation Programme enact assessment practices in the classroom. Thus, it contributes to research on learning vocational knowing as well as its assessment from a students' perspective, raising critical questions regarding the implementation of the upper secondary reform of 2011 (Skolverket, 2011). Under a discursive umbrella of raising overall quality of vocational learning, this reform emphasised greater occupational specialisation and readiness for employment upon graduation. New standard-based knowledge requirements tied to a new assessment scale were introduced with the intention of strengthening formative assessment, with a focus on feedback (Skolverket, 2012a).

The study draws on 13 focus group interviews with 70 students, in total, halfway through their education in 10 upper-secondary schools in western Sweden. The aim was to illuminate how assessment and peer-assessment (Lundahl, 2011; Topping, 2009, 2010), including feedback (Taras, 2013) support students' ways to become job-ready according to the intentions of the upper secondary reform of 2011. Previous research on assessment in the context of the Child & Recreation Programme informed the study (Carlsson, Gerrevall & Pettersson, 2007; Gamlem & Smith, 2013; Havnes et al., 2012; Hjelmér, 2012; Johansson, 2009; Lemar, 2001).

Findings concerning vocational teacher feedback and student-led assessment (peer-assessment and peer-feedback) are presented and discussed. Students' comments indicated that they found the teacher feedback too vague (*'Good' feels like super feedback [ironically]*) and mostly directed at the results rather than the process (*The comments are like 'You´ve got this grade'; The 'why' and 'this is why' are missing).* Students also wished for teacher feedback that would help them visualise their progression, pointing to improvement: *It´s not like: This is good because of this [with emphasis], for these reasons, and you could have done this [with emphasis].*

Students experienced that assessment of declarative knowledge through written assignments dominated, overshadowing other forms of knowing and other attainment criteria: *Write in a well-grounded and balanced way and you´ll get a very good grade. If you can´t do that, you´ll earn a low grade. This is what´s all about.* Although students seemed to have learnt the phrases used to describe the three attainment criteria, i.e., in basic terms (översiktligt), in a well-grounded way (utförligt) and in a well-grounded and balanced way (utförligt och nyanserat), they evidently grappled with the three quality descriptors. For example, when asked to clarify what "in a (well)-balanced way" may mean since they previously mentioned it, students immediately recast this qualitatively expressed three-step-progression in terms of amounts of writing: *Well, it´s like more of [mark well] in a well-grounded way, isn´t it?* Thus, grade progression for students was about writing quantitatively more but also writing *your personal thoughts: It´s like lots of saying it in your own words; Thoughts of your own and conclusions of your own too.*

According to the diploma goals for the Child & Recreation Programme students need to develop an ability to collaborate and communicate, which forms part of the base for the development of their skills as pedagogical leaders. Pedagogical leadership is tied with students' capacity to assess (evaluate) and communicate performance assessment. Students reported that they had few

opportunities for practicing these skills in classrooms, although they seemed to value the honesty (and frequency) of feedback in small peer constellations or, as a student said mockingly: *Classmates often can´t give you, how to put it, feedback 'in-a-balanced-way' [laughter]*. Regarding peer-assessment that some students said they sometimes practiced spontaneously, e.g., some students of the Recreation & Health orientation in massage practice sessions outside the classroom, they were generally not sure about what to assess and, accordingly, give their peers feedback on. However, they also acknowledged the social skills, e.g., communication skills, resilience and willingness to contribute that peer-assessment involves in the context of classroom instruction. Generally, students appeared sceptical and treated peer-assessment as synonymous with the teacher's graded summative assessment: *After all, we don´t hand in assignments to each other, do we?* This summative assessment is associated with knowledge requirements that they struggled to understand, so it seems reasonable that they shunned peer-assessment altogether. Students expressed worries that peer-assessment, by putting them in a teacher position, could have alienated them from their peers: *It´s getting more difficult when you judg- … assess a classmate. You don´t want to; You don´t have the leader role (pause). You shouldn´t have to feel like you are a leader, do you understand what I mean (laughther)?* Students seemed aware of personal consequences of participation in feedback, acknowledging how feedback is intricately embedded in social processes: *It´s not like here I come: so much Z (student name) has done, what a fine piece of work, I´m so proud of you [in a ridiculing exaggerating voice], no.*

The study highlights the need of scaffolding assessment practices to facilitate more student-led assessment, including efforts to improve students' feedback literacy (Havnes et al., 2012). However, this would require teachers to frame feedback as a matter of vocational pedagogy, that is to say, teachers' feedback literacy. Teachers need to consider a variety of didactic issues in their daily instruction, such as the best ways to concretise knowledge requirements in relation to task specificity, without resorting to ready-made curricular formulations, and assist students to visualise their progression over time. These didactic considerations that vocational teachers need to handle competently must be seen against the backdrop of teacher training remaining an optional rather than mandatory requirement for employment in Swedish USVET.

Article 2: Wyszynska Johansson, M. 'Du har skött dig bra': Återkoppling inom arbetsplatsförlagt lärande utifrån yrkeselevers upplevda läroplan. ["You´re

doing good": Feedback in workplace-based learning from a perspective of the experienced curriculum]. [accepted for publication in a special issue of the Nordic Journal of Vocational Education and Training]

The second article illuminates how Child & Recreation Programme students construct their experienced curriculum (Billett, 2002, 2006) through feedback participation in workplace-based learning, grounded in their subjectively experienced sense of progression. School-based VET offers limited contact with natural workplace curriculums, which is reflected in feedback to students. As already described, this study was empirically based on focus group interviews with 70 second graders in 10 upper-secondary schools in western Sweden. The students were halfway through their VET to become job-ready for people-centred service occupations, e.g., nursery nurses and personal trainers. Experienced curriculum was used as a conceptual tool to analyse their experience of feedback in workplaces. Experienced curriculum is conceptualised as an emergent space for student action between the other two dimensions of curriculum: the intended and enacted.

It is acknowledged that students' exposure to a workplace curriculum (Billett, 2002) may pose a discontinuity (Akkerman & Bakker, 2011; Bronkhorst & Akkerman, 2016) pertaining to and reflecting their unfamiliarity with distinct assessment practices typical of workplace-based learning (Kvale, 2008; Tanggaard, 2006; Tanggaard & Elmholdt, 2008). The students expressed appreciation of verbal validation of their self-assessment, for instance a workplace trainer asking, "What would you have done?" in the midst of a training session with a customer as well as planned supervision: *We talked a bit how the day had been, what you had learnt, what´d been less than good?* These verbal exchanges invited students to visualise their progression as open-ended. Students looked forward to feedback on their gradual process of growing into the adult world of work by practicing their communication and their capacity to dare to try: *You grow into the role after a while.* Collectively they seemed capable of acknowledging their starting point for learning in workplaces (Student 1, *When I was at the check-out for the first two weeks I didn´t dare answer the phone*; Student 2 *[laughing], Nor did I*), at the same time recognising the range of accomplished progress: *But after a while it was like it´s on me, it´s on me. You grow into it. They could also grade your progression over time.*

Students interpreted and responded to inconspicuous feedback. A prospective personal trainer reported being unfairly judged on the basis of the first impression he had made in the workplace and his ways to prove his worth:

> Student 3: I think I was judged by the appearance of my body. They must have thought he's just interested in muscle building and that´s it, this is all he can do. I sensed it, there I learnt how much your looks are judged so I wouldn´t see it as something negative, or perhaps it was for me, but you have to face it that it really is like that because people judge like that.

Students tried to prove their suitability for the job, although the criteria for this were not clear to them (Student 4, *She does her work*; Student 5, *Yes, carefully that sort of thing* … Student 6, *Driven, ambitious [laughs]*). They needed to perform a balancing act, e.g., ask questions in the right way: *She asked this yesterday, why is she asking again?*

Some students reported taking responsibility in workplaces by inventing work tasks, making themselves useful and a resource (*invents a child massage session, improvises*). Others mentioned adopting a passive observer position. A central finding is that the students developed a vocational attitude aligned with their interpretations of what workplaces required and conveyed through verbalised as well as through inconspicuous feedback. This vocational attitude was based on either of two types of vocational conduct: child care- or customer-oriented. More specifically, prospective nursery nurses talked about assessment of their global capacity to "take in" preschool children. Prospective personal trainers emphasised a capacity to inspire customers with enthusiasm (by appearing *upright* and *straight-backed*). Students' sense of progression is about forming a "from within" relationship with occupational praxis in workplaces rather than in relation to school learning outcomes. Therefore, students oriented their actions towards what they interpreted as certain values or occupational ethos they perceived through their participation in feedback and against the backdrop of workplace curriculum. They appeared receptive and sensitive to the values of child care and customer care.

These two types of alignment and orientation towards work ethos marked the criteria against which students measured their progression, transcending the role of teenager. Their experienced curriculums opened up a space for student agency to practice self-assessment and expand their communication capacity, inventiveness, problem-solving ability, and courage to try, in open-ended learning processes. A more generous, broadly encompassing, and thus divergent (Shuichi, 2016) view of assessment of vocational knowing in workplace-based

learning is advocated here. A need to scaffold students' resilience in feedback participation during workplace-based learning is also advocated, motivated by a recognised need to ascribe greater value to students' self-assessment of their subjectively sensed progression.

Article 3: Wyszynska Johansson, M., Wärvik, G.-B. & Choy, S. (2018). Vocationalising specialized concepts: Appropriating meanings through feedback. *Vocations and Learning*, DOI 10.1007/s12186-018-9204-4. [published]

The third article introduces and explores vocational becoming as a matter of students conceptualising vocational knowing through feedback practices. It is argued that feedback practices generate entry points into vocational becoming by inviting students to make meaning through what is labelled here vocationalising concepts. Vocationalising concepts refers to the use of certain words and what they denote through deducting, justifying, giving and asking for reasons and their appropriation (Brandom, 2000). Thus, through vocationalising concepts students conceptualise words within a net of culturally-historically constructed and agreed vocation-specific inferences. Common vocational concepts that students get access to in VET materialise through a system of mediated meaning-making followed by degrees of generalisations in different physical and cultural contexts (e.g., workplaces), influenced by the ZPD and by sharing a communal space of reasons (Brandom, 2000; Derry 2008; Guile, 2006; Vygotskij, 1934).

As already described, the empirical data considered in the study were collected from participant observations and focus group interviews with 34 second and third grade Child & Recreation Programme students in two schools. Students in upper secondary school can gain accreditation as security officers through a program offered in collaboration with the security industry, represented by the BYA, which is responsible for providing a specific training package, including its syllabus, instructors, instruction and assessment. Student participants in this study were trainee security officers participating in instruction through this training package and a final Diploma project course geared towards a vocational diploma. Two research questions are addressed: What concepts do students vocationalise and what are the contributions of feedback in vocationalising concepts for specialised vocational knowing?

It is claimed that students vocationalised five sets of concepts: transforming anomaly into a specialised concept, "accomplishing" the uniform by properly dressing (in the appropriate uniform), practicing accountability, aligning with the ideal of a modern security officer, and transforming vocational concepts into a means for practicing social skills in group work. For illustration, students interpreted the act of wearing the uniform correctly as legitimate vocational knowing. Incomplete accoutrement may strip a security officer of rights to specific extended legal protection, which the third graders inferred in the space of reasons they collectively inhabited: *If I´m knocked down as a security officer, wearing white socks then it won´t count as an offence to an officer simply because I was wearing white socks as opposed to black.* Correctly wearing the uniform reconciled for the students a general threat-protection contradiction. The verbal feedback they provided to each other helped them collectively imbue the concept of uniform with vocationally relevant meaning, related to a security officer's all-encompassing need for self-protection. Peer feedback directed everyone's attention to a collectively established appreciation of this need: *They can blame you for that … Because I haven´t fulfilled it … The uniform.*

Students subjected their previous ideas about the security officer occupation to a reality check. They revised former understandings about security officers as action film figures and proceeded towards envisaging a contemporary security officer, that is, a scout, janitor, negotiator and technician*: I remember how my view of security officer as an occupation has changed a lot (…) it is more civil service, you're not there to brawl, you're there to watch.*

Feedback practices in the instructor-led training package tended to provide more opportunities to strengthen vocational becoming as prospective security officers than student-led group work, which offered fewer opportunities for vocationalising concepts, thus reinforcing student identity. For instance, the teachers' feedback was directed at intangible aspects of the social dynamics that group work activated (flexibility, making effort, perseverance). This intangibility was mirrored in the teachers' feedback as they commented on students' collective and individual efforts to make the group work succeed: *Monica's and my plan was like this, it's not the final product that counts most in the Diploma project but rather it's about team work. Can you handle unexpected events? Are you prepared to work with new group members?*

A didactic implication of this study is that part of the vocational teacher's role is to create and sustain a communal space of reasons to enhance students' opportunities to benefit from feedback in vocational classroom instruction.

Vocationalising concepts cannot therefore be reduced to abstractions or "theory" that students can access either directly (from the teacher) or by themselves (from learning materials) unless teachers situate concepts in a space of reasons that they collectively and temporarily inhabit with their students.

Article 4: Wyszynska Johansson, M. Feedback on "The Law" and Learner Readiness of Young Swedish Security Officers-to-Be [manuscript submitted to *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*]

The fourth article addresses learner readiness (Billett, 2015a, Billett, 2015b), here defined as students' collective ways to engage in the entity and transaction of receiving and giving feedback, specifically focusing on prospective security officers' readiness to learn with respect to surveillance law. For young prospective security officers, handling surveillance law means developing vocational knowing on several planes: as a matter of know-how, know-what, know-why and know-when. Surveillance law is acknowledged as potentially troublesome conceptual knowing from a perspective of young students' current state of learner readiness (Vaughan, 2017). Students' vantage point during instruction is their prior understanding (Miller, 2011) of surveillance law, on which they act and experience the world in the way of *periezhivanie* (переживание) (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001). This article addresses three specific questions. First, what surveillance law is experientially emergent for upper secondary students through vocational instruction to become security officers? Second, how does feedback mediate these students' understanding of surveillance law? Third, how is learner readiness with respect to surveillance law expressed in the students' feedback-making during instruction to become security officers? The concept of periezhivanie, introduced by Vygotsky (Veresov, 2016) is used to analyse learner readiness as it unfolded in affectively-bodily-intellectually integrative ways and in transaction with the focal social situation of development (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001). In contrast to earlier studies of learner readiness, here it is dealt with as a developmental capacity of groups rather than an individual property of deficiency.

As already described, the article draws on a study with 34 second and third grade Child & Recreation Programme students in two schools, learning to become security officers. However, the findings presented and considered in Article 4 only pertain to the data collected in participant observations and interviews with 10 students of one of the schools who were participating in a

training package offered by the BYA, which provided the syllabus, the instruction and instructors, who were responsible for assessment. The participant observation involved observation of instruction led by seven instructors in total, all security officer practitioners. The data (fieldnotes and interview transcripts) were analysed to ascertain how surveillance law was presented to students, that is, how this social situation of learning (development) (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001) was meaningfully refracted through the collectivity of students' periezhivanie of transforming themselves into prospective security officers.

It is proposed that surveillance law emerged for the students through a constant interplay of four aspects: anchorage in commonsensical sense of justice; foundation of action plans; freedom to abstain from action or initiate action; and extended legal protection contingent on certain circumstances. Three main findings are presented as short narratives of students' encounters with surveillance law. First, feedback orchestrated by instructors positively reinforced the students' transformation of understanding surveillance law. Second, this transformed understanding provided a means to develop a vocational stance based on expansion of collective learner readiness. Third, this vocational stance was embedded in finely grained vocational knowing based on awareness of: the need to handle personal empowerment, occupational boundaries, and laws as grids for actions.

Students collectively acknowledged that surveillance law was presented as the *theoretical*, and thus most dreaded part of the training package during the instruction, or as Anders (student) said, *the theoretical is the most difficult*. For the second graders (novices to this type of education and training) "theory" was not restricted to *the laws and how you manage them* but also *how you are allowed to [with emphasis] manage them*. Students gradually, and with the help of peer feedback, built on each other's understanding of surveillance law, expanding their current level of learner readiness. The training package provided them access not only to occupation-specific management of applicable regulations, e.g., particular legislation, but (above all) granted them their just-realised position of being allowed to manage these laws.

The students collectively wove an account of their alignment with surveillance law as an occupation-specific *sense-giving field* (Roth & Jornet, 2017), that is, multi-dimensional, highly symbolic and difficult to acquire vocational knowing. Through peer feedback, i.e., by asking questions, providing answers and then collectively probing, refining and elaborating, they related to

surveillance law as a whole of significance rather than a set of discrete operational skills.

Learner readiness in their words required alignment with novel but unrehearsed and sometimes intimidating and emotionally charged modes of existence. Therefore, the students' words conveyed a feeling of pride in belonging to a community of practice (*When you are out there, working as a security officer*), being in the know (*you don't want to make a mistake*), as well as fear of failure associated with *ending up in jail, getting fined.* A statement by one of students, Carolina (*you can't restrain a person who hasn't committed anything you're allowed to inflict restraint for*) acts as a response (peer feedback) to another (Pernilla), pointing out to her and all the others how knowing surveillance law conflates actions and awareness of one's powers to employ these actions. The students, accepting and confirming Carolina's current state of learner readiness, collectively acknowledged the security officer's circumscribed scope of action.

This insight, mediated by transactionality of feedback, is perhaps the first step towards development of a certain vocational *stance* that will guide all their subsequent actions as security officers within a legal boundary. This readiness to act, which is underpinned by surveillance law, comprises practical aspects (*you do it with hands*) of how to go about restraining perpetrators as well as discretion and judgement (*you don't want to make a mistake*). Vocational knowing here is also conditioned through automatisation of appropriate responses, as Anders stressed that *it should just pop up, like for instance when you learn to ride a bike* rather than through deliberation.

This article contributes to understanding vocational becoming as interdependent with a collective expansion of learner readiness for various aspects of vocational knowing. It proposes that students in initial stages of vocational becoming primarily develop a vocational stance by integrating conceptualised knowing of occupation-specific matters. For participating students, this stance entailed novel ways of being accomplished through alignment with relevant aspects of surveillance law as a specific sense-giving field that could guide their presumptive and occupation-specific and legally bounded actions.

7 Discussion

This discussion is structured according to the two research questions, addressing each of them in a separate section (the first with three subsections, and other with two subsections). Then implications of the studies for vocational pedagogy, as well as the fuzziness and flexibility of vocational programme, are addressed.

In the thesis soft skills, e.g., interaction, communication, empathy and personal introspection, are foregrounded as ways of knowing and doing in students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming. Developing this capacity to meet others through meeting oneself appears central in the student experienced curriculum of the focal programme, which is geared towards occupational specialisation and employability upon graduation. Thus, students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming seems firmly rooted in the personalised work of the self and on the self during both school- and workplace-based parts of VET (Articles 1, 2 and 3) and in relation to the unpredictability typical of service work (Hansen Löfstrand et al., 2016; Articles 3 and 4). This personalised and relational work with the self and on the self permeates students' experienced curriculum in the three quite disparate orientations of the programme (Pedagogic Work, Recreation & Health, and Social Work).

7.1 Articulation of Students' Experience of Vocational Becoming

In response to the first research question (What articulations of student experience of vocational becoming can be identified in education and training aimed at people-centred service occupations?) three were identified:

- Firstly, students' growing capacity for tailoring what I here call *pedagogised encounters*, that is, in attunement with others.
- Secondly, vocational becoming expressed as students manage discontinuities arising from feedback-making in school and in workplaces,

and in relation to legitimacy of knowing across vocational courses. However, these discontinuities may appear as subtle instances of non-sameness.
- Thirdly, vocational becoming that emerges through students' adoption of an initial vocational stance as an extension and refinement of the pedagogised encounter.

The following subsections discuss and elaborate these three articulations in relation to previous research.

7.1.1 Vocational Becoming as Pedagogising Encountering

Service work emerges for students as a matter of encountering people built on adjustment to others in occupation-specific contexts. However, this adjustment is not commonsensical but represents multifaceted vocational knowing, possibly rooted in the vocational subject of pedagogy (see Subsection 2.2.1), i.e., a programme-specific subject. Therefore, students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming materialises through *pedagogising* encounters, resulting in production of human pedagogised encounters. As students in the course of vocational becoming practice how to pedagogise occupation-specific encountering, they align themselves with the value of attunement to the needs of others.

The goal of such pedagogised encounters centres on influencing and affecting others in various ways, e.g., by modifying behaviours. This pedagogised encountering appears quite divergent, e.g., between security officers and offenders, nursery nurses and children, or personal trainers and customers. Each kind of such an encounter requires relational capacity to read others and conform to expectations in sometimes unpredictable situations. For prospective personal trainers and security officers (Articles 2, 3 and 4), customer care and sale of lifestyles and security services (Allvin, 2006; Gorz, 2001) morph with pedagogised encounter. Viewing sales as complete cycles of sales actions, from making the right first impression (Article 2) to managing and capitalising public trust as an asset (Articles 3 and 4), has been shown to enhance an experience of vocational becoming in the context of training for retail (Brockmann, 2013; Musaeus, 2002; Reegård, 2015). The limited data acquired in the studies this thesis is based upon do not allow further inspection

of sales primarily framed as pedagogised encounters and in relation to new service occupations, but this could open up other lines of enquiry.

In summary, students exercise an approach of attunement in assessment situations and in workplaces (Articles 1, 2 and 4) through tailoring pedagogised encounters, reading social clues and cues, paying attention to social dynamics and adjusting accordingly. I therefore argue that a discourse of meeting others correctly in occupation-specific encountering resembles what Lemar (2001) describes as a general pedagogical approach, forming here a backdrop for students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming. Hence further vocational specialisation for service work is fitted in and made coexistent with such a general frame of meeting others appropriately, that is, employing attunement to others through pedagogising encountering.

Subsequently, students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming highlights sensitivity and receptiveness for social signals, e.g., during workplace-based parts of education (Article 2). The students' accounts reported here are in line with previous research on the use of learning strategies such as tailoring questions (Ferm et al., 2018). However, students tailoring questions acquires new meanings here as it concerns students' efforts to sustain a good relationship with others in workplaces in the light of pedagogising encountering (Article 2). On similar premises, claiming and assuming responsibility for work tasks in workplaces (Musaeus, 2002; Pang, 2015; Reegård, 2015) have wider implications for students whose main concern seems to be their capacity for attunement and mutual adjustment to others. Students' resourcefulness to make themselves useful as opposed to a burden in workplaces (Ferm et al., 2018) can also be seen in the light of this developing capacity for attunement (Article 2). The participating students told stories of how they tried to make themselves useful to workplaces, of alienation and taking up the challenge of proving themselves fit for the job. Their testimonies generally confirm previous research (Conway & Foskey, 2015; Bakkevig et al., 2015; Pang, 2015; Sandal et al., 2014; Wegener, 2014), additionally displaying how students acknowledge the risks, uncertainties and responsibilities of the service provider inherent in pedagogising encountering.

The observed and reported pedagogised encounters had vague contours and could not be easily pinned down (Articles 1, 2 and 3). Students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming appeared (for example) in the Diploma project as elusive work on pedagogising encountering, fuzzily demarcated from commonsensical knowing (Article 3). In comparison, the base for knowing or

117

the content of this programme according to Lemar (2001) seems indistinct[69] (blurred) in outline. In her description of the instruction content and vocational pedagogy, work on the self is blurred with work on others with an explicit aim to develop a capacity for applying a general pedagogical approach. Thus, the lack of demarcation between the objective and subjective may contribute to perceptions of vocational knowing for service work in instruction as broad and disparate (Lemar, 2001) or even foggy (Hjelmér, 2012). At the programme's inception in upper secondary school in the 1990s, psychology, sociology, communication, pedagogical leadership and health pedagogy formed the backbone of an earlier version of the Child & Recreation Programme. This multi-disciplinary knowing foundation had to be interpreted by teachers in relation to occupation-specific knowing for work in nurseries, schools, after-school programmes and leisure centres. The overall aim of the Child & Recreation Programme was for students to develop a "pedagogical approach" to apply in "socio-pedagogical activities and recreation", according to Lemar (2001, p. 212). As Lemar's concern was not with students but with their teachers, her study provides no indications of how vocational pedagogy affected students' experience of vocational becoming as leaders with a pedagogical approach. However, this thesis and the appended papers show that students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming can accommodate the inevitable fuzziness of pedagogising encountering.

Pedagogising encountering seems difficult to capture through disciplined vocational knowing, e.g., framed in the vocational subject of pedagogy. This observation could potentially be extended to other emerging templates for service occupations. The conceptualised knowing required for service work is difficult to pinpoint (Dewey & Dewey, 1915; Krupskaja, 1985; Lunačarskij, 1981; Vygotskij, 1997/1926). Hence, students participating in the Diploma project drew on commonsensical understanding of team work in their vocational becoming. In their efforts to devise a written safety and security plan no utilisation of any theoretical insights into group work, from (for example) pedagogy as a vocational subject, was detected. It is even doubtful if such insights could have enriched their immediate task at hand or their lived experience of, e.g., chairing a group work session. This lived through experience of frequently unruly peer collaboration was a feature of their vocational

---

69 Content related to recreation was especially criticised for its weak theoretical anchorage in leisure science (Lemar, 2001).

becoming during the Diploma project. Tentatively, however, discipline-related insights, e.g., from the vocational subject pedagogy, could have enriched students' personalised work of the self and on the self.

7.1.2 Vocational Becoming as Students Managing Discontinuities

The difference in feedback-making between school- and workplace-based parts of education presents a type of discontinuity for students (Articles 1 and 2). The participating students' talk indicates that their experienced curriculum of vocational becoming arose between two porously rather than sharply bordered learning contexts of school and workplaces, such as nurseries and pre-schools, security companies and gyms. Students referred to scarcity or vagueness of feedback in both school and work contexts (Articles 1 and 2), in accordance with previous findings in people-centred VET (Bakkevig Dagsland et al., 2015). Tentatively, the variety and abundance of feedback in workplaces, perhaps more salient in other settings, e.g., machine-centred (Berner, 2009; Korp, 2012), may not be recognised by students. They need to treat the knowing that feedback refers to as specialised, which emerges in this thesis as a central feature of students' experience of vocational becoming. Therefore, students' growing sensitivity to their knowing as specialised in itself appears to be a central expression of their vocational becoming. This finding is a further development in line with Sandal et al. (2014) and Wegener (2014).

Boundaries within schools (Akkerman and Bakker, 2011) are another type of discontinuity addressed in Articles 3 and 4. For example, the participating prospective security officers crossed a porously defined boundary between vocational subjects: the Diploma project and training package (Article 3). These two seemingly similar and advanced courses share a focus on students' ability to perform recurrent work tasks and highly occupation-specific vocational knowing. I argue that these courses, apparently geared towards similar goals[70], presented an epistemic discontinuity to students. Such a discontinuity reflects what knowing is assessed as legitimate in cultural-historical formations of school and work/industry (cf. Akkerman & Bakker, 2012).

I contend that students reconciled and bridged such epistemic discontinuity arising from two different experiences, as teenage students-in-school-group-work (the Diploma project) and prospective-"modern"-security-officers (the

---

70 Although a Diploma project is also aligned with the Child & Recreation Programme's broader diploma goals.

training package). Becoming a modern security officer (a combination of a ninja, janitor, negotiator, technician and whistleblower) as rehearsed by students in the training package, is claimed to be set apart from the mode of being a responsible teenage student, practicing pedagogised encounters in group work in the Diploma project (Article 3). This non-sameness of experience, which is due to differing emphases in instruction as students live through them, means that students need to re-adjust according to how they interpret the social situation of the instruction, in a similar vein to what Vygotskij (1933/1934/2001) refers to as the social situation of development (Article 4). Therefore, students handle this epistemic discontinuity by what I call here generalising vocational knowing horizontally between vocational courses (Article 3), constructing two differing sets of associations (Beach, 2003).

Students get plenty of opportunities in the training package to form rich associations (cf. Bijlsma et al., 2016; Heusdens et al., 2016). In the Diploma project these opportunities seemed more restricted, possibly due to instruction being student-led, less structured and less scaffolded (cf. Vestergaard Louw, 2013). As students moved across the two vocational courses (the training package and Diploma project), they seemed to grasp conceptualised vocational knowing such as surveillance law in different experiential frameworks (Article 4). When they approached surveillance law from the perspective of an agile ninja entering a confined space, they could use surveillance law in manifold ways, e.g., as a means of self-protection (Articles 3 and 4). In contrast, in the Diploma project, students and teachers collectively emptied surveillance law of its specific occupational meanings, transforming it into a vehicle for practicing quite generic (pedagogised) social skills for school peer group work (Article 3). Therefore, students contributed to generalising surveillance law by flattening its meanings, approaching the subject in the Diploma project as generally commonsensical and everyday knowing (Articles 3 and 4). Such students' commonsensical approach to vocational knowing, particularly in relation to child care, has been previously identified as an obstacle or vocational threshold that students must cross (Steinnes, 2014; Wyszynska Johansson, 2015).

To recap, students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming, as observed and recorded in studies reported in this thesis, appears to be punctuated by blurred discontinuities. However, discontinuities may not necessarily be obstacles (Akkerman & Bakker, 2011). The epistemic discontinuity presented above offered students opportunities for generalising knowing how to attune to others in pedagogised encounters. Thus, epistemic

discontinuity enables two expressions of vocational becoming, that is, the pedagogised encounter and the vocational stance, run in parallel, fertilising each other. In the following subsection, what I mean by students developing a vocational stance is explained.

7.1.3 Vocational Becoming as Adopting a Vocational Stance

The pedagogised encounter forms a platform from which students develop an initial vocational stance, oriented towards aligning their personal and teenage resources with vocationally relevant sense-giving fields of child care or customer care (Articles 2, 3 and 4). Thus, stance encompasses for students occupation-specific ways to carry themselves in the world as integrative (emotionally, mentally and bodily) modes of being (Article 4). Therefore, adopting such an initial vocational stance entails a need for students to transform themselves (cf. Beach, 2003). Prospective security officers go through such a transformation as they ready themselves for dealing with risk and uncertainty by crossing certain thresholds (Vaughan, 2017; Articles 3 and 4). Those I observed and interviewed realised the importance of correctly dressing (in uniform) as an example of a gateway to becoming a security officer (Article 3) (Ulfsdotter Eriksson & Flisbäck, 2011). This vocational stance was facilitated by social recognition from significant others, i.e., instructors (Nielsen, 2008), in a widely recognised master-apprentice configuration (Chan, 2013a, 2013b; Korp, 2012; Articles 3 and 4).

The adoption of a vocational stance is supported by vocationalising concepts (Article 3). I contend that vocationalising concepts express generalising knowing horizontally and vertically. Prospective security officers vocationalise concepts building on a constant movement between the opposites of generalisation and particularisation. This horizontal movement is possible as emerging (vocationalised) concepts feed upon the strengths and weaknesses of each other, extending each other in accordance with the principle of the ZPD (Vygotskij, 1934). The thinness of abstraction is filled with the empirical thickness of teenage experience (as a filtering prism of periezhivanie) (Article 4), whereas this empirical experience transforms into handy models for vocational actions, such as inflicting restraint. Prospective security officers transform the everydayness of certain words, e.g., "anomaly" into useful shortcuts for action, whereas the "uniform" condenses and contains for them

conflicting symbolic meanings. This horizontal movement of generalising knowing in the development of a vocational stance is accompanied by the verticality of students' crossing vocational thresholds. These vocational thresholds include care, which may be both child- and customer-oriented (Articles 2, 3 and 4). Crossing these thresholds creates vertical surges that move the horizontal process of generalisation to a higher level in a spiralling movement, directed both inwards[71] and outwards[72], which relies on a group's expansion of learner readiness (Article 4).

7.2 Contribution of Feedback-Making

Addressing the second research question (*In what ways does the contribution of feedback-making shape young students' vocational becoming?*), two aspects are discussed:

- First, the adequacy and usefulness of feedback for students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming.
- Second, students' readiness for reciprocity of feedback-making as a marker of their experienced curriculum of vocational becoming.

7.2.1 Students Handling Adequacy and Usefulness of Feedback for Their Experienced Curriculum of Vocational Becoming

The students struggled to reconcile what they interpreted as a progression of legitimate vocational knowing and standard-based assessment. Those who were halfway through their education (Articles 1 and 2) associated feedback with knowledge requirements that they utilised for guidance and self-coaching towards the attainment of desired grades. The link between feedback and its summative function of communicating grades seemed difficult to untie, resulting in them placing feedback in the teacher's authority, as frequently previously reported (Gyllander Torkildsen & Ericson, 2016; Havnes et al., 2012; Peterson & Irving, 2008). However, the student experience of feedback as grade justification recorded here was closely tied to a dominance of teacherly scripts of knowledge requirements in students' accounts (Article 1). They claimed that they tried to decode and dutifully comply with the formulaic/mechanical

---

71 Expansion of learner readiness furthers vocationalising concepts
72 Vocationalising concepts lead to expansion of learner readiness

feedback centred on the three quality standards for written achievements. They also claimed to spend considerable time on, firstly, unpacking the three quality criteria for written assignments (writing in basic terms [översiktligt], in a well-grounded way [utförligt], and in a well-grounded and balanced way [[utförligt and nyanserat]), and then mapping their progression of vocational becoming onto these descriptors.

In this manner, the three knowledge criteria became for students, as they saw it, the guiding posts or, in the terminology of Hattie and Timperley (2007), both feedback and feedforward in coaching towards desired grades (Brockmann, 2012; Ecclestone, 2007; Jönsson et al., 2015; Torrance, 2007). I suggest that students may participate in such a "discourse of terminological standardisation" (Sundberg, 2018, p. 130), but the standards are made visible to them only *pro forma* (Article 1). In this light, the students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming was shaped by conforming to regimes of assessment based on performance standards of learning outcomes related to declarative knowledge, poorly fitted with student self-recognition of progression (Article 2). There are previously reported difficulties in fitting school standard-based assessment (Sundberg, 2018) with assessment in workplaces from a students' perspective (Sandal et al., 2014). I argue that such formulaic feedback appears instrumentalised from a students' perspective and may be of quite restricted value for their ability to self-assess their progression of vocational becoming (Articles 1 and 2), which has reported importance for vocational learning (Boud & Hawke, 2017).

According to advocates of assessment for learning (Assessment Reform Group, 2002; Lundahl, 2011) "better" learning is promoted by assessment regimes based on learning outcomes, with transparent grading criteria, and alignment between goals, outcomes, assessment and feedback. However, in the Child & Recreation Programme the fuzzy but flexible contents, methods and assessment are conflated with a clear goal of relational competence (Lemar, 2001) in what are here referred to as pedagogised encounters. Furthermore, a key feature of assessment regimes based on learning outcomes is transparency, which not only overlooks salient qualities that student participants in my studies referred to as "daring to try" or "ingrowing" but also may formalise, thus trivialising them (Article 2).

Feedback in the training package did not appear to share deficiencies recorded in a previous study (Havnes et al., 2012). Instruction in the package (Articles 3 and 4) was tightly monitored with an explicit goal of alignment with

certain sense-giving fields, and feedback appeared orchestrated to support these alignment processes. Instructor-led feedback-making, facilitating both self- and peer-feedback, assisted the expansion of learner readiness, while propelling students to adopt a vocational stance. For example, students oriented themselves towards surveillance law as a sense-giving field, when they deliberated (through interaction with instructors' feedback) whether abstaining from action may be the right way to act in a hypothetical situation (Article 4).

Returning to the issue of discontinuity between school and workplace feedback-making, inconspicuous feedback in workplaces poses challenges for students (Article 2). Nevertheless, reading non-verbal clues and cues may provide for some of them a powerful means to shape their vocational becoming for service work, as illustrated by the recordings of prospective personal trainers presented in Article 2. However, my perception was that the kind of service work that students in this study accessed and subsequently reflected on may offer intangible feedback that generally poses difficulties for students to unpack. The kinds of service work tasks they were able to try may offer no salient artefacts to gather round for collective investigation, as they may (for instance) in a workshop (Berner, 2009; Korp, 2012; Vestergaard Louw, 2013). Instead, students had to handle the intangibility of feedback on their own (Article 2), which has previously reported inadequacy (Wegener, 2014).

7.2.2 Vocational Becoming as Expanding Readiness for Reciprocity in Feedback-Making

The observed reluctance of students halfway through their education to participate in feedback (Articles 1 & 2) is in line with previous research (Havnes et al., 2012; Peterson & Irving, 2008; Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). However, in the light of vocational becoming through pedagogised encountering, their reluctance is understandable because they acknowledge feedback as an intricate social process dependent on reciprocity and attunement to others (Articles 1 and 2; Hochschild, 1983/2003; Leidner, 1993; McDowell, 2009). In studies reported in Articles 1-3, students gave accounts of adjusting to others, building on the reciprocity inherent in feedback. Notably, the students were aware that feedback must be handled with care, to prevent it from adversely interfering with social relations, e.g., through interpretation of feedback as encroachment on peers' private territory or teachers' authority (Article 1). This appeared to be a feature of the students' expanding learner readiness for service work in initial

stages of their vocational becoming. Thus, their acknowledgement of feedback as part of pedagogised encountering may have been a first step towards becoming ready for service work (Article 1).

This skill to manage feedback-making from a service provider's vocational stance must be developed from students' current level of learner readiness for service work. However, as shown in Article 1, students' learner readiness for feedback-making as a vocational skill varies. Some students relate to feedback-making as recipients only, rejecting efforts to make them participate in assessment and generally framing assessment as the teacher's business. Others may acknowledge that feedback-making is an intricate matter of the need to attune to others but they do not know how to engage in feedback-making in classroom settings (Article 1) or find it difficult to exploit in workplace-based settings (Article 2). Tentatively, students halfway through education may already acknowledge the complexity of feedback-making as part of their vocational becoming, but do not yet feel ready to handle it in interaction (Article 1). This may be especially likely if their experience of feedback is closely tied, if not confined, to summative assessment. However, the participating future security officers (Articles 3 and 4) appeared keen to engage in feedback as a reciprocal matter of interaction, revolving around tightly aligned occupation-specific contents. My conclusion is that their readiness to engage in peer feedback and self-assessment reflected expansion of their learner readiness for reciprocity of service work as pedagogised encountering. Next, the findings of the empirical studies are juxtaposed with typical features of the Child & Recreation Programme, then some implications of the findings for vocational pedagogy are discussed.

7.3 Vocational Pedagogy for Fuzzy or Flexible Vocational Becoming

With earlier descriptions of the Child & Recreation Programme as disparate and focused on the people-centred and relational (Lemar, 2001) I argue that this programme provides fuzziness that enables smooth accommodation of emerging, intangible rather than hard and fast templates for service work. The expansion of the Child & Recreation Programme has resulted in its branching out into several (including some recently established) trades. This expansion and specialisation reflect the programme's cultural-historical embeddedness (for example) accommodating societal changes such as expansion and

125

development of the welfare state. Hence, the students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming is embedded in and responsive to the emergent patterns of service occupations (Heinz, 2008). This responsivity allows gradual build-up and refinement of students' reciprocity in feedback-making as occupational ways of knowing and doing (Articles 1-4).

These recently emerging patterns include "human touch" centredness and a palpable focus on direct customer satisfaction. Such templates evolve from communities of practice, whose cultural-historical practices shape vocational conceptualised knowing (Articles 3 and 4). For instance, training to become a security officer has evolved from a rudimentary and on-the-job character. This kind of training, initially only targeting males, has emphasised the need to handle and maintain public trust as the security industry's main asset, and the legitimacy base for the security industry. This evolving, and thus fuzzy, quality of vocational knowing that students develop in the Child & Recreation Programme has been dealt with so far by collecting these emergent templates under the umbrella of a general pedagogical approach (Lemar, 2001) or what I call pedagogising encountering. In terms of enacted curriculum, framing vocational knowing as pedagogising encountering offers an elastic discursive means for handling this seemingly disparateness of occupations focused on care, support and customer satisfaction[73].

The focal training package and the Diploma project offered students different opportunities for vocational becoming through distinct ways of enacting feedback. Tightly regulated and instructor-led instruction allowed and encouraged feedback-making as an integrative vocational skill, but as a side effect rather than a specific learning outcome. Students were frequently facilitated by instructors to practice self- and peer-assessment. Feedback acknowledged and addressed students as prospective security officers, whereas the Diploma project reinforced their position as pupils in student-led school group work. In the former, feedback closely monitored students' progress with rich opportunities for peer-feedback, which together both supported and challenged the group's current state of learner readiness. In the latter, feedback arose randomly and may have failed to challenge the students' current state of learner readiness as it eventually became an exercise in generic social skills for school group work. Moreover, students sometimes create for themselves

---

73 These values are here acknowledged as gendered (Ambjörnsson, 2004), but are not further explored from such a perspective here.

pockets of comfort zones offered by group work to retire to (Ecclestone, 2007; Hjelmér, 2012; Rosvall et al., 2017).

The studies confirm general tendencies to reduce feedback to: grade coaching, formulaic terminology to support criteria compliance (Ecclestone, 2007; Jönsson et al., 2015; Shuichi, 2016; Torrance, 2007), and/or pseudo-formative techniques (Hirsh & Lindberg, 2015; Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). Between feedback that students experience as mechanical (report *in a well-grounded way* etc.) and feedback that they may reject as trivial (*you´re doing well*), students seem to be presented with few models for engaging in feedback for self-assessment. I argue therefore that students seem to be left to their own devices without really knowing what aspects of performance qualities deserve attention. This leaves students in a difficult position regarding the value of feedback-making for vocational becoming for service work. On the one hand, they may be learner ready to handle assessment related to interaction-intensive service work sensibly and responsibly. On the other hand, when the "why" and "because of" issues regarding feedback are not explicitly dealt with, students may be deprived of feedback practice, resulting in dismissiveness towards student-led assessment. Therefore, they may lack the required vocabulary for grading their quality of performance and describing progression beyond commonsensical or scripted feedback in ways that are attuned to others.

7.4 Further Research

The thesis contributes to several lines of research and indicates several gaps in research on vocational becoming. Firstly, the vocational becoming encapsulated in generalising knowing needs further attention. Secondly, students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming provides a vantage point for curriculum studies. Thirdly, the findings presented in the thesis have several implications for vocational pedagogy. I attend to each of these research gaps of relevance to USVET in the following text.

When young students with a limited range of life experience generalise knowing across contexts within school, e.g., in various vocational subjects, and in workplaces they start to differentiate knowing beyond a theory/practice dichotomy. This capacity to set apart everyday and commonsensical knowing from specialised (vocational) knowing marks their vocational becoming. Here vocational knowing for service work emerges for students as a multifaceted kind of knowing. The codified generalised knowing that students develop

through vocationalising concepts reciprocally influences their vocational becoming and can be applied to other vocational programmes. The power of feedback claimed in this thesis lies in its ability to move between the conceptual and particular, scaffolded by teacher-led instruction. Therefore, more research is needed on how feedback can facilitate such movement in developing vocational knowing oriented towards social skills that so far have apparently been quite elusive and context-bound. This process of gradual differentiation of knowing may pose difficulties for students to whom vocational knowing for service work may appear fuzzily demarcated from non-specialised knowing. More research is thus needed into feedback on social skills that avoids recourse to exclusively either layman's or abstract vocabularies.

The thesis also contributes to curriculum studies in two respects: by illuminating one of the three curriculum dimensions and aspects related to assessment. The findings indicate a need for further research on students' experienced curriculum as an emergent curriculum dimension in its own right rather than as a result of implementation. Further studies on the emergence of students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming may provide an account that highlights (and enhances) the roles of student agency in generalising knowing, and assessment of vocational knowing. Empirical studies of students' experienced curriculum may address emancipatory issues of students' voices as important stakeholders in vocational becoming.

Regarding vocational pedagogy, a robust finding of the studies supports previous research on the significance of teacher-led feedback as a facilitator of students' vocational becoming. Previous research has shown that students' and teachers' feedback literacy may be low, and there may be discrepancies between the two groups' views on its utility. Also evidenced is a feedback-making divide between school and workplace. Hence there is a need for teachers to support students to manage feedback-making across these contexts. In the Swedish context, vocational teachers are often employed on the basis of their prior work experience as no additional form of accreditation, e.g., a teaching qualification, is formally required (SOU, 2017:51). Employers are free to offer employment to whoever they deem suitable, prioritising for instance prospective candidates who have large contact networks with stakeholders in recipient industries (Skolverket, 2014) rather than merits in vocational pedagogy. Such teachers may have little understanding of ways to structure the experience of vocational becoming for students.

The findings also point to a need for further research on didactic design that vocational teachers apply, thereby influencing opportunities for more structured vocational becoming. In the training package, students related to surveillance law as a catalyst for specific vocational actions, sharpening students' awareness of surveillance law as both codified and situated. However, the group work in the Diploma project did not appear to be explicitly undergirded by the need for students to develop a relationship polytechnically (Dewey & Dewey, 1915) or a "theoretically-constructed-world" (Guile & Young, 2003, p. 78) and feedback-making by teachers and peers appeared to mirror this *ad hoc* and random quality of their collective feedback-making. Specifically, the studies indicate a need for more research on the role of feedback-making in students' opportunities to develop conceptualised vocational knowing and assist their vocational becoming.

The upper secondary school reform of 2011 was based on the assumption that workplace-based education will somewhat automatically strengthen vocational becoming through intensified contacts with, and sheer exposure to, working life. A recently introduced 100-credit Diploma project is a prime example of a drive to increase the students' employability upon graduation. A Diploma project is steered towards a programme-specific, but quite generally articulated goals and simultaneously geared towards the performance of occupation-specific work tasks. Successfully combining such prescribed generality and specificity seems a daunting task for the teacher. The thesis therefore points to a need to further investigate different didactic designs for Diploma projects, which apart from its clearly vocational character of a final qualification is also a formal requirement for the students to obtain eligibility for basic higher education.

7.5 Limitations

Finally, I comment on some limitations of my studies in the light of previous research. As I have explored students' experienced curriculum of vocational becoming in interaction (particularly feedback), the quality and breadth of the results were partially dependent on my ability to capture, record and analyse student interaction. During the course of the research my skills in interviewing young people have admittedly grown. In Study Two I could attend to student interaction with greater confidence that I would not "miss anything" than I could in Study One, although of course it is always impossible to be certain that

nothing has been missed. Hence, my self-imposed need to monitor and steer the students' interaction lessened, allowing their interaction to guide the course of the interviews to a greater extent. In my observations I closely followed the students' shifts of interest and focus, often between school and leisure-related matters. However, loosely structuring observations increases the likeliness of failure to detect and report all relevant interactions, thus increasing research bias, as described in detail together with my efforts to alleviate the risks in Section 5.9. More structured observation protocols with pre-specified types of interaction might have yielded different data. In addition, shorter focus group interviews on two occasions each, e.g., one at the beginning and one at the end of the study periods, would have enabled a comparison of students' expectations upon entry and final outcomes. Moreover, following through with students who for various reasons opted out from participation in instruction would have yielded complementary and certainly more conflictual interpretations of vocational becoming.

Other methodological limitations are also discussed in detail in Chapter 5 and are not further considered here. However, other important limitations lie in the heavily constrained settings of the empirical studies. As also detailed in Chapter 5, I observed and interviewed VET students of two Child & Recreation Programme classes in two Swedish schools (one chosen as an example of "best practice" and one a convenience sample). Thus, at best they captured snap-shot views of students training for fragmentary sections of the whole range of service occupations. Moreover, my interest and attention did not equally cover students training for all the occupations that the programme leads to. For example, vocational becoming as security officers is addressed in greater depth than in other relevant occupations, student experience of becoming personal assistants is not well illuminated here by my choice of illustrating excerpts[74], and some occupational trajectories are not considered at all except in the most general terms.

Clearly, these limitations strongly limit opportunities for generalisation of the results, but they increased opportunities to obtain rich insights regarding the focal settings. Despite the above limitations, and identified needs for further research, the thesis firmly puts student experience of vocational becoming

---

74 Social work attracts generally fewer students, despite good prospect for employment. However, some students particularly of the Pedagogical Work orientation, may reconsider these opportunities later (Skolverket, 2018b).

centre stage. By investigating the experienced curriculum of vocational becoming, the thesis also contributes to a more refined conceptual understanding of educational processes of feedback-making that form students' occupational ways of knowing and doings.

8 Swedish Summary

Eleverfarenhet av "yrkespersonsblivande" i gymnasial yrkesutbildning: att navigera med hjälp av återkoppling

Introduktion

Denna avhandling handlar om vad jag på svenska har kommit att benämna yrkespersonsblivande hos gymnasieelever. Med yrkespersonsblivande som ett centralt tema ansluter jag mig till studier av hur människor formas (*becoming*) i olika utbildningssammanhang (Beach, 1999, 2003). Detta innefattar här en sammanflätning av utveckling av yrkeskunskaper och yrkesidentitet. Min utgångspunkt är att elevers yrkespersonsblivande är ett vanskligt projekt där de unga prövar sig fram till en möjlig men inte bestämd yrkesbana. Jag utgår från att elever *skapar* mening av och genom erfarenhet (*student experience of vocational becoming*)[75]. Deras meningsskapande sker genom att pröva hur väl deras personliga uttryck, t ex deras sätt att framträda och interagera, sammanfaller med vad de tolkar som bedömningskrav från yrkeslärare, handledare på arbetsplatsen och klasskamrater. Yrkespersonsblivande framstår således som elevers sonderande och förberedande inför en möjlig förändring till att bli "någon annan" och för att kunna något annat. Jag har riktat uppmärksamhet mot interaktionsintensiva och människocentrerade serviceyrken (Heinz, 2008): personlig tränare, personlig assistent, barnskötare och väktare inom gymnasieskolans barn- och fritidsprogram.

En utgångspunkt i denna avhandling är elevers deltagande i vad som här kallas *feedback-making* (Taras, 2013) (görande av återkoppling, min översättning.) i yrkesutbildningssammanhang när de konstruerar sin så kallade genomlevda läroplan, grundad i praktisk erfarenhet. Elevers genomlevda läroplan refererar till vad Billett benämner som *the experienced curriculum*. Den genomlevda läroplanen utgör en av läroplansbegreppets tre åtskilda dimensioner (Billett, 2002),

---

[75] Med andra ord ska eleverfarenhet förstås i avhandlingen som en ontologisk kategori. För att kontrastera antyder termen elevers erfarenheter en epistemologisk kategori där erfarenhet förstås som något elever har, upplever, förhåller sig till och möjligen lär av.

dvs. den avsedda, den iscensatta och den genomlevda. Den genomlevda läroplanen handlar således om elevers konstruktion av en specifik dimension av läroplanen, och aktiviteten att leva igenom den eller med Vygotskijs begrepp erfara den (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001).

Syftet med denna studie är en fördjupad förståelse för unga elevers agens i yrkespersonsblivandet under den tid som de genomför sin gymnasieutbildning. Studien har genomförts med elever i en så kallad skolbaserad yrkesutbildning och två övergripande frågor besvaras: 1) Vilka uttryck för elevers erfarenhet av yrkespersonsblivande kan urskiljas i yrkesutbildning riktad mot människocentrerade serviceyrken? 2) Hur bidrar återkopplingsprocesser till att forma unga elevers yrkespersonsblivande?

Avhandlingen är en sammanläggningsavhandling med fyra artiklar och en syntetiserande kappa. I kappan knyter jag ihop de frågor som tillsammans belyser elevers yrkespersonsblivande. Nedan listas de fyra artiklarnas specifika forskningsfrågor som tillsammans avser att besvara de två övergripande forskningsfrågorna. Artikel 1: Vilka är elevers erfarenheter av bedömning och återkoppling från lärare och kamrater? Artikel 2: Hur uttrycker elever sin självupplevda progression genom den återkoppling de är delaktiga i under arbetsplatsförlagt lärande? Artikel 3: Vilka yrkesmässiga begrepp konstruerar elever? Hur bidrar återkoppling till att konstruera yrkesmässiga begrepp för specialiserat yrkeskunnande? Artikel 4: Vad framträder som bevakningsjuridik i undervisning för gymnasieelever som utbildas för att bli väktare? Hur medierar återkoppling elevers förståelse av bevakningsjuridik? Hur uttrycks elevers beredvillighet till deltagande i återkopplingsinteraktion angående bevakningsjuridik?

Bakgrund

Cirka en tredjedel av svenska ungdomar i åldrarna 16 upp till 20 år befann sig läsåret 2017/2018 i ett av de tolv nationella treåriga yrkesprogrammen som leder till en yrkesexamen. Utbildningen innehåller både yrkesämnen och gemensamma gymnasieämnen. Yrkesspecialiseringen sker gradvis och under såväl skolbaserat som arbetsplatsförlagt lärande. Enligt gymnasiereformen, Gymnasieskola 2011 (Gy2011) syftar yrkesexamen till anställningsbarhet bl. a. genom utveckling av en yrkesidentitet (Skolverket, 2012b). Barn- och fritidsprogrammet (BF), som infördes 1992, har genom åren expanderat till att idag omfatta tre inriktningar: pedagogiskt arbete, socialt arbete samt fritid och hälsa. Programmet utbildar för människocentrerade serviceyrken: barnskötare (pedago-

giskt arbete), personlig assistent och väktare (socialt arbete) och simhallsperso-
nal samt gyminstruktör (fritid och hälsa). BF är kvinnodominerat (ca 60 %)
(Skolverket, 2018b) och andelen elever som fortsätter att läsa vidare på
högskolan är relativt stort (ca 19 %) (Skolverket, 2017a). Arbetsutsikter för de
yrken som BF leder till är goda, i synnerhet för temporära anställningar (Arbets-
förmedlingen, 2018; Skolverket, 2018b). Programmet kan betraktas som inne-
hållsmässigt brett men också spretigt. Med Gy2011, inrättades pedagogik som
ett nytt yrkesämne, vilket präglar innehållet i hela programmet.

Ett pedagogiskt ledarskap för att möta och leda människor i varierande ål-
drar utgör programmets nav. Tillkomsten av nya interaktionsintensiva och män-
niskocentrerade serviceyrken ställer krav på elevers sociala färdigheter. Sådana
färdigheter har visat sig svåra att bedöma (Bolton, 2004; Grugulis & Vincent,
2009; Hurrell m fl., 2012; Leidner, 1993; Vincent, 2011). Programmet har be-
skrivits som utvecklandet av en generell pedagogisk kompetens där mål och
metod sammanflätas för att elever ska utveckla en sådan kompetens genom ar-
bete med sig själv som resurs (Lemar, 2001).

Då flertalet föräldrar till elever i barn- och fritidsprogrammet har en relativ
låg utbildningsbakgrund (Skolverket, 2018b) har programmet studerats från
olika ojämlikhetsperspektiv, företrädesvis om hur undervisning återskapar olika
aspekter av ojämlikhet. Till exempel kan ett alltför stort fokus på arbete med
elevers välbefinnande eller vad Lemar refererar till som omsorgsfällan (Lemar,
2001, s. 181), inskränka undervisningens värde för deras framtida karriär
(Hjelmér, 2012). Undervisningen i BF har i tidigare studier beskrivits så som att
den kännetecknas av en så kallad osynlig pedagogik där innehållet ofta är vad
som benämns som svagt klassificerat och där elevens arbete med sin personliga
utveckling i olika gruppkonstellationer betonas (Lemar, 2001). Barn- och fritids-
programmet framstår i Lemars studie som "teoretiskt" så till vida att det främst
är inriktat mot kunnande inom tvärvetenskapliga discipliner som pedagogik och
sociologi snarare än mot det yrkesspecifika kunnandet. Gymnasiereformens in-
tentioner med att fördjupa yrkesspecialisering inom BF har i Dynes studie
(Dyne, 2017) visat sig svåra att genomföra i relation till den nyinrättade yrkes-
utgången personlig tränare.

Människocentrerade serviceyrken är avhängiga av servicegivarens förmåga
att avläsa servicemottagarens behov och att därefter anpassa sitt yrkesmässiga
handlande (McDowell, 2009). I servicearbete är mänskliga relationer både en
process och en produkt där relationer mellan samtliga parter (servicemottagare,
servicegivare och arbetsgivare) är centrala och behöver balanseras (Leidner,

1993; Ulfsdotter Eriksson & Flisbäck, 2011). Servicearbete har även beskrivits i termer av låga kvalifikationer och lågt socialt anseende samt som känslomässigt krävande och därmed även verka tärande (Hansen Löfstrand m fl., 2016; Hochschild, 1983/2003).

Kunskapsöversikt

I kunskapsöversikten presenteras litteratur inom tre intresseområden, yrkesidentitetsutveckling, den genomlevda läroplanen och återkoppling. Syftet med översikten är att relatera studiens två övergripande frågor till tidigare relevant forskning. Sökningar genomfördes mestadels i Supersök, som är Göteborgs universitets databas, och Eric Ebsco inklusive Education Research Complete samt i Google Scholar. I kunskapsöversikten refereras endast till vetenskaplig litteratur (*peer-reviewed*), svensk, nordisk och internationell, inklusive avhandlingar och licentiatuppsatser från två svenska forskarskolor inom yrkesdidaktik samt yrkesämnenas didaktik. Följande engelska sökord användes: vocational/occupational identity formation (yrkesidentitet), feedback (återkoppling) samt experienced curriculum. Dessa nyckelord kombinerades i sökningen med: formative assessment, vocational education and training, student* experience*.

För att knyta an till denna studies kvalitativa ansats är kvalitativ forskning som använder intervju- och observationsmetodologier av intresse. Tidigare forskning om yrkesidentitetsutveckling representeras genom fem litteraturkluster. Dessa är 1) studier som inspireras av metaforen om *boundary-crossing* (gränsöverskridande, min översättning) (se t ex Tanggaard, 2007) 2) deltagande i praktikgemenskaper (Lave & Wenger, 1991) 3) transfer (se t ex Aarkrog, 2005) 4) utveckling av yrkeshabitus (Colley m fl., 2003) samt 5) generalisering av kunskap (se t ex Beach, 2003).

Studier av yrkesidentitetsutveckling i skolbaserad yrkesutbildning är få. Även empiriska studier av den genomlevda läroplanen är sällsynta i yrkesutbildningssammanhang. Mer teoretiskt inriktad forskning om den genomlevda läroplanen betonar samstämmigt en inbyggd oförutsägbarhet i läroplansbegreppet (Barone, 1980; Phillips, 1995; Schwab, 1978).

Forskning om återkoppling utgår ofta ifrån hur information hanteras enligt input- och outputparadigmet (Derry, 2013). I forskningen om formativ bedömning eller bedömning för lärande (Assessment Reform Group, 2002) tillskrivs återkoppling ett värde som stöd för elevers lärande. Studier visar dock att implementering och iscensättning av formativ bedömning är svår (se t ex Jönsson

m fl., 2015; Shuichi, 2016). Det råder också brist på studier som tar elevperspektiv på bedömningspraktik i yrkesutbildningar. Avhandlingens kunskapsöversikt om återkoppling struktureras utifrån tre teman: elevperspektiv på återkoppling; elevdeltagande i återkoppling samt sätt att genomföra återkoppling på. Överlag visar kunskapsöversikten att elever knyter återkoppling till lärarens summativa bedömning och att återkoppling kan anta mekaniska former för att guida elever mot önskade betyg genom att uppfylla på förhand bestämda kriterier (Havnes m fl., 2012). Studier i lärandekontexter på arbetsplatser visar att återkoppling bygger på ett skapande av en gemensam förståelse av betydelser i relation till skiftande arbetsuppgifter och mängden återkopplingskällor (Sandal m fl., 2014; Tanggaard & Elmholdt, 2008). Återkoppling i yrkesutbildningssammanhang beskrivs även som rik på interaktion (Berner, 2009; Korp, 2012; Vestergaard Louw, 2013) med elever som aktiva deltagare (Gåfvels, 2016; Öhman, 2017). Däremot visar några studier av yrkesutbildning att bedömning och återkoppling inte utmanar elever tillräckligt och att undervisningen styrs av bedömningskriterier i en guidning mot önskade betyg (Rosvall m fl., 2017; Hjelmér, 2012).

Kunskapsöversiktens samtliga tre delar bildar en bakgrund till undersökningens två övergripande forskningsfrågor. Dessa två forskningsfrågor pekar ut behovet av att studera interaktion. Denna interaktion är dock alltid inbäddad i relationer som är kulturhistoriskt formade. Det är därför av vikt att studera hur den interaktion som elever är inbegripna i kan bidra till deras yrkespersonsblivande. Fokus riktas mot elevers genomlevda läroplan som formar deras yrkespersonsblivande med hjälp av deltagande i återkoppling. Denna dimension av läroplansbegreppet handlar här om elevers kunskapsarbete, närmare bestämt hur elever generaliserar olika slags kunnande och hur generaliseringen framstår i ett dialektiskt förhållande till konkretisering. Båda processerna är avhängiga av återkoppling för att möjliggöra elevers meningsskapande.

Teoretiska aspekter

För att förstå elevers konstruerande av deras genomlevda läroplan används här Deweys teorier om erfarenhet, vilka kan förstås som ett kontinuum innehållande både det aktiva och det passiva elementet (1916/1999, 1938/1946; Dewey & Deen, 2012). Tillsammans med Vygotskijs senare teorier om erfarenhet som *periezhivanie* (переживание) (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001) bildar dessa ett ramverk för avhandlingens analytiska begrepp. Erfarenhet som *periezhivanie* är avhängigt av den sociala situationen för lärande, vilken i sin tur skiftar med

subjektens seende. Annorlunda uttryckt betonar *periezhivanie*[76] hur individer genom sitt subjektiva sätt att betrakta situationer (likt ett filter eller ljusbrytning) i själva verket skapar sociala situationer för lärande och hur dessa situationer återverkar på subjektens sätt att förhålla sig till det som pågår. Likt Vygotskij ser jag således elevers erfarenhet av yrkespersonsblivande som ett växelspel mellan den sociala situationen av lärande och det subjektiva filtret som både konstituerar och fångar upp de potentiella möjligheterna till att lära. Från Vygotskij hämtas också idén om hur språket hjälper individer att orientera sig mot övergripande meningsbärande fält, vilka Roth och Jornet refererar till som *sense-giving fields* (2017).

Avhandlingens två huvudbegrepp är den genomlevda läroplanen (Billett, 2002; 2006) och görande av återkoppling, vilka ytterligare kompletteras med två underbegrepp, *vocationalising concepts* (yrkesgörande av begrepp, min översättning till svenska) samt beredvillighet (*learner readiness*, min översättning till svenska) (Billett, 2015). Vygotskijs bärande idé om den proximala utvecklingszonen (1934) har också bidragit till min förståelse av görande av återkoppling.

Metod

För studien har etnografiskt inspirerade metoder använts i syfte att rekonstruera yrkespersonsblivande från ett elevperspektiv. Två undersökningar har genomförts, vilka refereras till som undersökning 1 (2012-2013) och undersökning 2 (2016). Studien bygger på fokusgruppintervjuer (undersökning 1) samt fokusgruppintervjuer tillsammans med deltagande observation (undersökning 2). Empirin består av 18 fokusgruppintervjuer som har transkriberats med totalt 92 elever i årskurs två och tre, samt fältanteckningar från ca 90 timmars klassrumsobservationer i två skolor. I studien deltog sammantaget 104 elever, de flesta i årskurs två, 71 flickor och 33 pojkar från totalt 12 skolor. Studien har en progression mellan undersökning 1 och undersökning 2. Inledningsvis riktas forskningsintresset mot elevernas erfarenhet av hur yrkeskunnande bedöms när de genomfört halva sin utbildning i BF (Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). Denna forskningsproblematik om bedömning av yrkeskunnande fördjupades sedan i undersökning 2. Fokus skiftade då till att undersöka hur eleverna genom görande av återkoppling konstruerar sin genomlevda läroplan i specialiseringen till blivande väktare. Samtliga fokusgruppintervjuer genomfördes med hjälp av en

---

[76] Begreppet är svårt att översätta utan att det tappar delar av sin betydelse.

tankekarta (Thomsson, 2010) för att främja elevernas delaktighet. De deltagande observationerna har varit löst strukturerade med uppmärksamhet på elevernas engagemang i uppgifter, uppgifters inbäddning i ett specialiserat yrkeskunnande samt uppgifters legitimering som form av kunnande. Fältanteckningar har kompletterats med transkriberade ljudinspelningar av undervisningssituationer. Elevgrupperna i undersökning 1 och undersökning 2 skiljer sig åt med avseende på förutsättningar för deras blivande som yrkespersoner. I den första undersökningen är eleverna halvvägs i sin utbildning och programmets bredd är av intresse medan i den senare undersökningen är det elevernas specifika blivande som väktare som genomlyses. Deltagande observationer har utförts i två typer av undervisning, kursen Gymnasiearbete 100 poäng samt ett utbildningspaket i regi av Bevakningsbranschens Yrkes- och Arbetsmiljönämnd, vilket motsvarar programfördjupningspaketet Bevakning och säkerhet 300 poäng för yrkesutgången väktare (Skolverket, 2012b).

Metodkombinationen av fokusgruppintervjuer och deltagande observationer har gett empiri för att studera elevernas yrkespersonsblivande i och genom deras genomlevda läroplan. Validitetsproblematiken som behandlas i relation till metoden inkluderar svårigheter i samband med 1) observation i hårt strukturerad klassrumsundervisning gentemot elevledda grupparbeten 2) att få djup i fokusgruppintervjuer 3) min förtrogenhet med fältet 4) positiv snedvridning av resultat i relation till elevgruppen.

Genom analysen av producerad data i undersökning 1 konstruerade jag teman för elevers kollektiva och mångröstade dialog (Bachtin, 1986; Marková m fl., 2007; Wertsch, 1992). Analysen genomfördes med hjälp av mjukvaran för kvalitativa analyser NVivo 10. För analys av data i undersökning 2 har genomgående så kallade *derived notes* använts (Yin, 2015) för att bearbeta både det transkriberade materialet och fältanteckningarna och för att konstruera tentativa, datanära teman. Dessa teman har på nytt använts för analys av hur elevutsagor och elevinteraktion i undervisningen och i samtal speglades i varandra.

Studien följer Vetenskapsrådets rekommendationer för forskning om unga över 15 år (Vetenskapsrådet, 2011, 2017). Samtyckeskrav, muntligt och skriftligt, har uppfyllts. Kraven på konfidentialitet under samtliga faser av undersökningen och skyddad förvaring av data har också tillgodosetts genom en låst och lösenordsskyddad förvaring på institutionen. Att omvandla elevers utsagor och handlingar, som sker i en vardaglig kontext av undervisningsrelaterad interaktion i skolmiljö till en akademisk text, kräver varsamhet. Denna varsamhet handlar om att på ett trovärdigt, källtroget och respektfullt sätt omvandla

de ungas genomlevda erfarenhet till en skriftlig text som riktar sig till en heterogen publik.

Resultat

Studiens resultat som belyser elevers yrkespersonsblivande presenteras genom en inbyggd progression i de analytiska begrepp som används. Två huvudbegrepp, den genomlevda läroplanen och görande av återkoppling, kompletteras successivt med två underbegrepp, yrkesgörande av begrepp i artikel 3 och beredvillighet i artikel 4.

I den första artikeln[77] undersöks elevers erfarenhet av yrkeslärares bedömningspraktik i barn- och fritidsprogrammets klassrum. Denna artikel introducerar vad jag kommit att benämna görande av återkoppling och har ett starkt fokus på elevers meningsskapande.

Studien bygger på 13 transkriberade fokusgruppintervjuer med sammantaget 70 elever i årskurs två på tio skolor i västra Sverige. I likhet med tidigare forskning uppger eleverna, som vid tillfället för undersökningen var halvvägs genom sin utbildning, lärares återkoppling som vag och endast inriktad på resultat, dvs. summativ.

Enligt eleverna reduceras ofta bedömningen av yrkeskunnande till deklarativ kunskap i skrift där kunskapskraven i ämnesplanernas trestegs-progression framträder som tydligast: *översiktligt, utförligt* samt *utförligt och nyanserat.* Trots att eleverna utbildas till att bli pedagogiska ledare uppger de att de får få tillfällen att träna sin förmåga att hantera kamratbedömning (Topping, 2009, 2010) och att engageras i att förse kamrater med återkoppling i klassrummet, även om de uppger att de ibland initierar feedbacksutbyten utanför klassrummet. I linje med tidigare studier framstår ofta eleverna som skeptiska till ett större deltagande i återkopplingsprocesser tillsammans med kamrater eftersom de mestadels förknippar återkoppling med lärares arbete. Eleverna som befinner sig halvvägs i sin utbildning för serviceyrken börjar uppskatta och se vidden av den ömsesidighet i relationer och interaktion som finns inbyggd i görande av återkoppling från ett servicegivare/servicetagare perspektiv. Denna servicegivare/servicetagare relation som eleverna är i färd med att utveckla och behovet av att bygga in stödjande strukturer för elevaktivt görande av återkoppling krä-

---

[77] Wyszynska Johansson, M., & Henning Loeb, I. (2015). Yrkeselevers erfarenheter om bedömning och återkoppling. Kritiska röster från Barn- och Fritidsprogrammet. *Forskning om undervisning och lärande,* 14, 6-23.

ver didaktisk skicklighet hos yrkeslärare. Utan lärares hjälp får eleverna svårigheter att överskrida rollen som endast passiva mottagare av återkoppling, vilket kan hindra deras utveckling mot att bli pedagogiska ledare som en viktig aspekt av yrkespersonsblivandet.

Den andra artikeln undersöker elevers genomlevda läroplan som uppstår i skärningspunkten mellan två dimensioner av arbetsplatsens läroplan (Billett, 2002, 2006), den avsedda och den iscensatta[78]. Den genomlevda läroplanen studeras som ett handlingsutrymme för elevers agensutövning i relation till den arbetsplatsförlagda delen av deras utbildning.

Artikeln bygger på 13 fokusgruppintervjuer med 70 elever som befinner sig halvvägs genom sin utbildning. Utgångspunkten för analysen av den genomlevda läroplanen är förståelse för den diskontinuitet i bedömningspraktiker som elever kan tänkas uppleva när de får tillgång till lärande på arbetsplatsen (Kvale, 2008; Tanggaard, 2006; Tanggaard & Elmholdt, 2008). Resultaten bekräftar tidigare forskning. Eleverna uttrycker behov av verbal bekräftelse från sina handledare angående sin progression, t ex en förändring de själva anser att de genomgår och självbedömer. Deras självbedömda progression verkar relatera till öppna personliga mål som t ex mod att våga kliva ur en tonårsroll i vuxna arbetslivssammanhang. Även mer subtil och icke-verbal återkoppling vars betydelse eleverna själva tolkar i relation till en arbetsplats, t ex bland gyminstruktörer på en träningsanläggning, formar deras yrkespersonsblivande. I linje med tidigare forskning uppger eleverna att de balanserar mellan vad de tror arbetsplatsen kräver och att de försöker visa sin lämplighet för yrket, t ex genom att visa sig som resurs för arbetsplatsen.

Artikeln argumenterar för att elevers upplevelse och förståelse av progression, som en följd av självbedömning, grundas på en inifrån-relation till en yrkesspecifik yrkespraxis snarare än de av skolan preciserade kunskapskraven. I utvecklandet av denna inifrån-relation till yrkespraxis orienterar sig eleverna genom görande av återkoppling mot vissa för yrket centrala värden, t ex omsorg om barn eller omsorg om kund. Omsorg om kund kristalliseras för eleverna som handhavande av försäljning. I den genomlevda läroplanen öppnas ett utrymme för självbedömning, vilket kan resultera i att elever tränar problemlösning, rådighet och modet att våga. Denna artikel argumenterar således för ett generösare förhållningssätt till bedömning av elevers yrkeskunnande under arbetsplatsförlagt lärande.

---

[78] Accepterad för publicering i ett temanummer av Nordic Journal of Vocational Education and Training.

I den tredje artikeln[79] studeras elevers yrkespersonsblivande i yrkesutgången väktare. Väktarspecifikt yrkespersonsblivande framstår som tätt sammankopplat med utveckling av begreppsmässigt yrkeskunnande eller vad jag benämner yrkesgörande av begrepp. I artikeln visar jag hur yrkesgörande av begrepp sker genom kollektivt resonerande (jfr Brandom, 2000) i ett gemensamt skapat och upprätthållet kommunikationsutrymme (*space of reasons*, min översättning till svenska.).

Empirin består av fem fokusgruppintervjuer och ca 90 timmars deltagande observation av klassrumsundervisning med sammanlagt 34 elever i årskurs två och tre i barn- och fritidsprogrammet i två skolor. Observationerna genomfördes under två kurser, kursen Gymnasiearbete 100 poäng och kursen Bevakning och säkerhet 300 poäng, som kan beskrivas som ett utbildningspaket i bevakningsbranschens regi.

Artikeln belyser hur elevernas utveckling av begreppsmässigt yrkeskunnande sker i en ständig pendelrörelse mellan olika grader av generalisering. Denna dialektiska rörelse för utvidgning av elevers begreppsmässiga kunnande pendlar från det konkreta och det personliga till det mer allmänna och åter till det personliga och genomlevda. Artikeln argumenterar för att elevernas yrkesgörande av begrepp sker i enlighet med principen för den proximala utvecklingszonen som en drivande mekanism (Vygotskij, 1934). Två frågor besvaras: 1) Vilka begrepp konstrueras som yrkesmässiga av elever? 2) Hur bidrar återkoppling i yrkesgörande av begrepp för ett specialiserat yrkeskunnande?

Resultatet visar att eleverna konstruerar fem yrkesmässiga och begreppsliga områden. Eleverna, genom att fylla vardagliga och välbekanta termer med nya yrkesspecifika innebörder, 1) omvandlar innebörden av avvikelse 2) "fullbordar" väktaruniform 3) tränar ansvarsutkrävande 4) orienterar sig mot det moderna väktaridealet 5) för tillbaka yrkesmässiga och väktarspecifika begrepp till att fungera som redskap för träning av sociala färdigheter i ett typiskt skolgruppsarbete. Genom att instruktörerna i utbildningspaketet iscensätter både självbedömning och kamratbedömning inbjuds eleverna till yrkesgörande av begrepp. Studien visar hur instruktörsledd undervisning, inbäddad i yrkespraxis och rik i begreppsmässigt kunnande, tenderar att förse eleverna med flertal möjligheter till yrkesgörande av begrepp. I Gymnasiearbete 100p tunnas däremot det begreppsmässiga och yrkesspecifika innehållet ut. Grupparbetet

---

[79] Wyszynska Johansson, M., Wärvik, G.-B. & Choy, S. (2018). Vocationalising specialized concepts: Appropriating meanings through feedback [Yrkesgörande av begrepp: att skapa mening genom återkoppling] *Vocations and Learning*, doi 10.1007/s12186-018-9204-4

kvarstannar då i sociala färdigheter av allmän karaktär. Under sådana grupparbeten hanterar eleverna specialiserat yrkeskunnande endast utifrån vardagskunskaper. Artikeln argumenterar således att Gymnasiearbete 100p förstärker elevernas identitet som socialt ansvarsfulla och flexibla elever, studiekamrater i oförutsägbara situationer under ett grupparbete. Vidare pekar artikeln på vikten för yrkeslärare att dels i stunden skapa, dels upprätthålla ett kollektivt kommunikationsutrymme för att elever ska kunna dra nytta av återkoppling i syfte att utveckla ett begreppsmässigt yrkeskunnande som stödjer deras yrkespersonsblivande.

I den fjärde artikeln[80] undersöks hur elever tillsammans utvidgar sin beredvillighet (*learner readiness*, min översättning till svenska.) för bevakningsjuridik. Bevakningsjuridik i kontexten av ett branschdrivet utbildningspaket för väktare, fullt integrerat med barn- och fritidsprogrammet, kan för gymnasieungdomar med begränsad livserfarenhet framstå som ett tämligen främmande yrkeskunskapsområde. Följande tre frågor behandlas i artikeln: 1) Vad för slags bevakningsjuridik framträder för unga elever i undervisningen för att bli väktare? 2) Hur stöder görande av återkoppling elevers förståelse för bevakningsjuridik? 3) Hur uttrycks elevers beredvillighet för bevakningsjuridik genom deras görande av återkoppling i undervisningen för att bli väktare?

Artikeln bygger på fem fokusgruppintervjuer med elever från årskurs två och tre i barn- och fritidsprogrammet i två skolor och ca 90 timmars deltagande observationer av klassrumsundervisning. Illustrerande empiriska exempel rör undervisning i regi av Bevakningsbranschens Yrkes- och Arbetsmiljönämnd med tio av de sammanlagt 34 eleverna i en av skolorna.

I denna artikel visas hur eleverna tillsammans väver en beskrivning av sina ansträngningar att länka med och orientera sig mot bevakningsjuridik som ett yrkesspecifikt betydelsebärande fält (Roth & Jornet, 2017). Elevernas expanderande beredvillighet för bevakningsjuridik framstår här som en viktig markör för deras väktarblivande. Artikeln redogör för hur bevakningsjuridiken integreras med elevernas personliga uttryck för väktarblivandet, och som utökar deras repertoar av handlingar i form av nya och integrativa, dvs. affektiva-kroppsliga-intellektuella, sätt att vara. Även omvänt och för att förstå hur elevernas nya handlingsmönster återspeglar deras ständigt utvidgande beredvillighet för bevakningsjuridiken, används Vygotskijs begrepp *periezhivanie* (переживание) (1933/1934/2001). Elevernas nya handlingsmönster träder transaktivt fram i en

---

[80] Manuskript inskickat för publicering.

växelverkan mellan deras erfarenheter (som *periezhivanie*) och den sociala situationen av lärande (Vygotskij, 1933/1934/2001).

För det första visar resultatet att bevakningsjuridik i undervisningen fylls med innebörder som innefattar ett ständigt pågående samspel mellan fyra aspekter. De fyra aspekterna av bevakningsjuridik är 1) förankring i vardaglig förståelse av rättvisa 2) bas för handlingsplaner 3) frihet att både initiera eller avstå från handlingar 4) väktares utökade lagliga skydd under givna förhållanden. För det andra bygger instruktörsledd återkoppling på ett erkännande av elevernas vardagliga förståelse av bevakningsjuridik samtidigt som den stöder expansionen av deras beredvillighet för bevakningsjuridik i riktning mot mer yrkesspecifikt kunnande. För det tredje inbjuder instruktörsledd återkoppling elever till själv- och kamratbedömning och därigenom deltar eleverna aktivt i görande av återkoppling.

De nya betydelserna av bevakningsjuridik som eleverna utvecklar under ett kort tidsspann leder till att de utvecklar en yrkesmässig positionering, (*vocational stance*, min översättning till svenska) som grundas i en kollektiv expansion av beredvillighet för bevakningsjuridik. Grunden för den yrkesmässiga positioneringen eller hållningen verkar vara 1) medvetenhet av behovet att handha väktares bemyndigande som yrkesperson 2) medvetenhet om yrkesmässiga gränser gentemot närliggande praktikgemenskaper 3) medvetenhet om bevakningsjuridik som schema för handlingar.

Artikeln är ett bidrag till det yrkesdidaktiska fältet genom att erbjuda en mer nyanserad förståelse av unga elevers yrkespersonsblivande där instruktörsledd undervisning dels bekräftar, dels utmanar elevers aktuella och visade beredvillighet för konceptuellt svåra aspekter av yrkeskunnande. Artikeln behandlar även vikten och behovet av ett lärarlett görande av återkoppling för att stödja genom att utmana denna beredvillighet.

Diskussion

Resultaten och analyserna visar hur interaktion, kommunikation, empati och personlig utveckling kännetecknar yrkespersonsblivande för elever i barn- och fritidsprogrammet. För eleverna förefaller förmågan att bemöta andra "rätt" som centralt i programmet, som idag är explicit inriktat mot yrkesspecialisering och anställningsbarhet. Detta relationella arbete genomsyrar yrkespersonsblivande i de tre ganska disparata inriktningarna: pedagogiskt arbete, socialt arbete samt fritid och hälsa. Yrkeskunnande för servicearbetet tonar för eleverna fram som inbäddat i signifikanta värden som omsorg, lyhördhet och anpassning till

andras behov samt kundnöjdhet. Yrkeskunnande för servicearbetet, som undervisningens innehåll, förvandlar servicearbetet till pedagogiserade möten (*pedagogised encounter*, min översättning till svenska) i varierande sammanhang, t ex i förskolan, på en träningsanläggning eller i ett bevakningsbolag. Yrkespersonsblivande för personliga tränare och väktare i undersökningen genomsyras av saluförande av tjänst. Saluförandet av tjänst formas om till ett pedagogiserat möte där omsorg om kund i olika faser av försäljning är centralt.

Yrkesblivandets progression kan beskrivas med start i pedagogiserade möten som plattform för fortsatt yrkesmässig positionering. Denna positionering inbegriper en omfattande förvandling på flera plan (jfr Beach, 1999) och en orientering mot meningsbärande fält av omsorg om barn och omsorg om kund. Yrkesmässig positionering stöds av yrkesgörande av begrepp (artikel 3 & 4) och kan med hjälp av Beach (2003) beskrivas som generalisering av yrkeskunnande. Yrkesmässig positionering sker därför horisontellt, driven av yrkesgörande av begrepp tvärs över de två olika kontexterna av Gymnasiearbete 100p och väktarutbildningspaketet. Samtidigt sker positioneringen vertikalt eftersom yrkesgörande av begrepp också inbegriper särskilt meningsbärande yrkesmässiga trösklar (*vocational thresholds*) (Vaughan, 2017) (artikel 3 & 4).

Genom en gradvis positionering kan eleverna generalisera kunnande tvärs över olika kontexter, t ex i väktarutbildningspaketet och i Gymnasiearbete 100p. Elevernas yrkespersonsblivande utifrån den genomlevda läroplanen tonar fram som en horisontell rörelse (Beach, 1999, 2003) av länkning med och orientering mot centrala aspekter av servicearbetet, samtidigt som programmets typiska fokus på mjuka värden, diskursivt framställda som generellt pedagogiska (artikel 3) bibehålls. För att tala med Beach (2003) konstruerar eleverna två system av associationer när de generaliserar yrkeskunnande. Exempelvis generaliseras bevakningsjuridiken på ett rikare och mer mångfacetterat sätt i väktarutbildningspaketet jämfört med i Gymnasiearbete 100p (jfr Bijlsma m fl., 2016; Heusdens m fl., 2016). När generalisering av yrkeskunnande i det senare fallet töms på yrkesmässigt innehåll, begränsas grupparbetets potential för träning av pedagogiserade möten. Tidigare forskning har visat på samma tendenser (Steinnes, 2014; Wyszynska Johansson, 2015). I Gymnasiearbete 100p, ett elevlett grupparbete som är mer fristående från lärares stöd, och som har en mindre grad av stödjande strukturer (*scaffolding*) (jfr Vestergaard Louw, 2013), verkar det som att görande av återkoppling erbjuder mindre hjälp för generalisering av kunskap utanför den specifika och mestadels skriftliga uppgiften. Min slutsats är att de

generella kunskaperna om t ex grupprocesser tydligare behöver knytas an till ett yrkesspecifikt innehåll (artikel 3).

Yrkespersonsblivande tonar fram som ett handhavande av otydliga diskontinuiteter då eleverna hanterar olikheter av olika slag, t ex i görande av återkoppling i skola respektive arbetsplats eller inom olika kurser. Eleverna upplever skillnader i görande av återkoppling i skolan och på arbetsplatsen som en subtil och vag diskontinuitet, i synnerhet jämfört med görande av återkoppling i ting-centrerade yrkesutbildningar (Berner, 2009; Korp, 2012; Vestergaard Louw, 2013). Denna diskontinuitet kan förstås i ljuset av att eleverna både i skolan och på arbetsplatser är sysselsatta med att iscensätta pedagogiserade möten. I denna diskontinuitet, som eleverna har att hantera, finns en inbyggd vaghet och som bidrar till deras svårigheter att urskilja yrkeskunnande som specialiserat. I undersökningen framstår därför elevernas urskiljande av sitt eget yrkeskunnande som ett specialiserat och pedagogiserat mote som en viktig markör för yrkespersons-blivande (Sandal m fl., 2014).

Görande av återkoppling framhäver i samtliga artiklar olika kunskaper som legitima och kan därför med hjälp av tidigare forskning beskrivas som en epistemisk diskontinuitet. I artikel tre och fyra undersöks en epistemisk diskontinuitet mellan två närliggande yrkeskurser, Gymnasiearbete 100p och väktarutbildningspaketet. Eleverna förenar och överbrygger på egen hand två handlings-mönster i såväl Gymnasiearbete 100p som i väktarutbildningspaketet. Det ena handlar om att på ett ansvarsfullt sätt genomföra ett typiskt grupparbete med studiekamrater och det andra handlar om att utveckla en yrkesmässig positionering som blivande väktare. Eleverna driver således fram sitt yrkespersonsblivande genom att överbrygga dessa distinkta men ändå subtilt åtskilda sätt att vara på snarare än att tillägna sig ett specifikt kunskapsstoff.

Instruktörsledd återkoppling i väktarutbildningspaketet befrämjar ständigt både själv- och kamratbedömning och assisterar därigenom eleverna i yrkesgörande av begrepp (artikel 3 & 4). Genom det kollektiva yrkesgörandet av begrepp positionerar sig eleverna yrkesmässigt. Denna positionering påminner om vad Beach beskriver som livsförändrande (*conseqential transition*) (1999, 2003) och observeras när eleverna t ex är redo att hantera "fullbordandet av väktaruniform" (artikel 3) mot bakgrund av sin expanderande beredvillighet för bevakningsjuridik (artikel 4).

I linje med tidigare forskning förknippar även eleverna i denna studie återkoppling med lärares summativa bedömning när de befinner sig halvvägs genom sin utbildning. Halvvägs i sin utbildning är eleverna mycket upptagna av

att begripliggöra relationen mellan kunskapskraven och lärandemålen och vad de upplever som progression i sitt lärande. Eleverna försöker foga in sin växande förståelse för det specifika yrkeskunnandet i de färdiga och ganska mekaniska formerna för att kommunicera bedömning genom kunskapskraven (artikel 1 & 2). I linje med tidigare forskning, deltar eleverna i en ganska ytlig kunskapsstandardisering som inte nödvändigtvis gagnar deras yrkespersonsblivande (Sundberg, 2018) utan istället guidar dem mot önskade betyg, vilket har uppmärksammats tidigare (Brockmann, 2012; Ecclestone, 2007; Torrance, 2007).

Görande av återkoppling, i kontrast till endast passivt mottagande, blir däremot en del av elevers blivande som servicegivare där förmågan att läsa av servicetagarens behov är centralt. I linje med tidigare studier visas även här hur beroende eleverna är av lärares hjälp för att utveckla denna insikt men även för att praktisera elevledda bedömningsformer, t ex självbedömning och kamratbedömning. Elevernas förmåga att kunna se görande av återkoppling som en del av att växa in i yrkesrollen sker däremot från deras varierande utgångslägen. Elevernas beredvillighet för att engageras i återkoppling samspelar med deras växande förståelse för ömsesidighet som inbyggd i servicearbete.

Elevernas upplevda läroplan förefaller inbäddad i kulturhistoriskt framväxta formationer av serviceyrken, vilka kännetecknas av fokus på kundtillfredsställelse i interaktion genom mänskligt möte. Barn- och fritidsprogrammet har visat sig svara väl mot framväxten av nya interaktionsintensiva serviceyrken genom att samla det yrkeskunnande som krävs för dem kring en generell pedagogisk kompetens (Lemar, 2001). Den genomlevda läroplanen i denna studie formas således av träning i pedagogiserade möten utifrån yrkesspecialisering men även tvärs över yrkeskurser där yrkeskunnande generaliseras genom yrkesgörande av begrepp.

Intentionerna med Gy2011 har varit att intensifiera samarbetet med avnämare. Gymnasiearbete 100p utgör ett exempel på detta samarbete. I relation till elevers anställningsbarhet som är gymnasiereformens yttersta mål, är yrkesspecialiserade kurser, t ex Gymnasiearbete 100 poäng, intressanta i sammanhanget. Denna kurs erbjuder möjligheter för elever att visa både bredd men framförallt djup i sitt kunnande när de förväntas utföra de vanligt förekommande arbetsuppgifterna. Denna studie visar hur svår kombinationen av både bredd och yrkesmässigt djup kan vara att åstadkomma i relation till yrkeskunnande för servicearbete.

Denna studie rör frågor om hur yrkeslärare på bästa sätt kan stödja elevers utveckling av ett specialiserat begreppsmässigt yrkeskunnande. Här visas hur beroende elever kan vara av lärares hjälp för att utveckla ett sådant lärande och att kamrater inte alltid kan utmana varandra tillräckligt, inte heller i utbildningar som behandlar pedagogiskt ledarskap. Elevernas yrkespersonsblivande framstår därför som beroende av lärarledd återkoppling. Återkopplingen stimulerar elevernas rörelse mellan begreppsliggörande av kunnande för servicearbetet horisontellt tvärs över olika kontexter och konkretisering, inbäddad i deras vardagsförståelse (jfr Bijlsma m fl., 2016; Heusdens m fl., 2016). I likhet med Steinness (2014) och Sandal m fl. (2014), behöver eleverna lärares hjälp med att engageras i återkoppling bortom vardagsförståelser eller enbart från arbetslivet hämtade betydelser av servicearbete. Därför bidrar denna studie till en djupare förståelse av hur *feedback literacy* (återkopplingslitteracitet, min översättning till svenska.) utgör en viktig del av yrkeslärares didaktiska kompetens. Detta bidrag kan ses i ljuset av att yrkeslärare är undantagna kravet på lärarlegitimation samt att yrkeslärarexamen inte krävs för att få en anställning. Avsaknaden av lärarexamen kan innebära att yrkeslärares stöttning med återkoppling i undervisningen endast modelleras enligt återkoppling på arbetsplatser, något som lärare kanske känner mest förtrogenhet med. Det kan också finnas en risk för att lärare förbiser möjligheter att strukturera elevers yrkespersonsblivande didaktiskt (jfr de Bruijn, 2012) med återkoppling som ett didaktiskt redskap.

Studiens resultat kan ses i ljuset av två begränsningar. För det första vittnar studien om hur de valda metoderna, dvs. intervju och observation, ytterst är beroende av forskarens hantverksmässiga skicklighet och säkerhet över tid. För det andra begränsas definitionen av människocentrerat och interaktionsintensivt servicearbete till några yrkesområden. Trots begränsningarna bidrar denna studie till en teoretiskt grundad diskussion om hur elever formas till yrkespersoner genom återkoppling.

References

Aarkrog, V. (2005). Learning in the workplace and the significance of school-based education: A study of learning in a Danish vocational education and training programme. *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 24*(2), 137-147. doi: 10.1080/02601370500056268

Akkerman, S. F., & Bakker, A. (2011). Boundary crossing and boundary objects. *Review of Educational Research, 81*(2), 132-169. doi: 10.3102/0034654311404435

Akkerman, S. F., & Meijer, P. C. (2011). A dialogical approach to conceptualizing teacher identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 27*(2), 308-319.

Akkerman, S. F., & Bakker, A. (2012). Crossing boundaries between school and work during apprenticeships. *Vocations and Learning, 5*(2), 153-173. doi: 10.1007/s12186-011-9073-6

Allais, S. (2014). *Selling out education: National qualifications frameworks and the neglect of knowledge.* Rotterdam: Sense. Retrieved from https://doi-org.ezproxy.ub.gu.se/10.1007/978-94-6209-578-6

Allvin, M. (2006). *Gränslöst arbete: socialpsykologiska perspektiv på det nya arbetslivet.* [Boundless work: Social-psychological perspectives on the new working life] (1st ed.) Malmö: Liber.

Ambjörnsson, F. (2004). *I en klass för sig: Genus, klass och sexualitet bland gymnasietjejer.* [In a class of its own: Gender, class and sexuality among upper secondary girls] (Doctoral thesis, Stockholm University, Sweden). Stockholm: Ordfront.

Aoki, T. T. (1993). Legitimating lived curriculum: Towards a curricular landscape of multiplicity. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision, 8*(3), 255-268.

Arbetsförmedlingen. (2018). V*ar finns jobben? Bedömning för 2018 och på fem års sikt* [Where are the jobs? Assessment for 2018 and for five years on]. Retrieved from https://www.arbetsformedlingen.se/download/18.85c88291615e16646a4e186/1518080417950/var-finns-jobben-2018.pdf

Asplund, S.-B., & Kilbrink, N. (2018). Learning how (and how not) to weld: Vocational learning in technical vocational education. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 62*(1), 1-16. doi: 10.1080/00313831.2016.1188147

Assessment Reform Group. (2002). *Assessment for learning: Ten principles.* Retrieved from http://www.hkeaa.edu.hk/DocLibrary/SBA/HKDSE/Eng_DVD/doc/Afl_principles.pdf

Bakhtin, M. (1981). *The dialogic imagination: Four essays by M. M. Bakhtin.* Holquist, M. (Ed.). (C. Emerson & M. Holquist, transl.). Austin: University of Texas Press.

Bakhtin, M. (1986). *Speech genres and other late essays.* Emerson, C., & Holquist, M. (Eds) (V. McGee, transl.). Austin: University of Texas Press.

Bakkevig Dagsland, Å. H., Mykletun, R. J. & Einarsen, S. (2015). "We're not slaves – we are actually the future!" A follow-up study of apprentices' experiences in the Norwegian hospitality industry. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 67*(4), 460-481. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2015.1086411

Bakhurst, D. (2007). Vygotsky's demons. In H. Daniels, M. Cole, & J. V. Wertsch, (Eds.), *The Cambridge companion to Vygotsky* (pp.50-76). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bakhurst, D. (2011). *The formation of reason.* Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell.

Barone, T. E. (1980). Effectively critiquing the experienced curriculum: Clues from the "New Journalism". *Curriculum Inquiry*, *10*(1), 29-53.

Beach, D. (2005). From fieldwork to theory and representation in ethnography. In G. Troman, B. Jeffrey, & G. Walford (Eds.), *Methodological issues and practices in ethnography* (1st ed.) (pp. 1-17). Amsterdam: Elsevier JAI.

Beach, K. (1999). Chapter 4: Consequential transitions: A sociocultural expedition beyond transfer in education. *Review of Research in Education 24*(1), 101-139. doi: 10.3102/0091732X024001101

Beach, K. (2003). Consequential transitions: A developmental view of knowledge propagation through social organisations. In T. Tuomi-Gröhn, Y. Engeström (Eds.), *Between school and work: New perspectives on transfer and boundary-crossing* (pp. 39-61) Bingley: Emerald.

Bennett, R. E. (2011). Formative assessment: A critical review. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice, 18*(1), 5-25. doi: 10.1080/0969594X.2010.513678

Berner, B. (2009). Learning control: Sense-making, CNC machines, and changes in vocational training for industrial work. *Vocations and Learning, 2*(3), 177-194. doi: 10.1007/s12186-009-9023-8

Berner, B. (2010). Crossing boundaries and maintaining differences between school and industry: Forms of boundary-work in Swedish vocational education. *Journal of Education and Work, 23*(1), 27-42. doi: 10.1080/13639080903461865

Bernstein, B. (1996/2000). *Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: Theory, research, critique.* (Rev. ed). Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield.

Bijlsma, N., Schaap, H., & de Bruijn, E. (2016). Students' meaning-making and sense-making of vocational knowledge in Dutch senior secondary vocational education. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 68*(3), 378-394. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2016.1213763

Billett, S. (2002). Workplace pedagogic practice: Co-participation and learning. *British Journal of Educational Studies 50(4)*, 457-481. doi: 10.1111/1467-8527.t01-2-00214

Billett, S. (2004). Learning through work: Workplace participatory practices. In H., Rainbird, A., Fuller, & A., Munro (Eds.), (pp. 109-125). *Workplace learning in context.* New York, N.Y.: Routledge. doi: 10.4324/9780203571644

Billett, S. (2006). Constituting the workplace curriculum. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 38*(1), 31-48. doi: 10.1080/00220270500153781

Billett, S. (2011). Subjectivity, self and personal agency in learning through and for work. In
M. Malloch, L. Cairns, K. Evans, & B. O'Conner (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of workplace learning* (pp. 60–72). London: SAGE.

Billett, S. (2015a). *Integrating practice-based experiences into higher education.* Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.

Billett, S. (2015b). Readiness and learning in health care education. *The Clinical Teacher*, *12*(6), 367-372. doi: 10.1111/tct.12477

Billett, S. (2017). The Dutch vocational education system: Institutional focus and transformations. In E., de Bruijn, E, S., Billett, & J. Onstenk (Eds.), *Enhancing teaching and learning in the Dutch vocational education system:*

Reforms enacted (pp. 269-294) Cham: Springer.

Biesta, G. (2005). Against learning. Reclaiming a language for education in an age of learning. *Nordic Studies in Education*, *25*(01), 54-66.

Bolton, S. C. (2004). Conceptual confusion: Emotion work as skilled work. In C. Warhurst, I. Grugulis, & E. Keep (Eds.), *The skills that matter* (pp. 19-37). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Boud, D., & Hawke, G. (2017, March). *Changing pedagogy: Vocational learning and assessment.* OVAL Research Working Paper. The Australian Centre for Organisational, Vocational and Adult Learning.

Brandom, R. (2000). *Articulating reasons: An introduction to inferentialism.* Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Braverman, H. (1999). *Labor and monopoly capital: The degradation of work in the twentieth century* (25th anniversary ed.) New York: Monthly Review.

Brockmann, M. (2010). Identity and apprenticeship: The case of English motor vehicle maintenance apprentices. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 62*(1), 63-73. doi: 10.1080/13636820903461354

Brockmann, M. (2011). Problematising short-term participant observation and multi-method ethnographic studies. *Ethnography and Education, 6*(2), 229-243. doi: 10.1080/17457823.2011.587361

Brockmann, M. (2012). *Learner biographies and learning cultures: Identity and apprenticeship in England and Germany.* London: Tufnell Press.

Brockmann, M. (2013). Learning cultures in retail: Apprenticeship, identity and emotional work in England and Germany. *Journal of Education and Work, 26*(4), 357-375. doi: 10.1080/13639080.2012.661847

Brockmann, M., & Laurie, I. (2016). Apprenticeship in England – the continued role of the academic–vocational divide in shaping learner identities. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 68*(2), 229-244 doi: 10.1080/13636820.2016.1143866

Bronkhorst, L. H., & Akkerman, S. F. (2016). At the boundary of school: Continuity and discontinuity in learning across contexts. *Educational Research Review, 19*, 18-35. doi: 10.1016/j.edurev.2016.04.001

Brooker, R., & Butler, J. (1997). The learning context within the workplace: As perceived by apprentices and their workplace trainers. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 49*(4), 487-510. doi: 10.1080/13636829700200028

Brooker, R., & Macdonald, D. (1999). Did we hear you?: Issues of student voice in a curriculum innovation. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, *31*(1), 83-97. doi: 10.1080/002202799183313

Burgess, R. G. (2006). An ethnographer's tale: A personal view of educational ethnography. In D. Hobbs, & R. Wright (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Fieldwork*, (pp. 292-306). United Kingdom, London: SAGE. doi: 10.4135/9781848608085

Carlgren, I., Forsberg, E., & Lindberg, V. (2009). *Perspektiv på den svenska skolans kunskapsdiskussion* [Perspectives on the knowledge discussion of the Swedish school]. Stockholm: Stockholms universitets förlag.

Carlsson, C.-G., Gerrevall, P., & Pettersson, A. (2007). *Bedömning av yrkesrelaterat kunnande.* [Assessment of work related knowing]. Stockholm: HLS förlag.

Chaiklin, S. (2003). The zone of proximal development in Vygotsky's analysis of learning and instruction. In A. Kozulin, B. Gindis, V. S. Ageyev, & S. M. Miller (Eds.), *Vygotsky's educational theory in cultural context* (pp. 39-64). Retrieved from https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.ezproxy.ub.gu.se

Chan, S. (2013a). Learning through apprenticeship: Belonging to a workplace, becoming and being. *Vocations and Learning, 6*(3), 367–383. doi: 10.1007/s12186-013-9100-x

Chan, S. (2013b). Proximal participation: A pathway into work. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 65*(4), 474-488. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2013.838289

Chan, S. (2015a). The contribution of observation to apprentices' learning. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 67*(4), 442-459. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2015.1062999

Chan, S. (2015b). Apprentices' learning of occupationally informed practical judgment. *Vocations and Learning, 8*(3), 335-351. doi: 10.1007/s12186-015-9134-3

Chan, S. (2017). Assisting with qualification completion by applying the concept of occupational identity as conferred before self-inference: A longitudinal case study of bakery apprentices. *Vocations and Learning, 10*(2), 121-140. doi: 10.1007/s12186-016-9164-5

Chan, S., & Leijten, F. (2012). Using feedback strategies to improve peer-learning in welding. *International Journal of Training Research, 10*(1), 23-29. doi: 10.5172/ijtr.2012.10.1.23

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2011). *Research methods in education* (7th ed.).Abingdon: Routledge.

Colley, H., James, D., Diment, K., & Tedder, M. (2003). Learning as becoming in vocational education and training: Class, gender and the role of vocational habitus. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training 55*(4), 471-498. doi: 10.1080/13636820300200240

Collin, K., Paloniemi, S., Virtanen, A., & Eteläpelto, A. (2008). Constraints and challenges on learning and construction of identities at work. *Vocations and Learning, 1*(3), 191-210. doi: 10.1007/s12186-008-9011-4

Conway, M.-L., & Foskey, R. (2015). Apprentices thriving at work: Looking through an appreciative lens. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 67*(3), 332-348. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2015.1054863

Dafermos, M. (2018). *Rethinking Cultural-Historical theory.* Singapore: Springer.

de Bruijn, E. (2012). Teaching in innovative vocational education in the Netherlands. *Teachers and Teaching, 18*(6), 637-653. doi: 10.1080/13540602.2012.746499

Delamont, S. (2008). For lust of knowing - observation in educational ethnography. In G. Walford (Ed.), *How to do educational ethnography* (pp. 39-56). London: Tufnell Press.

Derry, J. (2013). *Vygotsky, Philosophy and Education.* Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley Blackwell.

Dewey, J. (1916/1999). *Demokrati och utbildning.* [Democracy and education]. Göteborg: Daidalos.

Dewey, J. (1938/1946). *Experience and education.* New York: Macmillan.

Dewey, J., & Deen, P. (2012). *Unmodern philosophy and modern philosophy.* Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press.

Dewey, J., & Dewey, E. (1915). *Schools of to-morrow.* New York: Dutton.

Doucet, A., & Mauthner, N. S. (2012). Knowing responsibly: Ethics, feminist epistemologies and methodologies. In T. Miller, M. Birch, M. Mauthner, & J. Jessop (Eds.), *Ethics in Qualitative Research* (2nd ed.) (pp. 122-139). London: SAGE.

REFERENCES

Dyne, E. (2017). *Personlig tränare – framtidsväg eller återvändsgränd? En gymnasial yrkesutgång inom barn- och fritidsprogrammet.* [Personal trainer – A pathway into the future or a blind alley? An upper secondary school vocational outcome within the Child and Recreation Programme]. (Licentiate thesis, University of Gothenburg, Sweden). Retrieved from https://gupea.ub.gu.se/bitstream/2077/54574/2/gupea_2077_54574_2.pdf

Ecclestone, K. (2007). Commitment, compliance and comfort zones: The effects of formative assessment on vocational education students' learning careers. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice 14*(3), 315–333. doi: 10.1080/09695940701591925

Edwards, A. (2005). Let's get beyond community and practice: The many meanings of learning by participating. *Curriculum Journal, 16*(1), 49-65.doi: 10.1080/0958517042000336809

Erikson, J. (2017). A school for all or a school for the labour market? Analyzing the goal formulation of the 1991 Swedish upper secondary education reform. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, *61*(2), 139-154. doi: 10.1080/00313831.2015.1119726

Esping-Andersen, G. (1990). *The three worlds of welfare capitalism.* Cambridge: Polity.

European Commission (2015). *2015 Joint Report of the Council and the Commission on the implementation of the strategic framework for European cooperation in education and training (ET 2020) — New priorities for European cooperation in education and training.* Official Journal of the European Union, C 417. Retrieved from http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=OJ:C:2015:417:TOC

Evans, K., Guile, D., Harris, J., & Allan, H. (2010). Putting knowledge to work: A new approach. *Nurse Education Today, 30*(3), 245-251. doi: 10.1016/j.nedt.2009.10.014

Ferm, L., Persson Thunqvist, D., Svensson, L., & Gustavsson, M. (2018). Students' strategies for learning identities as industrial workers in a Swedish upper secondary school VET programme. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 70*(1), 66-84. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2017.1394357

Fern, E. F. (2001). *Advanced focus group research.* London: SAGE.

Filliettaz, L. (2011). Collective guidance at work: A resource for apprentices? *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 63*(3), 485-504. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2011.580359

Fjellström, M. (2014). Project-based vocational education and training: Opportunities for teacher guidance in a Swedish upper secondary school. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 67*(2), 187-202. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2014.983957

Fleer, M., Rey, F. G., & Veresov, N. (Eds.) (2017). *Perezhivanie, emotions and subjectivity: Advancing Vygotsky's legacy.* Singapore: Springer.

Forsberg, E., & Lindberg, V. (2010). *Svensk forskning om bedömning: en kartläggning* [Swedish research on assessment: A survey] (Research Report No. 10:2). Stockholm: Vetenskapsrådet.

Forsberg, E., Nihlfors, E., Pettersson, D., & Skott, P. (2017). Curriculum code, arena, and context: Curriculum and leadership research in Sweden. *Leadership and Policy in Schools*, *16*(2), 357-382. doi: 10.1080/15700763.2017.1298811

France, A. (2004). Young people. In S. Fraser, V. Lewis, M. Kellett, S. Ding, & C. Robinson (Eds.), *Doing research with children and young people* (pp.175-190). London: SAGE.

Fuller, A., & Unwin, L. (2004). Expansive learning environments: Integrating organizational and personal development. In H. Rainbird, A. Fuller, & A. Munro (Eds.), *Workplace learning in context* (pp. 126-144). New York, N.Y.: Routledge.

Gåfvels, C. (2016). *Skolad blick på blommor: formandet av yrkeskunnande i floristutbildning* [Educated gaze on flowers: The formation of vocational knowing in floristry education] (Doctoral thesis, Stockholm University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:953521/FULLTEXT01.pdf

Gamlem, S. M., & Smith, K. (2013). Student perceptions of classroom feedback. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice, 20*(2), 150-169. doi: 10.1080/0969594X.2012.749212

Gessler, M., & Moreno Herrera, L. (2015). Vocational didactics: Core assumptions and approaches from Denmark, Germany, Norway, Spain and Sweden. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training, 2*(3), 152-160. doi: 10.13152/IJRVET.2.3.1

Goodlad, J. I. (Ed.) (1979). *Curriculum inquiry: The study of curriculum practice.* New York: McGraw-Hill.

Gorz, A. (2001). *Arbete mellan misär och utopi.* [Work between misery and utopia]. Göteborg: Daidalos.

Grandey, A. A., Diefendorff, J. M., & Rupp, D. E. (2013). Bringing emotional labor into focus: A review and integration of three research lenses. In A. A. Grandey, J. M. Diefendorff, & D. E. Rupp (Eds.), *Emotional labor in the 21st century: Diverse perspectives on the psychology of emotion regulation at work* (pp. 3-27). New York: Routledge.

Grbich, C. (2013). *Qualitative data analysis: an introduction* (2nd ed.). Los Angeles: SAGE.

Grubb, W. N., & Lazerson, M. (2009). The education gospel and vocationalism in an international perspective: The promises and the limits of formal schooling. In R. Maclean, & D. Wilson (Eds.), *International handbook of education for the changing world of work: Bridging academic and vocational learning* (pp.1791-1803). Dordrecht: Springer.

Grugulis, I., & Vincent, S. (2009). Whose skill is it anyway?: 'soft' skills and polarization. *Work, Employment and Society, 23*(4), 597-615. doi: 10.1177/0950017009344862

Guile, D. (2006). Learning across contexts. *Educational Philosophy and Theory, 38*(3), 251-268. doi: 10.1111/j.1469-5812.2006.00193.x

Guile, D. (2010). *The learning challenge of the knowledge economy.* Rotterdam: Sense.

Guile, D., & Young, M. (2003). Transfer and transition in vocational education: Some theoretical considerations. In T. Tuomi-Gröhn, & Y. Engeström (Eds.), *Between school and work: New perspectives on transfer and boundary-crossing* (pp. 63-81). Bingley: Emerald.

Gyllander Torkildsen, L., & Erickson, G. (2016). 'If they'd written more…' – On students' perceptions of assessment and assessment practices. *Education Inquiry, 7*(2), 137-157. doi: 10.3402/edui.v7.27416

Halkier, B. (2010). *Fokusgrupper* [Focus groups] (1st ed.). Malmö: Liber.

Hammersley, M., & Atkinson, P. (2007). *Ethnography: Principles in practice* (3rd ed.). Abingdon: Routledge.

Hammarsley, M. (2008). Assessing validity in social research. In P. Alasuutari, L. Bickman, & J. Brannen (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of social research methods* (pp. 42-53). London: SAGE.

Hansen Löfstrand, C., Loftus, B., & Loader, I. (2016). Doing 'dirty work': Stigma and esteem in the private security industry. *European Journal of Criminology 13*(3), 297–314. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1177/1477370815615624

Hattie, J. (2012). *Visible learning for teachers: Maximizing impact on learning.* London: Routledge.

Hattie, J., & Timperley, H. (2007). The power of feedback. *Review of Educational Research, 77*(1), 81-112. doi: 10.3102/003465430298487

Havnes, A., Smith, K., Dysthe, O., & Ludvigsen, K. (2012). Formative assessment and feedback: Making learning visible. *Studies in Educational Evaluation 38*(1), 21-27. doi: 10.1016/j.stueduc.2012.04.001

Heinz, W. R. (2008). Occupational socialization. In F. Rauner, & R. Maclean (Eds.), *Handbook of technical and vocational education and training research* (pp.481-489). Dordrecht: Springer.

Heusdens, W. T., Bakker, A., Baartman, L. K. J., & de Bruijn, E. (2016). Contextualising vocational knowledge: A theoretical framework and illustrations from culinary education. *Vocations and Learning, 9*(2), 151–165. doi: 10.1007/s12186-015-9145-0

Heusdens, W. T., Baartman, L. K. J., & de Bruijn, E. (2018). Knowing everything from soup to dessert: An exploratory study to describe what characterises students' vocational knowledge. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 1-20. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2018.1437065

Hill, M. (1998). *Kompetent för "det nya arbetslivet"? Tre gymnasieklasser reflekterar över och diskuterar yrkesförberedande studier [Competent for "the new work life"? Three student groups in upper secondary school reflect and discuss preparatory vocational studies].* (Doctoral thesis, University of Gothenburg, Sweden). Göteborg: Acta Universitatis Gothoburgensis.

Hirsh, Å., & Lindberg, V. (2015). *Formativ bedömning på 2000-talet – en översikt av svensk och internationell forskning* [Formative assessment in the 21st century-An overview of Swedish and international research]. Stockholm: Vetenskapsrådet. Retrieved from http://su.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:853190/FULLTEXT01.pdf

Hjelmér, C. (2012). *Leva och lära demokrati?: En etnografisk studie i två gymnasieprogram* [Live and learn democracy? An ethnographic study in two upper secondary school programs] (Doctoral thesis, Umeå University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A578685&dswid=313

Hjorth Liedman, M., & Liedman, S.-E. (2008). Den livslånge lärlingen [The lifelong apprentice] *Utbildning & Demokrati, 17*(1), 17-28.

Hochschild, A. R. (1983/2003). *The managed heart: Commercialization of human feeling: Twentieth anniversary edition with a new afterword* (2nd ed.). Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press.

Holland, D., & Lachicotte, W., Jr. (2007). Vygotsky, Mead, and the new sociocultural studies of identity. In H. Daniels, M. Cole, & J. V. Wertsch (Eds.), *The Cambridge companion to Vygotsky* (pp. 101-135). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Holloway, I., & Todres, L. (2003). The status of method: Flexibility, consistency and coherence. *Qualitative Research 3*(3), 345–357. doi: 10.1177/1468794103033004

Hordern, J. (2014). How is vocational knowledge recontextualised? *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 66*(1), 22-38. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2013.867524

House, E. R. (2014). Origins of the ideas in *Evaluating with Validity*. In J. C. Griffith, &
B. Montrosse-Moorhead (Eds.), *Revisiting truth, beauty, and justice: Evaluating with validity in the 21st century. New Directions for Evaluation*, *142*, 9–15.

Hume, A., & Coll, R. (2010). Authentic student inquiry: The mismatch between the intended curriculum and the student-experienced curriculum. *Research in Science & Technological Education, 28*(1), 43-62. doi: 10.1080/02635140903513565

Hurrell, S. A., Scholarios, D., & Thompson, P. (2012). More than a 'humpty dumpty' term: Strengthening the conceptualization of soft skills. *Economic and Industrial Democracy, 34*(1), 161-182. Retrieved from https://doi-org.ezproxy.ub.gu.se/10.1177/0143831X12444934

Jackson, P. W. (1968/1990). *Life in classrooms*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Johansson, M. (2009). *Anpassning och motstånd: En etnografisk studie av gymnasieelevers institutionella identitetsskapande* [Adaption and resistance. An ethnographic investigation of the development of institutional identities amongst upper secondary school pupils] (Doctoral thesis, University of Gothenburg, Sweden). Göteborg: Göteborgs universitet. Retrieved from https://gupea.ub.gu.se/bitstream/2077/20234/1/gupea_2077_20234_1.pdf

Jönsson, A., Lundahl, C., & Holmgren, A. (2015). Evaluating a large-scale implementation of assessment for learning in Sweden. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice, 22*(1), 104-121. doi: 10.1080/0969594X.2014.970612

Jónsson, Í. R., Smith, K., & Geirsdóttir, G. (2018). Shared language of feedback and assessment. Perception of teachers and students in three Icelandic secondary schools. *Studies in Educational Evaluation, 56*, 52-58. doi: 10.1016/j.stueduc.2017.11.003

Jornet, A., & Roth, W.-M. (2016). *Perezhivanie*—A monist concept for a monist theory. *Mind, Culture, and Activity, 23*(4), 353-355. doi: 10.1080/10749039.2016.1199703

Kawulich, B. B. (2005). Participant observation as a data collection method. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 6*(2). Retrieved from https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.ub.gu.se/docview/60042480?accountid=11162

Kilbrink, N., Bjurulf, V., Olin-Scheller, C., & Tengberg, M. (2014). Experiences of educational content in Swedish technical vocational education: Examples from energy and industry programmes. *International Journal of Training Research, 12*(2), 122-131. doi: 10.1080/14480220.2014.11082035

Kirpal, S. (2004). Researching work identities in a European context. *Career Development International, 9*(3), 199-221. doi: 10.1108/13620430410535823

Kitzinger, J. (1995). Qualitative research: Introducing focus groups. *British Medical Journal 311*(7000), 299-302. doi: 10.1136/bmj.311.7000.299

Klope, E. (2015). *I skuggan av ett yrke: Om gymnasieelevers identitetsskapande på hantverksprogrammet frisör* [In the shadow of a vocation – identity creation within the vocational education and training for hairdressers] (Licentiate thesis, Stockholm University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:799560/FULLTEXT02

Klotz, V., Billett, S., & Winther, E. (2014). Promoting workforce excellence: Formation and relevance of vocational identity for vocational educational training. *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training, 6*(6), 1-20. doi: 10.1186/s40461-014-0006-0

Konkola, R., Tuomi-Gröhn, T., Lambert, P., & Ludvigsen, S. (2007). Promoting learning and transfer between school and workplace. *Journal of Education and Work, 20*(3), 211-228. doi: 10.1080/13639080701464483

Korp, H. (2006). *Lika chanser i gymnasiet? En studie om betyg, nationella prov och social reproduktion* [Equal chances in upper secondary school? A study of grading, national tests and social reproduction] (Doctoral thesis, Malmö högskola, Sweden). Retrieved from http://muep.mau.se/bitstream/handle/2043/7717/HelenaKorpFINAL.pdf?seq

Korp, H. (2011). What counts as being smart around here? The performance of smartness and masculinity in vocational upper secondary education. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 6*(1), 21-37. doi: 10.1177/1746197910397909

Korp, H. (2012) 'I think I would have learnt more if they had tried to teach us more' – performativity, learning and identities in a Swedish Transport Programme. *Ethnography and Education, 7*(1), 77-92. doi: 10.1080/17457823.2012.661589

Kotarbiński, T. (1982). *Traktat o dobrej robocie* [Treatise on good work] (7th ed.). Wrocław: Ossolineum.

Krogstad Svanes, I., & Skagen, K. (2017). Connecting feedback, classroom research and Didaktik perspectives. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 49*(3), 334-351. doi: 10.1080/00220272.2016.1140810

Krupskaja, N. K. (1985). *On labour-oriented education and instruction.* Moscow: Progress.

Kvale, S. (1996). *InterViews: An introduction to qualitative research interviewing.* Thousand Oaks: SAGE.

Kvale, S. (2007). *Doing interviews* (1st ed.). Thousand Oaks: SAGE.

Kvale, S. (2008). A workplace perspective on school assessment. In EARLI/Northumbria Assessment Conference (2008). *Balancing dilemmas in assessment and learning in contemporary education,* (pp.197-208). New York: Routledge.

Labaree, D. F. (2010). How Dewey lost: The victory of David Snedden and social efficiency in the reform of American education. In D. Tröhler, T. Schlag, & F. Osterwalder (Eds.), *Pragmatism and modernities* (pp. 163-188). Rotterdam: Sense.

Lather, P. (1986). Issues of validity in openly ideological research: Between a rock and a soft place. *Interchange*, *17*(4), 63-84. doi: 10.1007/BF01807017

Lave, J., & Wenger, E. (1991/2005). *Situated learning: Legitimate peripheral participation.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Leidner, R. (1993). *Fast food, fast talk: Service work and the routinization of everyday life.* Berkeley: Univ. of California Press.

Lemar, S. (2001). *Kaoskompetens och gummibandspedagogik: en studie av karaktärsämneslärare i en decentraliserad gymnasieorganisation* [Chaos competence and elastic band teaching: A study of vocational subject teachers in the decentralised upper secondary school] (Doctoral thesis, Umeå University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:156234/FULLTEXT01.pdf

Levinsson, M., & Prøitz, T. (2017). The (non-)use of configurative reviews in education. *Education Inquiry, 8*(3), 209-231. doi: 10.1080/20004508.2017.1297004

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry.* Beverly Hills.: SAGE.

Lindberg, V. (2003). Vocational knowing and the content in vocational education. *International Journal of Training Research, 1*(2), 40-61, DOI: 10.5172/ijtr.1.2.40

Lindberg, V. (2016). *Final scientific report. Project, network and doctoral programme* (Report No 11-5301). n.p.

Linell, P. (1994). *Transkription av tal och samtal: teori och praktik* [Transcription of speech and conversations: Theory and practice]. Linköping: Univ., Tema kommunikation.

Lofland, J., & Lofland, L. H. (1995). *Analyzing social settings: A guide to qualitative observation and analysis.* (3rd ed.) Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth.

Lunačarskij, A. V. (1981). *On education: Selected articles and speeches.* Moscow: Progress.

Lundahl, C. (2006). *Viljan att veta vad andra vet. Kunskapsbedömning i tidigmodern, modern och senmodern skola* [To know what others know: Assessment in education in pre-modern, modern and late-modern times] (Doctoral thesis, Uppsala University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://nile.lub.lu.se/arbarch/aio/2006/aio2006_08.pdf

Lundahl, C. (2011). *Bedömning för lärande* [Assessment for learning]. Stockholm: Norstedt.

Lundahl, C. (2017, November). *Läroplansteori och bedömning* [Curriculum theory and assessment]. Paper presented at the 7th Nordic Curriculum Theory Conference, University of Gothenburg, Göteborg.

Lundahl, L., Arreman, I. E., Lundström, U., & Rönnberg, L. (2010). Setting things right? Swedish upper secondary school reform in a 40-year perspective. *European Journal of Education, 45(1)*, 46–59. doi: 10.1111/j.1465-3435.2009.01414.x

Marcus, G. E. (1995). Ethnography in/of the world system: The emergence of multi-sited ethnography. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, *24*, 95-117. doi: 10.1146/annurev.an.24.100195.000523

Marková I., Linell, P., Grossen, M., & Salazar Orvig, A. (2007). *Dialogue in focus groups: Exploring socially shared knowledge*. London: Equinox.

Marsh, C. J. (2009). *Key concepts for understanding curriculum* (4th ed.). Abingdon: New York: Routledge.

Mårtensson, Å., & Andersson, P. (2017). Tid för handledning [Time for supervision]. In A. Fejes, V. Lindberg, & G.-B. Wärvik (Eds.), *Yrkesdidaktikens mångfald* [Diversity of vocational pedagogy] (pp. 125-138). Stockholm Lärarförlaget.

McDowell, L. (2009). *Working bodies: Interactive service employment and workplace identities*. Chichester, UK: Wiley-Blackwell.

Merry, S., Price, M., Carless, D., & Taras, M. (2013). Conclusion and reflections. In S. Merry, M. Price, D. Carless, & M. Taras (Eds.), *Reconceptualising feedback in higher education: Developing dialogue with students* (pp. 204-209). Abingdon: Routledge.

Mikkonen, S., Pylväs, L., Rintala, H., Nokelainen, P., & Postareff, L. (2017). Guiding workplace learning in vocational education and training: A literature review. *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training 9*(9). doi:10.1186/s40461-017-0053-4

Miller, R. (2011). *Vygotsky in perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Musaeus, P. (2002). Klædt på till læring [Dressed to learn]. In *Fra bjælker og spær - til butik og salg: Tre casestudier af læring i vekseluddannelse* [From beams and rafters to stores and sale. Three case studies of learning in vocational education and training] (pp. 82-171). Aalborg: Institut for kommunikation, Aalborg Universitet.

Nielsen, K. (2008) Scaffold instruction at the workplace from a situated perspective. *Studies in Continuing Education*, *30*(3), 247-261. doi: 10.1080/01580370802439888

Norlund, A. (2009). *Kritisk sakprosläsning i gymnasieskolan. Didaktiska perspektiv på läroböcker, lärare och nationella prov* [Critical reading of non-fiction in upper secondary school. Didactical perspectives on textbooks, teachers and national tests] (Doctoral thesis, University of Gothenburg, Sweden). Retrieved from https://gupea.ub.gu.se/handle/2077/18958

Öhman, A. (2015). *Cykler och loopar i salongen: en studie av återkoppling i frisörklassrummet* [Cycles and loops in the salon. A qualitative study of the role of feedback in the hairdressing classroom]. (Licentiate thesis, Karlstad University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A783099&dswid=-6721

Öhman, A. (2017). *Återkoppling i interaktion: en studie av klassrumsbaserad bedömning i frisörutbildningen* [Feedback in interaction. A study of classroom assessment in hairdressing education]. (Doctoral thesis, Karlstad University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A1136025&dswid=-6721

Olofsson, J., & Panican, A. (2017). An education policy paradigm that fails upper secondary school pupils. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 69*(4), 495-516. doi: <u>10.1080/13636820.2017.1344869</u>

Onsando, G., & Billett, S. (2009). African students from refugee backgrounds in Australian TAFE institutes: A case for transformative learning goals and processes. *International Journal of Training Research, 7*(2), 80-94. doi: 10.5172/ijtr.7.2.80

Österlind, E. (2008). *Gymnasieskolans projektarbete ur elevperspektiv* [Upper secondary school project work from a student perspective]. Stockholm: Stockholms universitets förlag. Retrieved from http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:284877/FULLTEXT01.pdf

Pang, P. (2015). Learning to work during work placement: Negotiating access to work and participation through 'Origination' and establishing a 'Legitimate Presence'. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 67*(4), 543-557. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2015.1076501

Persson Thunqvist, D., & Hallqvist, A. (2015). *The current state of the challenges for VET in Sweden*. Roskilde: Department of Psychology & Educational Studies Roskilde University.

Peterson, E. R., & Irving, S. E. (2008). Secondary school students' conceptions of assessment and feedback. *Learning and Instruction 18*(3), 238-250. doi: 10.1016/j.learninstruc.2007.05.001

Phillips, T. (1995). Constructing vocational identities. *The Vocational Aspect of Education, 47*(1), 5-19. doi: 10.1080/0305787950470101

Porfeli, E. J., Lee, B., & Vondracek, F. W. (2013). Identity development and careers in adolescents and emerging adults: Content, process, and structure (4th ed.). In W. B. Walsh, M. L. Savickas, & P. J. Hartung (Eds.), *Handbook of vocational psychology: Theory, research, and practice* (pp. 133-153). New York: Routledge.

Reegård, K. (2015). Sales assistants in the making: Learning through responsibility. *Vocations and Learning, 8*(2), 117-133.doi: 10.1007/s12186-015-9129-0

Rey, F. G. (2011). A re-examination of defining moments in Vygotsky's work and their implications for his continuing legacy. *Mind, Culture, and Activity, 18*(3), 257-275. doi: 10.1080/10749030903338517

Rey, F. G., & Mitjáns Martínez, A. (2016). "Perezhivanie": Advancing on its implications for the Cultural-historical approach. *International Research in Early Childhood Education, 7*(1), p. 142-160.

Rømer, T. A. (2017). Kritik af John Hatties teori om visible learning - A critique of visible learning. *Nordic Studies in Education, 37*, 19-35. doi: 10.18261/issn.1891-5949-2017-01-03

Roos, B., & Hamilton, D. (2005). Formative assessment: A cybernetic viewpoint. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice, 12*(1), 7-20. doi: 10.1080/0969594042000333887

Rosvall, P.-Å., Hjelmér, C., & Lappalainen, S. (2017). Staying in the comfort zones – Low expectations in vocational education and training mathematics teaching in Sweden and Finland. *European Educational Research Journal, 16*(4), 425-439. doi: 10.1177/1474904116669154

Roth, W.-M. (2011). Foreword: Realizing Vygotsky's program. In P. Smagorinsky, *Vygotsky and literacy research: A methodological framework* (pp. xi-xxxi). Rotterdam: Sense.

Roth, W.-M., & Jornet, A. (2017). *Understanding educational psychology: A late Vygotskian, Spinozist approach*. Cham: Springer.

Ruiz-Primo, M. A. (2011). Informal formative assessment: The role of instructional dialogues in assessing students' learning. *Studies in Educational Evaluation, 37*(1), 15-24. doi: 10.1016/j.stueduc.2011.04.003

Sadler, D. (1989). Formative assessment and the design of instructional systems. *Instructional Science, 18*(2), 119-144. doi: 10.1007/BF00117714

Saldaña, J. (2014). Coding and analysis strategies. In P. Leavy (Ed.), *The Oxford handbook of qualitative research* (Chapter 28). New York: Oxford University Press. Retrieved from http://www.oxfordhandbooks.com.ezproxy.ub.gu.se/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199811755.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780199811755-e-001?rskey=I2IhKf&result=1

Säljö, R., & Veraksa, N. (2018). Vygotsky in two perspectives: Russian and Western. In N. Veraksa, & S. Sheridan (Eds.), *Vygotsky's theory in early childhood education and research: Russian and Western values* (pp. 9-21). London: Routledge.

Sandal, A., Smith, K., & Wangensteen, R. (2014). Vocational students experiences with assessment in workplace learning. *Vocations and Learning, 7*(2), 241-261. doi: 10.1007/s12186-014-9114-z

Sappa, V., & Aprea, C. (2014). Conceptions of connectivity: How Swiss teachers, trainers and apprentices perceive vocational learning and teaching across different learning sites. *Vocations and Learning, 7*(3), 263-287. doi: 10.1007/s12186-014-9115-y

Schubert, W. H. (2008). Curriculum inquiry. In M. F. Connelly, & J. Phillion (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of curriculum and instruction* (pp. 399-419). Los Angeles: SAGE.

Schwab, J. J. (1978). *Science, curriculum, and liberal education: Selected essays.* Chicago: Univ. of Chicago P.

Sfard, A. (1998). On two metaphors for learning and the dangers of choosing just one. *Educational Researcher, 27*(2), 4-13. doi: 10.3102/0013189X027002004

Shipway, R., & Jones, I. (2007). Running away from home: Understanding visitor experiences and behaviour at sport tourism events. *International Journal of Tourism Research, 9*(5), 373-383. doi: 10.1002/jtr.641

Shuichi, N. (2016). The possibilities and limitations of assessment for learning: Exploring the theory of formative assessment and the notion of "closing the learning gap". *Educational Studies in Japan, 10*, 79-91. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.7571/esjkyoiku.10.79

Shute, V. J. (2008). Focus on formative feedback. *Review of Educational Research, 78*(1), 153-189. doi: 10.3102/0034654307313795

Skolverket. (1994). *Läroplan för de frivilliga skolformerna. Lpf 94* [1994 curriculum for non-compulsory schools. Lpf 94.]. Retrieved from https://gupea.ub.gu.se/handle/2077/30768

Skolverket. (1998). *Fem gymnasieprogram under omvandlingstryck: utvärdering av gymnasieprogram 1997: huvudrapport* [Five vocational programmes under pressure for change: Evaluation of vocational programmes at upper secondary level 1997: Main report] (Report No. 149). Stockholm: Statens skolverk.

Skolverket. (2011a). *Curriculum for the upper secondary school.* Stockholm: Statens skolverk. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=2975

Skolverket. (2011b). *Bedömning i yrkesämnen - dilemman och möjligheter* [Assessment of vocational subjects - dilemmas and opportunities]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=2572

Skolverket. (2012a). *Bedömning* och *betygssättning i gymnasieskolan, Skolverkets allmänna råd* [Assessment and grading in the upper secondary school, general advice issued by the Swedish National Agency for Education]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3187

Skolverket. (2012b). *Upper secondary school 2011-An overall commentary, diploma goals and programme structures*. Retrieved

from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=2801

Skolverket. (2014). Yrkeslärare per program [Vocational teachers in each programme]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3319

Skolverket. (2016). *Det arbetsplatsförlagda lärandet på gymnasieskolans yrkesprogram* [Workplace-based learning in the upper secondary school]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3643

Skolverket. (2017a). *What does youth do after graduation 2015?* [Vad gör ungdomar ett år efter gymnasieskolan 2015]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3867

Skolverket. (2017b). *Redovisning av uppdrag om uppföljning av gymnasieskolan 2017* [Follow-up of the upper secondary school 2017]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3766

Skolverket. (2018a). *PM - Elever i gymnasieskolan läsåret 2017/18* [Memorandum - Pupils in the upper secondary school year 2017/18]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3922

Skolverket. (2018b). *Uppföljning av gymnasieskolan 2018* [Follow-up of the upper secondary school 2018]. Retrieved from https://www.skolverket.se/publikationer?id=3951

Smagorinsky, P. (2011). *Vygotsky and literacy research: A methodological framework.* Rotterdam: Sense.

Snedden, D., & Dewey, J. (1915/1977/). Two communications. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *7*(1), 33-39.

SOU 2017:51. *Utbildning, undervisning och ledning – reformvård till stöd för en bättre skola* [Education, instruction and leadership - Reform care to support a better school]. Regeringskansliet. Retrieved from https://www.regeringen.se/49c8c8/contentassets/4f7790665c304320a4dc34ca858a8d1e/utbildning-undervisning-och-ledning--reformvard-till-stod-for-en-battre-skola-sou-201751.pdf

Statistiska Centralbyrån. (2017). Retrieved from http://www.scb.se/contentassets/70f74e9ce1284c4d83f6ac6b1176b693/scb-sis-trycksak.pdf

Steinnes, G. S. (2014). Common sense or professional qualifications? Division of labour in kindergartens. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal, 22*(4), 478-495. doi: 10.1080/1350293X.2014.947831

Stetsenko, A. (2016). *The transformative mind: Expanding Vygotsky's approach to development and education.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sundberg, D. (2018). Curriculum standardization: What does it mean for classroom teaching and assessment practices? In N. Wahlström, & D. Sundberg (Eds.), *Transnational curriculum standards and classroom practices: The new meaning of teaching* (pp. 116-132). London: Taylor & Francis.

Tanggaard, L. (2006). Situating gendered learning in the workplace. *Journal of Workplace Learning, 18*(4), 220-234. doi: 10.1108/13665620610665827

Tanggaard, L. (2007). Learning at trade vocational school and learning at work: Boundary crossing in apprentices' everyday life. *Journal of Education and Work*, *20*(5), 453-466. doi: 10.1080/13639080701814414

Tanggaard, L., & Elmholdt, C. (2008). Assessment in practice: An inspiration from apprenticeship. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research 52*(1), 97-116. doi: 10.1080/00313830701786719

Taras, M. (2013). Feedback on feedback: Uncrossing wires across sectors. In S. Merry, M. Price, D. Carless, & M. Taras (Eds.), *Reconceptualising feedback in higher education: Developing dialogue with students* (pp. 30-40). Abingdon: Routledge.

Thomsson, H. (2010). *Reflexiva intervjuer* [Reflexive interviews] (2nd rev. ed.). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Thornton Moore, D. (2004). Curriculum at work: An educational perspective on the workplace as a learning environment. *Journal of Workplace Learning, 16*(6), 325-340. doi: 10.1108/13665620410550303

Topping, K. J. (2009). Peer assessment. *Theory into Practice*, *48*, (1), 20-27. doi: 10.1080/00405840802577569

Topping, K. J. (2010). Peers as a source of formative assessment. In H. L. Andrade, & G. J. Cizek (Eds.), *Handbook of formative assessment* (pp. 61-74). New York: Routledge.

Torrance, H. (2007) Assessment as learning? How the use of explicit learning objectives, assessment criteria and feedback in post‐secondary education and training can come to dominate learning. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice, 14*(3), 281-294. doi: 10.1080/09695940701591867

Tynjälä, P. (2013). Toward a 3-P model of workplace learning: A literature review. *Vocations and Learning, 6*(1), 11–36. doi: 10.1007/s12186-012-9091-z

Ulfsdotter Eriksson, Y., & Flisbäck, M. (2011). *Yrkesstatus: erfarenhet, identitet och erkännande* [Occupational status: Experience, identity and recognition] (1st ed.). Malmö: Liber.

Valsiner, J., & van der Veer, R. (1999). The encoding of distance: The concept of the zone of proximal development and its interpretations. In P. Lloyd, & C. Fernyhough (Eds.), *Lev Vygotsky: Critical assessments. Vol 3, The zone of proximal development. (*pp. 3-56). London: Routledge.

Valsiner, J., & van der Veer, R. (2000). *The social mind: Construction of the idea.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Vasil′juk, F. (1991). *The psychology of experiencing: The resolution of life's critical situations.* New York: Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Vaughan, K. (2016). Vocational thresholds: Developing expertise without certainty in general practice medicine. *Journal of Primary Health Care, 8*(2), 99-105. doi: 10.1071/HC15027

Vaughan, K. (2017). The role of apprenticeship in the cultivation of soft skills and dispositions. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 69*(4), 540-557. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2017.1326516

van der Veer, R., & Yasnitsky, A. (2011). Vygotsky in English: What still needs to be done. *Integrative Psychological and Behavioral Science, 45*(4), 475-493. doi: 10.1007/s12124-011-9172-9

Veresov, N. (2016). Perezhivanie as a phenomenon and a concept: Questions on clarification and methodological meditations. *Kul'turno-istoricheskaya psikhologiya [*Cultural-historical psychology*]*, *12*(3), 129-148. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.17759/chp.2016120308

Veresov, N. (2017). The concept of perezhivanie in cultural-historical theory: Content and contexts. In M. Fleer, G. F. Rey, & N. Veresov (Eds.), *Perezhivanie, emotions and subjectivity* (pp. 47-70). Singapore: Springer.

Vestergaard Louw, A. (2012) Erhvervsfaglig læring i et elevperspektiv [Vocational learning from a student perspective]. *Dansk Pædagogisk Tidsskrift*, *1*, 41‐49.

Vestergaard Louw, A. (2013). Pedagogical practices in VET: Between direct and indirect teacher approaches. *Nordic Journal of Vocational Education and Training, 3*(1), 1-16. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.3384/njvet.2242-458X.13v3i1a5

Vestergaard Louw, A. (2013). *Indgang og adgang på erhvervsuddannelserne - analyse af tømrerelevernes muligheder og udfordringer i mødet med faget, lærerne og de pædagogiske praksisser på grundforløbet* [Entrance and access to vocational training: An analysis of carpentry students' opportunities and challenges in the encounter with the subject, the teachers and the pedagogical practices in the basic course] (Doctoral thesis, Aarhus University, Denmark).

REFERENCES

Retrieved from https://viden.sl.dk/media/5249/indgang-og-adgang-paa-erhvervsuddannelser.pdf

Vetenskapsrådet. (2017). *Good research practice.* Retrieved from https://publikationer.vr.se/en/product/good-research-practice/

Vincent, S. (2011). The emotional labour process: An essay on the economy of feelings. *Human Relations, 64*(10), 1369-1392. doi: 10.1177/0018726711415131

Vincent, C., & Braun, A. (2010). 'And hairdressers are quite seedy...': the moral worth of childcare training. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood 11*(2), 203-214. Retrieved from https://doi-org.ezproxy.ub.gu.se/10.2304/ciec.2010.11.2.203

Vincent, C., & Braun, A. (2011). 'I think a lot of it is common sense. …' Early years students, professionalism and the development of a 'vocational habitus'. *Journal of Education Policy, 26*(6), 771-785.doi: 10.1080/02680939.2010.551143

Virolainen, M., & Persson Thunqvist, D. (2017). Varieties of universalism: Post-1990s developments in the initial school-based model of VET in Finland and Sweden and implications for transitions to the world of work and higher education. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 69*(1), 47-63. doi: 10.1080/13636820.2016.1238836

Virtanen, A., Tynjälä, P., & Stenström, M.-L. (2008). Field-specific educational practices as a source for students' vocational identity formation. In S. Billett, C. Harteis, & A. Eteläpelto (Eds.), *Emerging Perspectives of Workplace Learning* (pp. 19-34). Rotterdam: Sense.

Vygotskij, L. S. (1926/1997). *Educational psychology.* (R. Silverman, transl.). Boca Raton, Fla.: St.Lucie.

Vygotskij, L. S. (1934). *Myshlenie i rech* [Thinking and speech]. Retrieved from https://vk.com/doc27441302_400797894?hash=7f71a268e35ce85ae5&dl=ddaecf3dcba0167848

Vygotskij, L. S. (1933/1934/2001). *Лекции по педологии* [Lectures on pedology]. Ijevsk: Isdatelskii Dom Udmurtskii Universitet. Retrieved from https://www.marxists.org/russkij/vygotsky/pedologia/lektsii-po-pedologii.pdf

Vygotskij, L. S., van der Veer, R., & Valsiner, J. (1994). *The Vygotsky reader.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Wegerif, R. (2008). Dialogic or dialectic? The significance of ontological assumptions in research on educational dialogue. *British Educational Research Journal 34*(3), 347–361. doi: 10.1080/01411920701532228

Wegener, C. (2014). A situated approach to VET students' reflection processes across boundaries. *Journal of Education and Work*, *27*(4), 454-473. doi: 10.1080/13639080.2012.758358

Wertsch, J. V. (1992). A dialogue on message structure: Rommetveit and Bakhtin. In A. H. Wold (Ed.), *The dialogical alternative* (pp. 65-76). Oslo: Scandinavian University Press.

Wiliam, D., & Thompson, M. (2008). Integrating assessment with learning: What will it take to make it work? In C. A. Dwyer (Ed.), *The future of assessment: Shaping teaching and learning* (pp. 53-82). New York: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Wyszynska Johansson, M. (2015). *Gymnasieungdomars erfarenheter av hur yrkeslärande bedöms.* [Students' experiences and perception of the assessment of vocational knowing]. (Licentiate thesis, University of Gothenburg, Sweden). Retrieved from https://gupea.ub.gu.se/handle/2077/37982

Wyszynska Johansson, M. (2016). Upper secondary vocational education as an educational path into the security industry – A Swedish case. *Security Dimensions. International and National Studies*, *19*, 55-74. Retrieved from https://gup.ub.gu.se/publication/249713

Yasnitsky, A. (2010). Guest editor's introduction:"Archival revolution" in Vygotskian studies? Uncovering Vygotsky's archives. *Journal of Russian & East European Psychology*, *48*(1), 3-13. doi: 10.2753/RPO1061-0405480100

Yasnitsky, A. (2012). Revisionist revolution in Vygotskian science: Toward cultural-historical Gestalt psychology: Guest Editor's Introduction*Journal of Russian & East European Psychology*, *50*(4), 3-15. doi: 10.2753/RPO1061-0405500400

Yin, R. K. (2015). *Qualitative research from start to finish* (2nd ed.). New York: Guilford Press.

Zavershneva, E. Iu. (2010). The Vygotsky family archive: New findings: Notebooks, notes, and scientific journals of L. S. Vygotsky (1912-1934) *Journal of Russian & East European Psychology*, *48*(1), 34-60. doi: 10.2753/RPO1061-0405480102

Ziehe, T. (1986). *Ny ungdom: om ovanliga läroprocesser* [New youth: On unusual learning processes]. Stockholm: Norstedt

Ziehe, T. (1999). Engagement and abstention: Youth and the school in the second modernization. *European Education, 31*(4), 6-21. doi: 10.2753/EUE1056-493431046

Appendices

Appendix A

List of handbooks in chronological order

The following handbooks were consulted for a broad overview of the three areas of interest, i.e., vocational identity formation, the experienced curriculum and feedback.

1. Blank, W.E. (1982). *Handbook for developing competency-based training programs.*
2. Funnell, R. (ed.) (1996). *A handbook for research in adult and vocational education.*
3. Rauner, F., Maclean, R. & Boreham, N.C. (eds.) (2008a). *Handbook of technical and vocational education and training research.*
4. Connelly, F.M., He, M.F. & Phillion, J. (eds.) (2008b). *The SAGE handbook of curriculum and instruction*.
5. Maclean, R. & Wilson, D. (2009). *International handbook of education for the changing world of work: Bridging academic and vocational learning.*
6. Andrade, H.L. & Cizek, G.J. (eds.) (2010a). *Handbook of formative assessment*.
7. Peterson, P.L., Baker, E.L. & McGaw, B. (eds.) (2010b). *International encyclopedia of education.*
8. Malloch, M., Cairns, L., Evans, K. & O'Conner, B. (eds.). (2011). The SAGE handbook of workplace learning.
9. Walsh, W.B. & Savickas, M. L. & Hartung, P. J. (eds.) (2013). *Handbook of vocational psychology: Theory, research, and practice*.
10. Wyse, D., Hayward, L. & Pandya, J.Z. (eds.) (2015). *The SAGE handbook of curriculum, pedagogy and assessment*.

Appendix B

Letter to the Security Industry and Working Environment Committee

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik

Göteborgs universitet

martina.wyszynska.johansson@gu.se

15 oktober 2015

Hej!

Jag heter Martina Wyszynska Johansson och är doktorand vid institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik på Göteborgs universitet. Mina studier är inriktade mot elevers utveckling mot examensmålen på Barn- och fritidsprogrammet. Jag har ett särskilt intresse för yrkesutgången väktare eftersom detta är en ny utbildning i programmet. Vilka kunskaper tycker eleverna att de har utvecklat under sin utbildning? Vilka kunskaper anser eleverna är mest användbara för att få arbeta inom bevakningsverksamheterna? Hur tycker de att deras kunskaper har utvecklats under utbildningen: genom läromedel, skolundervisning, instruktioner på arbetsplatsen, genom råd och återkoppling från handledare och andra? Detta är frågor som intresserar mig!

För att utforska sådana frågor är jag beroende av och mycket tacksam för er hjälp. Jag skulle behöva hjälp med att få träffa sex till sju Barn- och fritidselever i årskurs 3 som gör sin praktik inom en bevakningsverksamhet i västra Sverige, t ex i X. Jag hoppas att det är möjligt för mig att "skugga" dessa elever, vilket betyder att man följer dem under praktiken på arbetsplatsen. Rent konkret skulle det innebära att jag följer eleverna under ca 10 dagar utspritt över en period på några månader. Jag önskar även att få intervjua eleverna på arbetsplatsen och få ta del av den skriftliga information som eleverna kommer i kontakt med. Skriftlig dokumentation av detta slag hjälper mig att skaffa mig en överblick och en förståelse för den bransch Barn- och fritidselever utbildas för.

Den studie som jag ska genomföra är viktig för att den avser att ge inblick i elevers erfarenheter och deras perspektiv. Resultaten och slutsatserna förväntas bidra till en utveckling och förbättring av utbildning mot väktare och bevakningsverksamheter. Jag hoppas att jag kan få ställa några frågor till er om branschen för att få en bild av den och om det finns skriftlig information jag kan få ta del av är jag mycket tacksam för.

Vid frågor tveka inte att ringa mig på 0XX XXXXXXX.

Med vänliga hälsningar

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Appendix C

Letter to the headteacher and teachers in School A

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Göteborgs Universitet

Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik

Box 100

405 30 GÖTEBORG

Tel: 031-786 22 51

Mail: martina.wyszynska.johansson@gu.se

Till skolledningen och lärare vid Skola A

Förfrågan om deltagande vid lektioner i Barn och fritidsprogrammets yrkeskurser för väktare

Jag heter Martina Wyszynska Johansson. Min förfråga till er handlar om möjligheten att få delta vid undervisningen av yrkesämnen som riktas till yrkesutgången väktare på Barn och Fritidsprogrammet vid Skola A. Själv har jag min bakgrund som yrkeslärare på Barn och Fritidsprogrammet men sedan några år tillbaka är jag doktorand vid Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik, Göteborgs Universitet. Handledare är docent Gun-Britt Wärvik och docent Ingrid Henning Loeb.

Efter att ha skrivit en licentiatuppsats med titeln "Gymnasieungdomars erfarenheter av hur yrkeslärande bedöms" fortsätter jag mina doktorandstudier. Syftet med min studie är att undersöka hur yrkeselever formas till yrkesutövare. I denna process är bedömning av relevanta yrkeskunskaper ett redskap för att elever ska kunna lyckas. Jag vill också veta vilka yrkeskunskaper som elever värdesätter mest och varför de sätter värde på just de yrkeskunskaperna. Hur yrkeselever ser på sin process att formas till yrkesperson forskas mycket litet om. Mitt tänkta bidrag, med er hjälp, kan förhoppningsvis lyfta fram elevperspektiv på yrkesutbildning i Sverige och på så vis bidra till att utveckla yrkesutbildningar att mer svara mot yrkeselevernas behov. Därför ber jag om ert samtycke till att få närvara vid lektioner på BF under vårterminen 2016.

Undersökningens upplägg Eleverna kommer att informeras om studiens syfte och hur studiens material hanteras, både muntligt och skriftligt. Eleverna lämnar skriftligt sitt samtycke att delta och deltagandet i studien sker frivilligt. Om någon, undervisande person eller elev, vill avbryta fortsatt medverkan kan denna person göra det utan att ange en anledning. Alla elever måste aktivt uttrycka sitt samtycke till att delta och om någon elev inte vill att det han eller hon säger ska användas i studien utelämnar jag detta helt i materialet och den studie som grundas på materialet.

Min undersökning innebär att jag är närvarande i klassrummet under tiden då BF-elever årskurs 2 eller 3 genomgår sina yrkesfördjupningskurser inom yrkesutgången väktare. Jag är medveten om att dessa kurser genomförs av Bevakningsbranschens Yrkes- och Arbetsmiljönämnd eller BYA. Vid flertalet tillfällen har jag varit i kontakt med BYA:s representant X som hänvisade mig till att ta kontakt med lärare vid skola A, vilket jag gjorde.

Förutom att föra anteckningar önskar jag att göra vissa ljudupptagningar, men då i samförstånd med den som undervisar. Jag skulle också vilja få möjlighet att samtala med grupper av elever i anslutning till lektionerna.

All insamlat material kommer att avidentifieras och behandlas på ett konfidentiellt sätt, vilket betyder att allt material bearbetas, analyseras och redovisas så att ingen enskild person kan kännas igen. Under arbetet kommer allt insamlat material förvaras inlåst på institutionen. Om det är möjligt skulle jag vilja påbörja mina observationer v. 10 eller v. 11. Jag kommer inom kort att kontakta er och svarar gärna på alla frågor och funderingar om studien. Ni kan nå mig via mail eller telefon.

Med vänliga hälsningar

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Appendix D

Letter to the headteacher and teachers in School B

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Göteborgs Universitet

Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik

Box 100

405 30 GÖTEBORG

Tel: 031-786 22 51

Mail: martina.wyszynska.johansson@gu.se

Till skolledningen och lärare vid Skola B

Förfrågan om deltagande vid lektioner i Barn och fritidsprogrammets yrkeskurser för väktare

Jag heter Martina Wyszynska Johansson. Min förfråga till er handlar om möjligheten att få delta vid undervisningen av yrkesämnen som riktas till yrkesutgången väktare på Barn och Fritidsprogrammet. Själv har jag min bakgrund som yrkeslärare på Barn och Fritidsprogrammet men sedan några år tillbaka är jag doktorand vid Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik, Göteborgs Universitet. Handledare är docent Gun-Britt Wärvik och docent Ingrid Henning Loeb.

Efter att ha skrivit en licentiatuppsats med titeln "Gymnasieungdomars erfarenheter av hur yrkeslärande bedöms" fortsätter jag mina doktorandstudier. Syftet med min studie är att undersöka hur yrkeselever formas till yrkesutövare. I denna process är bedömning av relevanta yrkeskunskaper ett redskap för att elever ska kunna lyckas. Jag vill också veta vilka yrkeskunskaper som elever värdesätter mest och varför de sätter värde på just de yrkeskunskaperna. Hur yrkeselever ser på sin process att formas till yrkesperson forskas mycket litet om. Mitt tänkta bidrag, med er hjälp, kan förhoppningsvis lyfta fram elevperspektiv på yrkesutbildning i Sverige och på så vis bidra till att utveckla yrkesutbildningar att mer svara mot yrkeselevernas behov. Därför ber jag om ert samtycke till att få närvara vid lektioner på BF under vårterminen 2016.

Undersökningens upplägg Eleverna kommer att informeras om studiens syfte och hur studiens material hanteras, både muntligt och skriftligt. Eleverna lämnar skriftligt sitt samtycke att delta och deltagandet i studien sker frivilligt. Om någon, undervisande person eller elev, vill avbryta fortsatt medverkan kan denna person göra det utan att ange en anledning. Alla elever måste aktivt uttrycka sitt samtycke till att delta och om någon elev inte vill att det han eller hon säger ska användas i studien utelämnar jag detta helt i materialet och den studie som grundas på materialet.

Min undersökning innebär att jag är närvarande i klassrummet under tiden då BF-elever årskurs 2 eller 3 genomgår sina yrkesfördjupningskurser inom yrkesutgången väktare. Jag är medveten om att dessa kurser genomförs i samarbete med Bevakningsbranschens Yrkes- och Arbetsmiljönämnd (BYA), som jag har varit i kontakt med tidigare. Förutom att föra anteckningar önskar jag att göra vissa ljudupptagningar, men då i samförstånd med den som

undervisar. Jag skulle också vilja få möjlighet att samtala med grupper av elever i anslutning till lektionerna.

All insamlat material kommer att avidentifieras och behandlas på ett konfidentiellt sätt, vilket betyder att allt material bearbetas, analyseras och redovisas så att ingen enskild person kan kännas igen. Under arbetet kommer allt insamlat material förvaras inlåst på institutionen. Jag kommer inom kort att kontakta er och svarar gärna på alla frågor och funderingar om studien. Ni kan nå mig via mail eller telefon.

Med vänliga hälsningar

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Appendix E

<div style="text-align:center">Consent form</div>

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

Göteborgs Universitet

Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik

Box 100

405 30 GÖTEBORG

Tel: 031-786 22 51

Mail: martina.wyszynska.johansson@gu.se

Till eleverna på Barn och fritidsprogrammet vid X

Mitt namn är Martina Wyszynska Johansson och jag är doktorand vid Göteborgs Universitet, Institutionen för pedagogik och specialpedagogik. Min forskning handlar om hur elever på BF utvecklar sina yrkeskunskaper. Syftet med min studie är att ta reda på hur elever själva tycker att de gradvis blir bättre förberedda inför kommande yrkesliv. Vilka yrkeskunskaper värdesätter eleverna bäst och varför?

Skolledningen och lärare har gett sitt godkännande till att jag får vara med på BF-lektionerna. Nu vill jag fråga dig om ditt medgivande till att jag får närvara på dina BF-lektioner. För att uppfylla mitt syfte med studien kommer jag att närvara vid lektionerna, göra anteckningar och ibland prata med elever om det som kan ha dykt upp på lektionerna. Vissa samtal kommer att ljudinspelas och detta kommer att ske öppet.

All information kommer att behandlar konfidentiellt. Detta betyder att alla svar kommer att avanonymiseras och senare redovisas på ett sådant sätt att ingen enskild person kommer att kunna kännas igen. All information kommer endast att användas för studiens syfte. Under arbetet kommer all information förvaras inlåst på institutionen. Att du deltar är helt frivilligt. Vill du inte att det du säger under lektionen ska kunna finnas med i avhandlingen och i underlaget för avhandlingen, kryssar du bara i svarstalongen nedan. Du är helt fri att när som helst avbryta deltagande utan att behöva säga varför. Jag, undertecknad, är ansvarig för denna undersökning och mina handledare är docent Gun-Britt Wärvik och docent Ingrid Henning Loeb.

Har du några funderingar och tankar, kontakta mig på mail eller telefon.

Med vänliga hälsningar

Martina Wyszynska Johansson

031-786 2251

martina.wyszynska.johansson@gu.se

Samtyckesblankett

□ Ja, jag samtycker till att delta. Jag har fått informationen om studiens syfte, hur undersökningen kommer att gå till och hur allt material kommer att hanteras så att ingen enskild person kommer att kunna identifieras. Jag har också fått möjlighet att ställa frågor.

□ Nej, jag vill inte delta.

Namn: ………………………….

Klass: …………………………..

Skola: …………………………..